EXHIBIT 29

Durling, et al. v. Papa John's International, Inc. - Defendant's Privilege Log

Case No.: 16-CV-3592 (S.D.N.Y.)

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	2/28/2011	Legal Breakout.ppt	Jason Nelson		Attorney-Client Communication	Presentation providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or marketing compliance efforts and legal regulatory update by C. Oyler.	
2	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	11/21/2012	Ops Committee Action Items 11-13-12.xlsx	Edmond Heelan		Attorney-Client Communication	Spreadsheet containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures with respect to wage liability.	DURLING-PJI 246987 - DURLING-PJI 246987
3	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	11/21/2012	Ops Committee Action Items 11-13-12.pdf	Edmond Heelan		Attorney-Client Communication	Document containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures with respect to wage liability.	DURLING-PJI 246988 - DURLING-PJI 246988
4	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	12/16/2012	Ops Committee Action Items 11-13-12.pdf	Edmond Heelan		Attorney-Client Communication	Document containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures with respect to wage liability.	DURLING-PJI 372653 - DURLING-PJI 372653
5	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	12/17/2012	Ops Committee Action Items 12-17-12.pdf	Edmond Heelan		Attorney-Client Communication	Document containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures with respect to wage liability.	DURLING-PJI 247005 - DURLING-PJI 247005
6	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	12/17/2012	Ops Committee Action Items 12-17-12.xlsx	Edmond Heelan		Attorney-Client Communication	Spreadsheet containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures with respect to wage liability.	DURLING-PJI 247006 - DURLING-PJI 247006
7	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	1/14/2013	Ops Committee Action Items Jan 2013.xlsx	Edmond Heelan		Attorney-Client Communication	Spreadsheet containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures with respect to wage liability.	DURLING-PJI 247023 - DURLING-PJI 247023
8	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	1/14/2013	Ops Committee Action Items Jan 2013.pdf	Edmond Heelan		Attorney-Client Communication	Document containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures with respect to wage liability.	DURLING-PJI 247024 - DURLING-PJI 247024
9	Beth Horlander	Parent	12/14/2015	Re: Fw: Sample Rate Cards	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Scott Corbin; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Rodney Harrison	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding calculation of rates.	
10	Beth Horlander	Parent	12/22/2015	Fw: Sample Rate Cards	Beth Horlander	Billy Higdon; Scott Corbin; John Matter; Rodney Harrison	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding calculation of rates.	
11	Beth Horlander	Standalone	2/4/2016	Re: Privileged	Beth Horlander	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Carmine Cappucio; Caroline Oyler; Rodney Harrison	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding calculation of rates.	
12	Beth Horlander	Parent	2/6/2016	Fw: Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Rodney Harrison; Caroline Oyler; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding calculation of rates.	
13	Beth Horlander	Parent	2/17/2016	Attorney-client privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Beth horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Rodney Harrison; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding calculation of rates.	
14	Beth Horlander	Standalone	2/24/2016	Fw: Attorney-client privileged	Beth Horlander	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Carmine Cappucio; Caroline Oyler; Rodney Harrison	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding calculation of rates.	
15	Beth Horlander	Standalone	2/24/2016	Re: Attorney-client privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Carmine Cappucio; Caroline Oyler; Rodney Harrison	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding calculation of rates.	
16	Beth Horlander	Standalone	3/16/2016	Re: Fwd: Next steps	John Matter	Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding calculation of rates.	
17	Beth Horlander	Standalone	3/16/2016	Re: Fw: Drivers Report	John Matter	Beth Horlander; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Chastity Hartwell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding hiring policies.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 3 of 141

Daintee #	Country diagram	Danie at (Child	D-4-	File News /Cubicat	A. Abb / F	Desiriente	Debelone Desir	Description.	Date Barrel (Date and Date and
Priv Log #	Custodian Beth Horlander	Parent/Child	Date 3/16/2016	File Name/Subject Mileage Reimbursement	Author/From Beth Horlander	Recipients Billy Higdon	Privilege Basis Attorney-Client Communication: Work	Description Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
18	Betti Horiandei	raient	3/10/2010	Rate Update Project - Workback timeline	betii rioriandei	Billy Higuon	Product Product	financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding calculation of rates.	
	Beth Horlander	Standalone	3/17/2016	Re: Fwd: Next steps	Beth Horlander	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
19						Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio		financial policies and procedures, regarding calculation of rates.	
20	Beth Horlander	Parent	3/18/2016	Fw: Updated rates	John Matter	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding calculation of rates.	
21	Beth Horlander	Standalone	3/18/2016	Re: Updated rates	Carmine Cappuccio	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding calculation of rates.	
22	Beth Horlander	Parent	3/23/2016	FW: Updated rates	Amanda Pettengil	Amanda Pettengil; Beth Horlander; Carmine Cappuccio; Billy Higdon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding calculation of rates.	
23	Beth Horlander	Standalone	3/23/2016	Re: FW: Updated rates	Beth Horlander	Amanda Pettengil; Beth Horlander; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding calculation of rates.	
24	Beth Horlander	Parent	3/23/2016	RE: FW: Updated rates	Amanda Pettengil	Amanda Pettengil; Beth Horlander; Carmine Cappuccio; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding calculation of rates.	
25	Beth Horlander	Standalone	3/23/2016	Re: Fw: Updated rates	John Matter	Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding calculation of rates.	
26	Beth Horlander	Standalone	3/31/2016	Re: Fw: FOCUS-Driver Checkout-MQ Miles	Claude Phenix	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Bily Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Claude Phenix; David Bratcher; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; Johanna South; Shawn Mahyer; Dustin Courts	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding calculation of rates.	
27	Beth Horlander	Standalone	3/31/2016	Re: FOCUS-Driver Checkout-MQ Miles	Billy Higdon	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Bily Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Claude Phenix; David Bratcher; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; Johanna South; Shawn Mahyer; Dustin Couts	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding tax implications of POS upgrade.	
28	Beth Horlander	Standalone	3/31/2016	Re: Fw: FOCUS-Driver Checkout-MQ Miles	Claude Phenix	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Bily Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Claude Phenix; David Bratcher; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; Johanna South; Shawn Mahyer; Dustin Couts	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding payroll.	
29	Beth Horlander	Standalone	4/1/2016	Re: Question	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Amber McNew; Chris O'Cull	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculations.	DURLING-PJI 350902 - DURLING-PJI 350903
30	Beth Horlander	Standalone	4/2/2016	Re: Question	Amber McNew	Beth Horlander; Amber Mcnew; Chris O'Cull	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculations.	DURLING-PJI 350904 - DURLING-PJI 350906
31	Beth Horlander	Standalone	4/2/2016	Re: Question	Beth Horlander	Amber McNew; Beth Horlander; Chris O'Cull	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculations.	DURLING-PJI 350907 - DURLING-PJI 350909
32	Beth Horlander	Parent	4/20/2016	Driver Checkout - MQ Miles Overview	David Bratcher	Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Claude Phenix; Dustin Couts; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; Johanna South; John Matter; Paul Schork; Shawn Mayher; Eddy Walker; Geoff Ruscoe; Jason Smith; Vladimir Brikker	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 4 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
33	Beth Horlander	Parent	5/9/2016	Mileage Reimbursement for P6-2016	Scott Corbin	Rob Pennington; Johanna South; Beth Horlander	Attorney Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
34	Beth Horlander	Parent	5/9/2016	E-Message to Stores Regarding P6-2016 Mileage Reimbursement Rates	Scott Corbin	Rusty Buehner; Beth Horlander	Attorney Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
35	Beth Horlander	Parent	5/10/2016	Re: E-Message to Stores Regarding P6-2016 Mileage Reimbursement Rates	Rusty Buehner	Scott Corbin; Beth Horlander	Attorney Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding calculation of rates.	
36	Beth Horlander	Parent	5/10/2016	Re: E-Message to Stores Regarding P6-2016 Mileage Reimbursement Rates	Rusty Buehner	Scott Corbin; Beth Horlander; Rusty Buehner	Attorney Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
37	Beth Horlander	Parent	6/3/2016	Corporate Store List for Mileage	Beth Horlander	John Matter; Billy Higdon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding calculation of rates.	
38	Beth Horlander	Standalone	6/7/2016	Fwd: Store Location Template	Beth Horlander	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio; Rebecca Meyrick; Shannon Burke	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculations.	
39	Beth Horlander	Standalone	6/7/2016	Re: Fwd: Store Location Template	David Orberson	Caroline Oyler; Billy Higdon; John Matter; Beth Horlander; David Oberson; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Rebecca Meyrick	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding insurance coverage.	
40	Beth Horlander	Standalone	6/7/2016	Re: Fwd: Store Location Template	Beth Horlander	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Rebecca Meyrick	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculations.	
41	Beth Horlander	Parent	7/5/2016	FW: Store Location Template	John Matter	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Rebecca Meyrick	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding calculation of rates.	
42	Beth Horlander	Parent	7/5/2016	Fw: Updated rates	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; Shannon Burke; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Amanda Pettengill; Carmine Cappuccio; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
43	Beth Horlander	Parent	7/5/2016	Fw: Updated rates	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; Shannon Burke; Billy Higdon; John Matter; Amanda Pettengill; Carmine Cappuccio; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding calculation of rates, regarding legal risks associated with food born illness, various statutes and regulatory trends.	
44	Billy Higdon	Parent	6/29/2015	2:30-3:30 today - ERM Meeting - Conf A	Clark Spader	Billy Higdon	Attorney-Client Communication; Privileged by Attachment	Email reflecting legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments, regarding legal risks associated with food born illness, various statutes and regulatory trends.	
45	Billy Higdon	Standalone	7/21/2015	Re: Mileage Reimbursement Rates as of P6 '15 YTD	Caroline Oyler	Billy Higdon; Bill Cox; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
46	Billy Higdon	Standalone	8/4/2015	Re: Update to Runzheimer Mileage Data for 2016	Caroline Oyler	Bill Cox; Billy Higdon; John Matter; Scott Corbin	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures with respect to outside counsel advice regarding rate calculation.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 5 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
	Billy Higdon	Standalone	8/31/2015	Re: Restaurant July Insurance Review	Craig Jones	MaryBeth Bauer Amber McNew; Billy Higdon; David Orberson; Dustin Couts; Edmond Heelan; Jason Hudson; Keeta	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding standards of conduct.	DURLING-PJI 351467 - DURLING-PJI 351468
47						Fox; Sammy Davis		conduct.	
48	Billy Higdon	Parent	10/27/2015	Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	Billy Higdon; Susan Kinder; Cynthia McClellen; Bill Green; Rick Mohler; Steve Saunders	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
49	Billy Higdon	Parent	10/29/2015	Fw: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Jason Moore; Caroline Oyler; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Daniel Collinsworth	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
50	Billy Higdon	Standalone	10/29/2015	Re: Fw: Monthly mileage rate updates	John Matter	Susan Kinder; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Cynthia McClellan; John Matter; Rob Pennington; Bobbi Stewart; Eddy Walker; Johanna South	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculations, regarding rate calculation.	
51	Billy Higdon	Standalone	10/29/2015	Re: Monthly mileage rate updates	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Susan Kinder; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Cynthia McClellen; Rob Pennington; Bobbie Stewart; Eddy Walker; Johanna South	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
52	Billy Higdon	Parent	11/2/2015	Fw: Attorney-Client Privileged	Billy Higdon	Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Daniel Collinsworth	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding issues related to demand letter.	
53	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/6/2015	Re: Mileage Reimbursement for Store #4150	John Matter	Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
54	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/6/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Caroline Oyler	Jason Moore; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding issues related to demand letter.	
55	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/6/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	Jason Moore; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding issues related to demand letter.	
56	Billy Higdon	Parent	11/7/2015	Store Data _ Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
57	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/9/2015	Re: Fw: Store Data _ Privileged	Billy Higdon	Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding human resources.	
58	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/9/2015	Re: Store Data _ Privileged	John Matter	Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
59	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/10/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Daniel Collinsworth	Daniel Collinsworth; John Matter; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding issues related to resolving demand letter.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 6 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
60	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/10/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Daniel Collinsworth; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Paul Schork; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding issues related to resolving demand letter.	
61	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/10/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Daniel Collinsworth; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Paul Schork; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding issues related to resolving demand letter.	
62	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/10/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Jason Moore	John Matter; Daniel Collinsworth; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Paul Schork; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding issues related to resolving demand letter.	
63	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/10/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Paul Schork	John Matter; Daniel Collinsworth; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Paul Schork; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding issues related to resolving demand letter.	
64	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/10/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Jason Moore	John Matter; Daniel Collinsworth; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Paul Schork; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding issues related to resolving demand letter	
65	Billy Higdon	Parent	11/11/2015	Fw: Attorney-Client Privileged	Jason Moore	Jason Moore; Tina Faircloth; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Paul Schork	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding issues related to resolving demand letter.	
66	Billy Higdon	Parent	11/11/2015	Re: Fw: Attorney-Client Privileged	Tina Faircloth	Tina Faircloth; Jason Moore; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding issues related to resolving demand letter.	
67	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/12/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Daniel Collinsworth	John Matter; Daniel Collinsworth; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding issues related to resolving demand letter.	
68	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/12/2015	Re: Store Data _ Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Scott Corbin	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding collecting store data.	
69	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/12/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Paul Schork	Paul Schork; Jason Moore; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding issues related to resolving demand letter.	
70	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/12/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Jason Moore	Paul Schork; Jason Moore; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding issues related to resolving demand letter.	
71	Billy Higdon	Standalone	11/20/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	Jason Moore; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding issues related to resolving demand letter.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 7 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
72	Billy Higdon	Parent	1/14/2016	ERM Team - Quarterly Meeting scheduled for Tuesday; January 19	Debbie Tate	Debbie Tate; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Joe Smith; Dustin Couts; Tim Newton; Billy Higdon; Randy Lawrence; Paul Johnson; Mary Miller; David Orberson; Clara Passafiume; Clark Spader; Jamie Youngblood	Attorney Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding legal trends and compliance issues, with attachments.	
73	Billy Higdon	Parent	1/19/2016		Billy Higdon	Billy Higdon	Attorney Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
74	Billy Higdon	Parent	1/20/2016	Re: Fw: Sample Rate Cards	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Scott Corbin; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Rodney Harrison; Carmine Cappuccio; Craig Powell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
75	Billy Higdon	Parent	2/3/2016	Fw: FAC Agenda	Keeta Fox		Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding cyber risk and legal compliance, with attachments.	
76	Billy Higdon	Parent	2/3/2016	Fw: Privileged	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio; Rodney Harrison	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
77	Billy Higdon	Parent	2/8/2016	Re: Fw: Privileged	Beth Horlander	Billy Higdon; Rodney Harrison; Beth Horlander; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
78	Billy Higdon	Parent	2/8/2016	Re: Fw: Privileged	Beth Horlander	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Rodney Harrison; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, rate calculation.	
79	Billy Higdon	Parent	2/8/2016	Re: Fw: Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Rodney Harrison; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
80	Billy Higdon	Parent	2/12/2016	Re: Fw: Privileged	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Rodney Harrison; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
81	Billy Higdon	Standalone	2/16/2016	Re: Declaration : IDS v Papa John's	John Matter	Steve Coke; Billy Higdon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding draft declaration.	
82	Billy Higdon	Parent	2/17/2016	Re: Attorney-client privileged	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Rodney Harrison; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
83	Billy Higdon	Standalone	2/17/2016	Re: Attorney-client privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Rodney Harrison; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
84	Billy Higdon	Parent	2/18/2016	Re: Attorney-client privileged	John Matter	Beth Horlander: John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Billy Higdon; Rodney Harrison; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
85	Billy Higdon	Parent	2/19/2016	Re: Attorney-client privileged	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Rodney Harrison; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
86	Billy Higdon	Standalone	2/20/2016	Re: FOCUS Enhancement Requests	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Billy Higdon; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Bobbi Stewart: Jessica Akin; Susan Kinder	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
87	Billy Higdon	Parent	2/24/2016	Re: Fwd: Privileged	Beth Horlander	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Rodney Harrison; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 8 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
88	Billy Higdon	Parent	2/29/2016	Re: Fwd: Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Rodney Harrison; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	Dates number (neutrical Documents)
89	Billy Higdon	Standalone	3/16/2016	Re: Next steps	John Matter	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
90	Billy Higdon	Parent	3/16/2016	Mileage Reimbursement Rate Update Project - Workback timeline	Beth Horlander	Billy Higdon	Attorney Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
91	Billy Higdon	Standalone	3/16/2016	Re: Fwd: Next steps	John Matter	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon: Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
92	Billy Higdon	Parent	3/18/2016	Fw: Updated rates	John Matter	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
93	Billy Higdon	Standalone	3/18/2016	Re: Fw: Updated rates	Beth Horlander	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon: Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
94	Billy Higdon	Standalone	3/18/2016	Re: Updated rates	Carmine Cappuccio	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon: Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
95	Billy Higdon	Parent	3/21/2016	Fw: Drivers Report	John Matter	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Chastity Hartwell; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
96	Billy Higdon	Standalone	3/23/2016	Fw: BREAKING: High Court OKs Averaging Classwide Injury In Tyson Don-Doff Row	Lance Tucker	Lance Tucker; Keeta Fox; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; John Matter; Food & Beverage Law360	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding legal updates and industry lawsuits.	
97	Billy Higdon	Standalone	3/31/2016	Re: Fw: FOCUS-Driver Checkout-MQ Miles	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Claude Phenix; Caroline Oyler; David Bratcher; Dustin Couts; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; Johanna South; Shawn Mayher	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding POS upgrade.	
98	Billy Higdon	Standalone	3/31/2016	Re: FOCUS-Driver Checkout-MQ Miles	John Matter	David Bratcher John Matter Dustin Couts; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; Shawn Mayher; Johanna South	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
99	Billy Higdon	Standalone	3/31/2016	Re: Fw: FOCUS-Driver Checkout-MQ Miles	John Matter	John Matter; Claude Phenix; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; David Bratcher; Dustin Couts; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; Johanna South; Shawn Mayher	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
100	Billy Higdon	Standalone	4/1/2016	Re: Question	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; Amber McNew; Billy Higdon; Chris O'Cull	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	DURLING-PJI 351768 - DURLING-PJI 351770
101	Billy Higdon	Parent	4/12/2016	ERM top risks and heat map	Debbie Tate	Debbie Tate; Robert Smith; Joe Smith; Dustin Couts; Billy Higdon; Randy Lawrence; Tim Newton; Paul Johnson; Mary Miller; David Orberson; Clara Passafiume Clark Spader; Jamie Youngblood; Peter Collins; Caroline Oyler	Attorney Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding legal updates and legal risks associated with regulatory issues.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 9 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
102	Billy Higdon	Parent	4/20/2016	Driver Checkout - MQ Miles Overview	David Bratcher	Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Claude Phenix; Dustin Couts; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; Johanna South; John Matter; Jay Schork; Shawn Mayher; Eddy Walker; Geoff Ruscoe; Jason Smith; Vladimir Brikker	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	The state of the s
103	Billy Higdon	Parent	5/10/2016	Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation, regarding draft agreement.	
104	Billy Higdon	Standalone	5/13/2016	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Carmine Cappuccio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding draft agreement.	
105	Billy Higdon	Standalone	5/18/2016	Re: New overtime regs announced	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Billy Higdon; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Lance Tucker; Robert Smith; Eric Todd	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding interpretation of regulations.	
106	Billy Higdon	Parent	6/3/2016	Corporate Store List for Mileage	Beth Horlander	John Matter; Billy Higdon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
107	Billy Higdon	Standalone	6/15/2016	Re: Attorney-client privilege	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Rebecca Meyrick	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
108	Billy Higdon	Standalone	6/15/2016	Re: Update on mileage program	Caroline Oyler	Billy Higdon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding contract with MOTUS.	
109	Billy Higdon	Parent	6/21/2016	Attorney-client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Rebecca Meyrick	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
110	Billy Higdon	Parent	6/21/2016	Fw: Attorney-client Privileged	Billy Higdon	Billy Higdon; Scott Corbin; John Matter; Beth Horlander; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Rebecca Meyrick	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
111	Billy Higdon	Parent	6/29/2016	Confidential/Attorney- Client Privileged/Prepared and Sent at the Direction of Counsel	Debbie Tate	Debbie Tate; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Joe Smith; Dustin Couts; Billy Higdon; Randy Lawrence; Tim Newton; Peter Collins; Paul Johnson; Mary Miller; David Orberson; Clara Passafiume; Clark Spader; Jamie Youngblood	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding legal risks of food industries and legal updates of various statutes.	
112	Billy Higdon	Parent	7/5/2016	FW: Store Location Template	John Matter	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Rebecca Meyrick	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
113	Billy Higdon	Parent	7/5/2016	Fw: Updated rates	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; Shannon Burke; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Amanda Pettengill; Carmine Cappuccio; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
114	Billy Higdon	Parent	7/5/2016	Fw: Updated rates	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; Shannon Burke; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Amanda Pettengill; Carmine Cappuccio; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 10 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
115	Billy Higdon	Standalone	7/5/2016	Re: Updated rates	Shannon Burke	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Amanda Pettengill	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
116	Billy Higdon	Standalone	7/5/2016	Re: Updated rates	Shannon Burke	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Amanda Pettengill	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures,	
117	Billy Higdon	Parent	7/12/2016	RE: Updated rates	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; Shannon Burke; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Amanda Pettengill; Carmine Cappuccio; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
118	Billy Higdon	Standalone	7/13/2016	Re: Updated rates	Shannon Burke	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Amanda Pettengill; Rebecca Meyrick	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
119	Billy Higdon	Standalone	7/21/2016	RE: Updated rates	Beth Horlander	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Rebecca Meyrick: Amanda Pettengill	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
120	Billy Higdon	Standalone	7/26/2016	RE: Updated rates	John Matter	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Amanda Pettengill; Rebecca Meyrick	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
121	Billy Higdon	Standalone	7/28/2016	RE: Updated rates	John Matter	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Amanda Pettengill; Rebecca Meyrick	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
122	Billy Higdon	Standalone	7/29/2016	RE: Updated rates	Beth Horlander	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Amanda Pettengill; Rebecca Meyrick	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
123	Billy Higdon	Standalone	7/29/2016	RE: Updated rates	Rebecca Meyrick	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Shannon Burke; Carmine Cappuccio; Amanda Pettengill; Rebecca Meyrick	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
124	Billy Higdon	Parent	8/18/2016	FW: Drivers Report	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Chasity Hartwell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments, regarding rate calculation.	
125	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/2/2016	RE: Attorney-client privileged	Kim Girdler	Kim Girdler; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
126	Billy Higdon	Standalone	9/2/2016	RE: Attorney-client privileged	Beth Horlander	Kim Girdler; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 11 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
127	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/14/2016	Fwd: Updated Motus Rates Report	John Matter	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
128	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/16/2016	RE: Updated Motus Rates Report	Beth Horlander	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
129	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/16/2016	RE: Updated Motus Rates Report	John Matter	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke; Jason Hudson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
130	Billy Higdon	Parent	9/16/2016	Fwd: Updated Motus Rates Report	Beth Horlander	Beth Horlander; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Jason Hudson; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
131	Billy Higdon	Standalone	9/19/2016	Re: Updated Motus Rates Report	Shannon Burke	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke; Jason Hudson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
132	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/19/2016	RE: Intro slides for mileage discussion	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Billy Higdon; Jason Hudson	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding draft of presentation.	
133	Billy Higdon	Parent	9/19/2016	RE: Intro slides for mileage discussion	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Billy Higdon	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding draft of presentation.	
134	Billy Higdon	Parent	9/19/2016	Financial Slide	Billy Higdon	John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, with respect to draft presentation.	
135	Billy Higdon	Standalone	9/19/2016	RE: Updated Motus Rates Report	John Matter	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke; Jason Hudson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
136	Billy Higdon	Standalone	9/20/2016	Re: Updated Motus Rates Report	Shannon Burke	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke; Jason Hudson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
137	Billy Higdon	Standalone	9/20/2016	RE: Updated Motus Rates Report	John Matter	John Matter; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander; Caroline Oyler; Shannon Burke; Jason Hudson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
138	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/20/2016	Materials for ERM Team meeting - Wednesday; September 21 at 1 pm in Conf Room A	Debbie Tate	Debbie Tate; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Joe Smith; Dustin Couts; Billy Higdon; Randy Lawrence; Tim Newton; Peter Collins; Mary Miller; David Orberson; Clara Passafiume; Clark Spader; Jamie Youngblood; Paul Johnson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding legal updates and legal risks associated with regulatory issues.	
139	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/5/2015	Re: Broadcast Communications for June 4; 2015	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Julie Morley; Mike Coomes; Daniel Waddell; Jason Wade; Simon Smith; Steve Ritchie; Internal Communications; Franchise Community Group; Papa John's Operations Team	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 12 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
140		Standalone	6/9/2015	Re: Driver Payroll Meeting Notes 6/5	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Stephen Soderquist; Brent Kemmerer; Brian Reed; Bryan Alwert; Danette Rhoads; David Fortener; Eric Hartman; Jamie Youngblood; Janie Gorter; Lori Ann Krieger; Louise Davis; Maria Brown; Marilyn Sainlar; Michelle Rowan; Pat Connor; Paul Schork; Pauletta Vincent; Robin Cecil; Troy Kays; Ericka Eregbu; Jennifer Hauber; Randy Lawrence; Sandra Carasco	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding overtime.	
141	Caroline Oyler	Standalone		Re: Draft Papa John's Revised Proposal	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Milton Marquis; April Corrigan; Bryan Mosca; George Pauta; John Cordo; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
142	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/10/2015	Re: Alfredo Villaruel; Maglorio; and Hugo Alvero - Wage and Hour claims	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; George Pauta; Susan Rector; Brian Schaffer; Arsenio Rodriguez	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding draft proposal to third parties	
143	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/10/2015	Re: Alfredo Villaruel; Maglorio; and Hugo Alvero - Wage and Hour claims	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; George Pauta; Susan Rector; Brian Schaffer; Arsenio Rodriguez	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding legal strategy for resolving potential claim.	
144	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/10/2015	Re: Alfredo Villaruel; Maglorio; and Hugo Alvero - Wage and Hour claims	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; George Pauta; Susan Rector; Brian Schaffer; Arsenio Rodriguez	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding legal strategy for resolving potential claim.	
145	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/10/2015	Re: Time Sensitive - Claimant: Barbara White	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Rob Porter; Rick Thompson; Brenda Reynolds; Keith Krueger	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures in light of lawsuits	
146	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/11/2015	Re: Happy Hour	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; George Pauta; Susan Rector; Brian Schaffer; Arsenio Rodriguez	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding legal strategy for potential claim.	
147	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/12/2015	Re: High Court Ruling In Tyson Wage Case Could Be Blockbuster	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker; John Matter; Food & Beverage Law360	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding effect of recent case decision.	
148	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/12/2015	Fwd: High Court Ruling In Tyson Wage Case Could Be Blockbuster	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; Lance Tucker: John Matter; Food & Beverage Law360	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding effect of recent case decision.	
149	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/12/2015	Call	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; Lance Tucker; John Matter; Food & Beverage Law360	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding strategy for resolving potential claim.	
150	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/12/2015	Re: Call	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; Lance Tucker; John Matter; Food & Beverage Law360	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding strategy for resolving potential claim.	
151	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/12/2015	Re: Draft Papa John's Counter-Offer to NYAG - ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGED	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter	Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
152	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/15/2015	Re: Draft Papa John's Counter-Offer to NY AG - ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGED	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Caroline Oyler: Lance Tucker; Steve Ritchie	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
153	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/16/2015	Re: New Complaint - William Price v. QS America	Caroline Oyler	David Steenekamp	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding strategy for resolving potential claim.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 13 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/17/2015	Fwd: Papa John's	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Milton	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding legal interpretation of	
				franchise agreement		Marquis; John Matter: George Pauta;	1	franchisee agreement.	
154				provisions		John Cordo; April Corrigan; Bryan Mosca;	1		
						Patricia Kakalec; Terri Gerstein; Elizabeth			
						Wagoner; Daniel Hennefeld; Elena			
	Caroline Oyler	Chandalana	6/17/2015	Re: Draft Papa John's	Caroline Oyler	Goldstein	Attack Commission Manual	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/1//2015	Counter-Offer to NY AG -	Caroline Oyler	Lance Tucker; Steve Ritchie; John Matter; Caroline Oyler	Product	be sent to third parties.	
155				ATTORNEY-CLIENT		Caroline Oyler	rioddct	be sent to third parties.	
				PRIVILEGED					
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/18/2015	Fw: Ford Focus Analysis	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Keith Krueger; Caroline	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
156			., .,	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		Oyler	,	financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
						, ,			
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	6/18/2015	Fw: Papa John's -	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Bryan Mosca;	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication to	
157				Memorandum and		John Matter; Milton Marquis; George		be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
157				Revised Proposal		Pauta; John Cordo; April Corrigan			
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	6/18/2015	Re: Papa John's -	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Bryan Mosca; John	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication to	
158				Memorandum and		Matter; Milton Marquis; George Pauta;		be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
			-11	Revised Proposal		John Cordo; April Corrigan			
455	Caroline Oyler	Parent	6/18/2015	Draft Perrin letter	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication to	
159								be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	6/18/2015	Draft latter	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication to	
160	Caroline Oyler	ratelli	0/10/2013	Diait letter	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler, Eric Todd, John Matter	Attorney-client communication	third parties, with attachments.	
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	6/19/2015		Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Toni Capito	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters, with	
161	Caronine Oyler	raieiit	0/13/2013		Caroline Oylei	caroline Oyler, Toni Capito	Attorney-client communication	attachments.	
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	6/19/2015	NYAG cover memo to	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker; Steve	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication to	
162	,			proposal	*	Ritchie; John Matter	·	third parties, with attachments.	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/19/2015	RE: Papa John's -	Caroline Oyler	Bryan Mosca; Milton Marquis; John	Attorney-Client Communication; Work	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication	
163				Memorandum and		Matter; John Cordo; George B.Pauta;	Product	to be sent to third parties.	
				Revised Proposal		April Corrigan; Caroline Oyler			
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/19/2015	RE: Papa John's -	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Bryan Mosca; April		Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication	
164				Memorandum and		Corrigan; George Pauta; John Cordo; John	Product	to be sent to third parties.	
			-11	Revised Proposal		Matter; Milton Marquis			
4.55	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/19/2015	Re: Papa John's -	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Bryan Mosca; April		Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication	
165				Memorandum and		Corrigan; George Pauta; John Cordo; John	Product	to be sent to third parties.	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalono	6/25/2015	Revised Proposal Re: For Your Attention -	Caroline Oyler	Matter; Milton Marquis Caroline Oyler; Eric Zeugschmidt; Bob	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding effect of recent lawsuits	
	caronne Oyler	Standalone	0/23/2015	Regional Lawsuit Against	caronne oyier	Kraut; Lyndsay Railey;	Attorney-Client Communication	filed in industry.	
166				Papa John's Franchisees		papajohns@edelman.com		med m madad y.	
				. apa Joini 3 i fancinaces		papajomise cucimameom			
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/14/2015	Re: Mileage Question:	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Bill Cox;	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
167				Indiana	, -	Jason Moore; Scott Carr; Danette Rhoads	1	financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding	
<u></u>	<u> </u>			<u> </u>			<u> </u>	HR issues and back pay.	
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/14/2015	Fw: Mileage Question:	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; Pat Hulla; John	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
168				Indiana		Matter; Danette Rhoads; Jason Moore;		financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding	
						Scott Carr; Bill Cox		HR issues and back pay.	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/14/2015	Re: Fwd: Driver Store	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Jason Moore; Bill Cox;	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding effect of other industry	
169				1000		Danette Rhoads; John Matter; Scott Carr;		lawsuits and potential position by DOL investigation.	
						Angel Wagoner; Lynn McQuillen			
	0 11 0 1	c	7/44/2017	5 B : 6: 4005	0 1: 0 1	0 1: 0 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	ali i a	- 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/14/2015	Fw: Driver Store 1000	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Bill Cox;	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding effect of other industry	
170						Jason Moore; Danette Rhoads; Scott		lawsuits and potential position by DOL investigation.	
						Carr; Angel Wagoner; Lynn McQuillen; Eric Todd; Pat Hulla			
				1		Enc roud, rat fillia	I.		

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 14 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
171	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/16/2015	Fw: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Frank Luntz; Caroline Oyler; John Matter;	Attorney-Client Communication; Work	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	Ĭ.
1/1						Lance Tucker	Product	financial policies and procedures.	
172	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/16/2015	Re: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Frank Luntz; Caroline Oyler; Alexis Soper	Attorney-Client Communication; Work	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation	
							Product	strategy regarding potential claims.	
173	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/16/2015	Re: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Frank Luntz; Caroline Oyler; Alexis Soper;	1	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation	
	0 1: 0 1	c	7/45/2045	n n l: 1:	0 1: 0 1	Joshua Gardner	Product	strategy regarding potential claims.	
174	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/16/2015	Re: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Frank Luntz Caroline Oyler; Alexis Soper; Joshua Gardner	Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/16/2015	Re: Draft Letter to Jimmy	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell		strategy regarding potential claims. Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to	
175	caronic oyier	Standarone	7,10,2013	ne. Brait Letter to similify	caroniic oyici	caronic Syler, Barner Wadden	Product	be sent to third parties.	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/16/2015	Fwd: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Eric Todd;	Attorney-Client Communication; Work	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation	
176				·		Alyssa Salvo; Joshua Gardner; Jessica	Product	strategy regarding potential claims.	
170						Wittland; Caroline Miller Oyler; Frank			
						Luntz			
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/16/2015	Re: New York Post article	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Cordo; April		Email providing legal advice regarding content of media	
177						Corrigan; Bryan Mosca; George Pauta;	Product	statement.	
						John Matter; Mitlon Marquis			
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/16/2015	Fwd: Evening Monitoring	Caroline Oyler	Bob Kraut; Caroline Oyler; John Matter;		Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
178				Report - NY Franchisee		Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Eric	Product		
				Issue		Zeugschmidt; Lyndsay Railey;			
	Caroline Oyler	Standalono	7/17/2015	Re: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	PapaJohns@edelman.com Caroline Oyler; Joshua Gardner; Eric	Attornoy Client Communication: Work	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation	
179	Caroline Oylei	Standarone	//1//2013	ine. Delivery univer case	Caronine Oylei	Todd; Jessica Wittland; Alyssa Salvo;	Product	strategy regarding potential claims.	
						Caroline Miller Oyler; Frank Luntz			
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/17/2015	Re: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Joshua Gardner; Eric	Attorney-Client Communication; Work	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation	
400						Todd; Jessica Wittland; Alyssa Salvo;	Product	strategy regarding potential claims.	
180						Caroline Miller Oyler; Frank Luntz			
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/17/2015	Fwd: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker; Steve	Attorney-Client Communication; Work	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation	
181						Ritchie; Joshua Gardner; Eric Todd:	Product	strategy regarding potential claims.	
101						Jessica Wittland; Alyssa Salvo; Frank			
	Caroline Oyler	D+	7/17/2015	Fwd: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Luntz Caroline Oyler; Bob Kraut; Joshua	Attanger Client Communication Manual	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation	
182	Caroline Oyler	Parent	//1//2015	Fwd: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Gardner: Eric Todd: Jessica Wittland:	Product	strategy regarding potential claims.	
102						Alyssa Salvo; Frank Luntz	Troduct	strategy regarding potential claims.	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/17/2015	Re: New York Post article	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; George Pauta; John	Attorney-Client Communication; Work	Email providing legal advice regarding interpretation of legal	
183						Cordo; April Corrigan; Bryan Mosca; John	Product	agreement and content of media statement.	
						Matter; Mitlon Marquis			
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/17/2015	Re: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Bob Kraut; Joshua		Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation	
184						Gardner; Eric Todd; Jessica Wittland;	Product	strategy regarding potential claims.	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/19/2015	Re: New York Post article	Caroline Oyler	Alyssa Salvo; Frank Luntz	Attorney Client Communication Wash	Email providing legal advice regarding implication of consent	
	caronne oyler	Standalone	//13/2015	ne. New TOTK POST afficie	caronne Oyler	Caroline Oyler; George Pauta; John Cordo; April Corrigan; Bryan Mosca; John		judgement.	
185						Matter; Mitlon Marquis	roduct	judgement.	
						·			
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/19/2015	Fwd: New York Post	Caroline Oyler	Steve Ritchie; Simon Smith; Bob Kraut;		Email providing legal advice regarding implication of consent	
106				article		Daniel Waddell; John Matter; George	Product	judgement, with attachments.	
186						Pauta; Caroline Oyler; April Corrigan; John Cordo; Bryan Mosca; Milton			
						Marquis			
407	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/19/2015	Re: Audit Committee	Caroline Oyler		Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to	
187				Report- Legal Issues	<u> </u>	Brian Ketterer		be sent to third parties.	
188	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/19/2015	Re: Draft answers to Luntz	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd		Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation	
100				questions			Product	strategy regarding potential claims.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 15 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
189	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	7/19/2015	Answers to Luntz questions	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Miller Oyler; Frank Luntz; Alexis Soper; Joshua Gardner; Eric Todd; Josh Gardner; Jessica Wittland; Lance Tucker; Steve Ritchie		Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
190	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/19/2015	Re: Draft answers to Luntz questions	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Bob Kraut	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
191	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/20/2015	Re:	Caroline Oyler	Douglas Schnee	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding industry lawsuits.	
192	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/20/2015	Re: Draft answers to Luntz questions	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd	Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
193	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/20/2015	Re: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Joshua Gardner; Alyssa Salvo; Eric Todd; Nathan Avant; Suzanne Conte; Frank Luntz	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
194	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/20/2015	Fw: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; John Matter; Pat Hulla; Joshua Gardner; Alyssa Salvo; Nathan Avant; Suzanne Conte	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
195	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/20/2015	RE: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; John Matter; Patrick F. Hulla; Joshua Gardner; Nathan Avant; Suzanne Conte; Alyssa Salvo; Jessica Wittland	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
196	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/20/2015	Re: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; Josh Gardner; Nathan Avant; Suzanne Conte; Alyssa Salvo; Jessica Wittland	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
197	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/20/2015	RE: Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; John Matter; Patrick F. Hulla; Joshua Gardner; Nathan Avant; Suzanne Conte; Alyssa Salvo; Jessica Wittland; Alexis Soper	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
198	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/20/2015	Disclosure	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; John Matter; Pat Hulla	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
199	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/20/2015	Fwd: Disclosure	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; John Matter; Pat Hulla; Clara Passafiume		Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
200	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/20/2015	Re: Dislcosure	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; John Matter; Pat Hulla		Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
201	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/21/2015	Re: Dislcosure	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; John Matter; Pat Hulla		Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
202	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/21/2015	Fwd: Dislcosure	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; John Matter; Pat Hulla; Clara Passafiume	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
203	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/21/2015	Per my voice message - need info asap	Caroline Oyler	Bill Cox	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
204	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/21/2015	Re: NEED ADDITIONAL INFO - Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Joshua Gardner; Alyssa Salvo; Eric Todd; Nathan Avant; Suzanne Conte; Jessica Wittland	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
205	Caroline Oyler		7/21/2015	Re: NEED ADDITIONAL INFO - Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Joshua Gardner; Alyssa Salvo; Eric Todd; Nathan Avant; Suzanne Conte; Jessica Wittland	Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
206	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/21/2015	Re: Mileage Reimbursement Rates as of P6 '15 YTD	Caroline Oyler	Billy Higdon; Bill Cox; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
207	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/21/2015	Fw: PJI Settlement Structure	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker; Dave Diamond; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 16 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
208	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/22/2015	RE: New York Post article	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; George Pauta; April Corrigan; Bryan Mosca; John Cordo; Mitlon Marquis	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding content of media statement.	
209	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/22/2015	Re: New York Post article	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; George Pauta; April Corrigan; Bryan Mosca; John Cordo; Milton Marquis		Email providing legal advice regarding content of media statement.	
210	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/22/2015	Fwd: Missouri eAuthority- Quest for "Living Wage" Results in Minimum Wage Increases in Kansas City	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Lynn McQuillen; OgleTree Deakins	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding compliance with labor laws.	
211	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/22/2015	Fwd: PJI Settlement Structure	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Dave Diamond; Joel Fineberg	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
212	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/23/2015	Fw: NEED ADDITIONAL INFO - Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; John Matter; Joshua Gardner; Alyssa Salvo; Eric A.Todd; Nathan Avant; Matthew Standerfer; Suzanne Conte; Frank Luntz	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
213	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/23/2015	Re: New York Post article	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Cordo; April Corrigan; Bryan Mosca; George Pauta; John Matter; Milton Marquis	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding interpretation of legal agreement and content of media statement.	
214	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/23/2015	Fw: FAC Orientation	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Debbie Tate; Kim Girdler; Toni Capito; Steve Ritchie; Simon Smith; Edmond Heelan; Nadeem Bajwa; Robert Carroll; Keith Sullins; Bill Freitas; Vaughn Frey; Dougie Allen; Tina Glover; Philip Horn; Bill Green; Joseph Hogue; Rick Mohler; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Wade Oney; Paul Robinson; David Rothman; Eric Murphy	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
215	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/23/2015	Re: NEED ADDITIONAL INFO - Delivery driver case	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Joshua Gardner; Alyssa Salvo; Eric Todd; Matthew Standerfer; Nathan Avant; Suzanne Conte; Luntz Global; Jessica Wittland; Frank Luntz	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
216	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/23/2015	Fw: PJI Settlement Structure	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Dave Diamond; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	_
217	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/24/2015	Re: TM issue		Caroline Oyler; Bob Kraut; Lyndsay Riley; Julia McGuffey; Melissa Richards-Person; Christy Johnson; Amy Salloum; Leah Schultz; Cara VanCleave; Jim Hartley; Mike Coomes; Dustin Couts; Chuck Simon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding legality of employee conduct.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 17 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
218	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/24/2015	Re: TM issue	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Julia McGuffey; Melissa Richard-Person; Jim Hartley; Amy Salloum; Cara VanCleave; Christy Johnson; Leah Schultz; Lyndsay Railey; Mike Coomes; Chuck Simon; Dustin Couts	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
219	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/24/2015	Re: TM issue	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Julia McGuffey; Melissa Richard-Person; Jim Hartley; Amy Salloum; Cara VanCleave; Christy Johnson; Leah Schultz; Lyndsay Railey; Mike Coomes; Chuck Simon; Dustin Couts	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
220	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/25/2015	Re: notification costs	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Keeta Fox; John Matter; Brian Ketterer; Claude Phenix	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
221	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/27/2015	Fw: Q2 2015 press release draft	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Amber Mcnew; Adam Hack: Clara Passafiume; Craig Marshall; Eric Newton; Keeta Fox; Lance Tucker; Brian Ketterer	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
222	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/28/2015	Re: Fw: Minimum Wage Proposal FINAL.doc	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Alfredo Ortiz	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
223	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/28/2015		Caroline Oyler	Robby Robertson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding potential communication with third party.	
224	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/28/2015	Re: conf call question	Caroline Oyler	Lance Tucker; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
225	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/29/2015	Re:	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; J. Robert Robertson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding potential communication with third party.	
226	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/31/2015	Fw: Analysis	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Alyssa Salvo Eric Todd	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
227	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/31/2015	Fw: Analysis	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Bob Kraut; Alyssa Salvo; Eric Todo	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
228	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/3/2015	Re: Luntz Q&A edits	Caroline Oyler	Lance Tucker; Steve Ritchie; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
229	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/3/2015	Fw: Analysis	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Peter Collins; John Matter; Lance Tucker; Alyssa Salvo; Eric Todd	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
230	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/3/2015		Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clara Passafiume	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	
231	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/3/2015	Redraft of 49 and 61 and new question	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker; Amber McNew; Clara Passafiume; Keeta Fox; Connie Houston; Brad Lacy; Steve Coke	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding media statement and potential communications with media, with attachments.	
232	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/4/2015	Re: Redraft of 49 and 61 and new question	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker; Amber McNew; Clara Passafiume; Keeta Fox; Connie Houston; Brad Lacy; Steve Coke	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding media statement and potential communications with media.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 18 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
233	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/4/2015	Re: Update to Runzheimer Mileage Data for 2016	Caroline Oyler	Bill Cox; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Scott Corbin	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
234	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/4/2015	Updating data	Caroline Oyler	Eric Todd; Pat Hulla; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
235	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/4/2015	Re: Updating data	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; Patrick F. Hulla, John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedure regarding rate calculation.	
236	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/4/2015	RE: Updating data	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; Patrick F. Hulla, John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
237	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/6/2015	Re: Communication Estimated Payroll Report	Caroline Oyler	Edmond Heelan; Steve Richie; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Susan Kinder; Dustin Couts; Cynthia McClellen	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
238	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/10/2015	Fw: FAC Agenda & Pre Reads	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Debbie Tate; Kim Girdler; Toni Capito; Steve Ritchie; Simon Smith; Edmond Heelan; Nadeem Bajwa; Robert Carroll; Keith Sullins; Bill Freitas; Vaughn Frey; Dougle Allen; Tina Glover; Philip Horn; Bill Green; Joseph Hogue; Rick Mohler; Clark Mandigo; Lamon Muchmore; Wade Oney; Paul Robinson; David Rothman; Eric Murphy Cc: Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern; Lance Tucker; Cynthia McClellen; Robert Smith; Shane Hutchins; Bob Kraut; Sean Muldoon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
239	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/10/2015	Fw: FAC Agenda & Pre Reads	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Toni Capito; Steve Ritchie; Simon Smith; Edmond Heelan; Nadeem Bajwa; Robert Carroll; Keith Sullins; Bill Freitas; Vaughn Frey; Dougie Allen; Tina Glover; Philip Horn; Bill Green; Joseph Hogue; Rick Mohler; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Wade Oney; Paul Robinson; David Rothman; Eric Murphy Cc: Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern; Lance Tucker; Cynthia McClellen; Robert Smith; Shane Hutchins Bob Kraut; Sean Muldoon		Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
240	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/10/2015	Re: USA today Ad	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Pat Dunigan; Bob Kraut; Peter Collins	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
241		Parent	8/10/2015	RE: Prince-Initial Report	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; David Steenekamp; John Matter; Eric Todd; LyndsayRailey; Eric Zeugschmidt	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
242	Caroline Oyler			Re: Prince-Initial Report	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; David Steenekamp; Lyndsay Railey; Eric Zeugschmidt; John Matter	Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
243	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/11/2015	Re: Privileged	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Alyssa Salvo	Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy regarding potential claims.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 19 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1111 205 "		Parent	8/11/2015	Luntz review of NYAG	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; John		Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation	The state of the s
244	· ·			proposal		Matter; Lance Tucker; Alyssa Salvo	Product	strategy regarding potential claims and regarding draft	
244								communications to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
245	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/11/2015	Re: Fwd: 4010_001.pdf	Caroline Oyler	Chris Stelle; Caroline Oyler; Daniel	1	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/12/2015	Re: FW: Tucker - Media	Caroline Oyler	Patterson Vidya Kauri; wjr@heplerbroom.com;	Product Attorney-Client Communication	strategy regarding potential claims. Email seeking legal advice regarding content of media	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/12/2013	Inquiry Re: Papa John's		leh@heplerbroom.com; Jason Rankin;	Attorney-client communication	statement.	
				state tax on delivery fees		Nicholas Secco; Caroline Oyler; John			
246						Matter; David Weinstein; Andrew Patch;			
						Jonathan Tannen			
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/12/2015	Re: Fw: Time Sensitive	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Matt Van	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding potential draft	
247			0,,		,	Note; Bo Czyz; Simon Smith; Hassan		communication to be sent to third party.	
						Nasser		. ,	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/12/2015	Re: Fw: Time Sensitive	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Matt Van	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding potential draft	
248						Note; Bo Czyz; Simon Smith; Hassan		communication to be sent to third party.	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/12/2015	Re: Better Tracker -	Caroline Oyler	Nasser Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Anne	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
	caroniic Oyiei	Standarone	0/12/2013	update on pilot		Fischer; Bernie Fussenegger; Dustin	Actorney chefit communication	financial policies and procedures regarding employee data	
						Couts; Jason Wade; Kevin Matthews;		reimbursement.	
249						Mark Nance; Pat Dunigan; Robert Smith;			
2.3						Steve Coke; Susan Kinder; Tim Newton;			
						Christy Johnson; Jim Ensign; Edmond Heelan			
						riecian			
250	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/13/2015	Re: Executive Committee	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Lamont	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
230				_		Muchmore		financial policies and procedures.	
251	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/13/2015	Re: TN Wage & Hour Investigator	Caroline Oyler	Jamie Youngblood; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding implications of NLRB position on joint employer.	
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/13/2015	Fw: FYI - 6 AGs Write	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Lance	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding implications of NLRB	
252			., .,	Letter to NLRB		Tucker; Bryan Mosca; John Matter;		position on joint employer.	
252						George Pauta; John Cordo; April Corrigan			
	0 11 0 1	c	0/40/0045	D 5 500 5 4 5 14 11	0 1 0 1				
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/13/2015	Re: Fw: FYI - 6 AGs Write Letter to NLRB	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Bryan Mosca; John Matter;	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding potential communication with third party.	
253				cetter to Helio		George Pauta; John Cordo; April Corrigan		communication with time purty.	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/17/2015	Re: Recent Mileage suit	Caroline Oyler	Roger Cox; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication; Work	Email providing legal advice regarding potential	
254				-			Product	communication with third party.	
255	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/20/2015	FAC minutes	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication to	
255								be sent to third party.	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/21/2015	Fwd: CNS: "Papa";	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; John Dabney; Caroline		Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
256				"John's" - new litigation		Oyler; CNS Dinger; Will McDermott	Product		
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/21/2015	FAC MINUTES	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Dustin Couts	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication to	
257	caronnic Oylei	. a. ciit	5/21/2013	THE WINTED	Caroniic Oyiei	caronic Syler, bustin cours	recorder, chem communication	be sent to third parties.	
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/24/2015	Fw: FAC MINUTES	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Dustin Couts	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication to	
258								be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 20 of 141

Duis Las #	Cooks dis-	Daniel / Child	D-4	File Name (Cubinet	A / F	De sistema	Duisiles - Desir	Paradalia	D-1 D (D-111
Priv Log #	Custodian Caroline Oyler	Parent/Child Standalone	Date 8/24/2015	File Name/Subject Re: 2 Former Delivery	Author/From Caroline Oyler	Recipients Keeta Fox; Caroline Oyler	Privilege Basis Attorney-Client Communication	Description Email seeking legal advice regarding legal analysis of industry	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
259	Caroline Oyler	Standarone	0/24/2013	Drivers Sue Pizza Hut Over Company Fees	Caronile Oylei	RECIA I DA, CAIUIIIE O PIEI	Actorney-client communication	lawsuits.	
260	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	8/24/2015	Re: August 12 – 13; 2015	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
261	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/25/2015	Fwd: August 12 – 13; 2015	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Steve Ritchie		Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
262	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/25/2015	Fw: FAC minutes	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Debbie Tate; Toni Capito	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
263	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/25/2015	Here's the latest draft. Thanks.	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Bob Kraut	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
264	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/25/2015	Re: FAC minutes	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Bob Kraut; Debbie Tate; Melinda Lutz	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
265	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/25/2015	Re: QS Pappa Johns Franchisee	Caroline Oyler	Patrick Hulla; John Gerak; Eric Todd; Bill Mitchell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding potential communication with third party.	
266	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/25/2015	Fwd: Broadcast Communications for August 25; 2015	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Internal Communications; Franchise Community Group; Papa John's Operations Team	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties and regarding Papa John's policy regarding brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	
267	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/26/2015	Fw: FAC minutes	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Debbie Tate; Melinda Lutz; Bob Kraut	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
268	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/26/2015	Re: Runzheimer	Caroline Oyler	Rodney Harrison; Eric Todd; John Matter; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
269	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/26/2015	Re: Runzheimer	Caroline Oyler	Rodney Harrison; Eric Todd; John Matter; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
270	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/26/2015	Re: Clarification from Colorado Dept. of Revenue regarding non- binding ruling on delivery charges	Caroline Oyler	Neil Tillquist; Marvin Kirsner; Erika Hoxeng; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Nicholas Secco; David Weinstein; Andrew Patch	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding compliance with labor laws.	
271	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/27/2015	Fwd: Decision by the NLRB	Caroline Oyler	Peter Collins; Executive Leadership Team; John Matter; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues with respect to recent industry lawsuits.	
272	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/31/2015	Re: For Your Consideration: POV on NLRB Ruling	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Conroy Boxhill; Amy Salloum; Charles Bakaly; Eric Zeugschmidt; John Matter; Peter Collins	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues with respect to recent industry lawsuits.	
273	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/2/2015	Re: NY Franchisee Campaign - Requested Info	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Peter Collins; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding media statements and public relations.	
274	Caroline Oyler		9/8/2015	Re: Papa John's / New York AG Potential Resolution Terms and Estimate	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; George Pauta; April Corrigan; Bryan Mosca; John Cordo John Matter; Mitlon Marquis	Product	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
275	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/8/2015	Fw: Papa John's / New York AG Potential Resolution Terms and Estimate	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; George Pauta; John Matter; Mitlon Marquis; Bryan Mosca; April Corrigan; John Cordo	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 21 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/10/2015		Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Simon Smith		Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's policies	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
276								regarding brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	
277	Caroline Oyler	Standalone		Memo re NYAG	Caroline Oyler	Lance Tucker; Steve Ritchie; John Matter; Caroline Oyler	Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication to be sent to third party.	
278	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/11/2015	Fw: MOTUS Files	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; John Matter; Karen Koerkenmeier; Rodney Harrison	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
279	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/11/2015	New York Attorney General investigation	Caroline Oyler	John Schnatter; Lance Tucker; Steve Ritchie; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
280	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/14/2015	Fw: MOTUS Files	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; John Matter; Karen Koerkenmeier; Rodney Harrison	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
281	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/16/2015	Fw:	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Simon Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
282	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/16/2015	Fw: Social Media Policy and Guidelines	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Julia McGuffey; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
283	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/21/2015	Re: Fw: Winter Conditions memo:	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Craig Jones; Dustin Couts; Eric Hartman; Randy Lawrence; Brian Reed; Debbie Osborne	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
284	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/21/2015	Re: ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGED	Caroline Oyler	Carolyn Oyler; Robert Smith; John Matter; Randy Lawrence; Christy Campbell; Shane Hutchins; Brent Kemmerer; Brian Reed; Eric Hartman	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding strategy for addressing employment and human resources issues.	
285	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/23/2015	Re: Change in taxability of delivery charges on October 1st	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Claude Phenix; Susan Kinder; Mark Nance	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding tax laws.	
286	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/25/2015	Re: Client-Attorney Privilege	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Susan Kinder; Cynthia McClellen; Kim Girdler; Bill Green; Rick Mohler; Steve Saunders	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments, regarding compliance with labor laws.	
287	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/28/2015	Re: Safe driving course	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Danny Evans; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts and draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
288	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/29/2015	Re: Summary of Call with NY AG and US DOL	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Milton Marquis; April Corrigan; Bryan Mosca; George Pauta; John Cordo; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding litigation strategy for potential claims.	
289	Caroline Oyler	Standalone		Fw: Summary of Call with NY AG and US DOL	Caroline Oyler	Christine Oyler; Lance Tucker; Steve Ritchie; John Matter; Milton Marquis; George Pauta; John Cordo; Bryan Mosca; April Corrigan	Product	Email providing legal advice regarding litigation strategy for potential claims.	
290	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/30/2015	Fw: ERM top risks	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Clara Passafiume; Debbie Tate	Attorney Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, and regarding draft communications, with attachments.	
291	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/30/2015	Fw: ERM top ten	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker; Debbie Tate	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
292	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/5/2015	Re: Call follow up	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Kim Girdler; Carmine Cappuccio; Paul Gilkey	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
293	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/6/2015	Re: legal disclosures - 10- Q	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clara Passafiume; Amber Mcnew	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 22 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
Priv Log #		Standalone	10/7/2015	Fw: Pizza Tracker	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Cynthia	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication.	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
294	curomic cyrci	Standardic	10,7,2013	. W. Field Frederic	curomic oyie.	McClellen; Anne Fischer; Edmond Heelan; Mark Nance; Robert Thompson; Steve Ritchie; Susan Kinder	, therete, enem communication		
295	Caroline Oyler		10/7/2015		Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker; Debbie Tate	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts and regarding draft communication, with attachments.	
296	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/12/2015	Re: Navex WPH Course Fee for Franchisees	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Dale Herb; John Matter; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Jordan Marr	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's strategy regarding training and compliance with labor laws, with attachments.	
297	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/12/2015	Fwd: Driver reimbursement issue	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; Pat Hulla; John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Bruce Lofland Jr.	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim.	
298	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/12/2015	Fw: Driver reimbursement issue	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Bruce Lofland Jr.	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
299	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/12/2015	Driver reimbursement issue - draft response	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Bruce Lofland Jr.	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
300	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/13/2015	Re: Driver reimbursement issue	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Tammy Rhodus; Steve Ritchie; Bruce Lofland Jr.	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim and compliance with laws.	
301	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/13/2015	Re: Driver reimbursement issue	Caroline Oyler	Steve Ritchie; Caroline Oyler; Bruce Lofland Jr.	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim and compliance with laws.	
302	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/13/2015	Fwd: Driver reimbursement issue	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; John Matter; Eric Todd; Patrick F. Hulla	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and compliance with laws.	
303	Caroline Oyler	Parent	10/14/2015	Re: Fw: PRB Question	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Tammy Rhodus; Daniel Waddell; Michael Meche	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's strategy regarding brand standards enforcement and provisions under franchise agreement.	
304	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/16/2015	Fwd: Florida eAuthority- Florida's Minimum Wage Likely to Remain Unchanged on January 1; 2016	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; John Matter; OgleTree Deakins	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters and compliance with state laws.	
305	Caroline Oyler	Parent	10/19/2015	Fw: NRF Memo: Follow Up from NRF Webinar on NLRB Decision in Browning-Ferris Industries	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Lizzy Simmons; Eileen Pryor; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and interpretation of NLRB decision, with attachments.	
306	Caroline Oyler	Parent	10/19/2015	Fw: NRF Memo: Follow Up from NRF Webinar on NLRB Decision in Browning-Ferris Industries	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Lizzy Simmons; Eileen Pryor; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and interpretation of NLRB decision, with attachments.	
307	Caroline Oyler	Parent	10/19/2015	Fw: NRF Memo: Follow Up from NRF Webinar on NLRB Decision in Browning-Ferris Industries	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Lizzy Simmons; Eileen Pryor; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and interpretation of NLRB decision, with attachments.	
308	Caroline Oyler	Parent	10/19/2015	Fw: NRF Memo: Follow Up from NRF Webinar on NLRB Decision in Browning-Ferris Industries	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Lizzy Simmons; Eileen Pryor; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and interpretation of NLRB decision, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 23 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
309	Caroline Oyler	Parent	10/19/2015	Fw: NRF Memo: Follow Up from NRF Webinar on NLRB Decision in Browning-Ferris Industries	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Lizzy Simmons; Eileen Pryor; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and interpretation of NLRB decision, with attachments.	
310	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/27/2015	Re: Investigation	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
311	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/27/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Jason Moore; Krisite Scott; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
312	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/27/2015	Fw: Attorney-Client Privileged	Caroline Oyler	Steve Ritchie; Caroline Oyler; John Matterl Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Daniel Collinsworth; Edond Heelan	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy for potential claim.	
313	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/27/2015	Re: Michigan labor law	Caroline Oyler	Jim Hartley; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding interpretation of state regulations.	
314	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/28/2015	Re: Talking Points	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Anthony Byergo; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Daniel Collinsworth; Jesse McBain; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding content of media statement and draft communication.	
315	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/29/2015	Fw: Attorney Client Privilege	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Anthony Byergo; Jesse McBain; John Matter; Jason Moore; Edmond Heelan; Daniel Collinsworth; Robert Smith; Kristie Scott	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	
316	Caroline Oyler	Parent	10/29/2015	Fw: November FAC Meeting-Agenda	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Keeta Fox; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Sean Muldoon; Cynthia Kelley; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Robert Thompson; Toni Capito; Paul W. Robinson; Simon Smith; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Philip Horn	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communications, with attachments.	
317	Caroline Oyler	Parent	10/29/2015	Fw: November FAC Meeting-Agenda	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Sean Muldoon; Cynthia Kelley; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Robert Thompson; Toni Capito; Paul Robinson; Simon Smith; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Philip Horn	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
318	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/29/2015	Re: Garrett Schanck of JG Operations - looking for information on settlement of driver lawsuit	Caroline Oyler	Rob Porter; Rick Thompson; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding potential communications.	
319	Caroline Oyler	Parent	10/29/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Daniel Collinsworth	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
320	Caroline Oyler	Standalone		Re: Monthly mileage rate updates	Caroline Oyler	Susan Kinder; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Cynthia McClellan; Rob Pennington; Bobbi Stewart; Eddy Walker; Johanna South	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
321	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/30/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Rodney Harrison; Carmine Cappuccio; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 24 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
322		Standalone	11/5/2015	Re: PJ Iowa	Caroline Oyler	Eric Todd	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation	<u> </u>
323	Caroline Oyler	Parent	11/6/2015	Re: Draft of 2016 Franchise Agreement	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding interpretation of franchise agreement.	
324	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	11/6/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Daniel Collinsworth; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy for potential claim.	
325	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	11/6/2015	Fw: Attorney-Client Privileged	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Billy Higdon; Daniel Collinsworth; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy for potential claim.	
326	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	11/6/2015	Re: NY State Delivery Fee (Request from Franchisee)	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Don Ceccarelli; Daniel Waddell; Kimberly Winebrenner; Scott Durigg; Steve Colbert; Matt Vannot; Jeanne Jefferson; John Low; Jeff Williams	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding potential draft communication to third parties.	
327	Caroline Oyler	Parent	11/10/2015	Fw: 2016 Redlined FA	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Daniel Waddell; Kimberly Winebrenner	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft legal document, with attachments.	
328	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	11/16/2015	Re: Fw: Google Alert - Papa Johns	Caroline Oyler	Keeta Fox; Caroline Oyler; Google Alerts	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
329	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	11/18/2015	Re: For tomorrow's broadcast	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding media statement and communications to third parties.	
330	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	11/19/2015	Re: Broadcast Communications for November 19; 2015 - for review / approval	Caroline Oyler	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Melissa Richards-Person: Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Mulidoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
331	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	11/19/2015	Re: Driver reimbursements	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Michael Meche; Joel Cooney	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
332	Caroline Oyler	Parent	12/1/2015	Re: Letter to Chicago Attorney	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
333	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	12/2/2015	Fwd: Mileage Reimbursement Increase	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Lance Tucker; Billy Higdon; Steve Ritchie	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
334	Caroline Oyler	Parent		Fw: mileage reimbursement and yellow package lobby enhancement issue	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Steve Ritchie; John Matter; Daniel Waddell; Edmond Heelan; Lance Tucker; Billy Higdon	Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation, with attachments.	
335	Caroline Oyler		12/7/2015	Re: mileage reimbursement and yellow package lobby enhancement issue	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Daniel Waddell; Lance Tucker; Billy Higdon	Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation.	
336	Caroline Oyler	Parent	12/8/2015	Re: ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGED	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Jason Moore	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resources, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 25 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
337		Parent	12/9/2015	Fw: For meeting tomorrow at 11 - 2016 Standard Franchise Agreement	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Joe Smith; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Tim O'Hern; Robert Thompson; Daniel Waddell; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft legal document, with attachments.	outes range (newtered documents)
338	Caroline Oyler	Parent	12/10/2015	Fw: Sample Rate Cards	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Rodney Harrison; Carmine Cappuccio; Craig Powell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding rate calculation, with attachments.	
339	Caroline Oyler	Parent	12/14/2015	2016 Franchise Agreement	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Philip Horn; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Daniel Waddell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft legal document, with attachments.	
340	Caroline Oyler	Parent	12/14/2015	2016 Franchise Agreement	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Philip Horn; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Daniel Waddell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft legal document, with attachments.	
341	Caroline Oyler	Parent	12/14/2015	2016 Franchise Agreement	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Philip Horn; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Daniel Waddell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft legal document, with attachments.	
342	Caroline Oyler	Parent	12/14/2015	2016 Franchise Agreement	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Philip Horn; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Daniel Waddell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft legal document, with attachments.	
343	Caroline Oyler	Parent	12/14/2015	2016 Franchise Agreement	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Philip Horn; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Daniel Waddell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft legal document, with attachments.	
344	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	12/16/2015	Re: OPCON Breakout Contacts	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Rich Butler; Cynthia McClellen; Robert Smith; Robert Thompson; Tim O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Sean Muldoon; Edmond Heelan; Steve Ritchie; Michele heuglin	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
345	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	12/17/2015	Re: Fw: Mileage Reimbursement - Dorsch of JNE	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Rob Porter; Jason Wade; John Matter; Craig Jones; Jordan Dorsch	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding potential communications.	
346	Caroline Oyler	Parent	12/17/2015	Fw: Broadcast Communications for December 17; 2015 - for review / approval	Caroline Oyler	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Julia McGuffey; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan Michele O'Hern, Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 26 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
347	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	12/17/2015	Re: Broadcast Communications for December 17; 2015 - for review / approval	Caroline Oyler	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Melissa Richards-Person: Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Mulldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julia McGuffey	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
348	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	12/30/2015	Re: Caroline a quick question	Caroline Oyler	Bo Knapp	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding legal document and employment or labor issues.	
349	Caroline Oyler	Parent	1/14/2016	Fw: ERM Team - Quarterly Meeting scheduled for Tuesday; January 19	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Debbie Tate; robert Smith; Joe Smith; dustin Couts; Tim Newton; Billy Higdon; Randy Lawrence; Paul Johnson; Mary Miller; David Orberson; Clara Passaflume; Clark Spader; Jamie Youngblood	Attorney Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, and assement of industry legal issues, with attachments.	
350	Caroline Oyler	Parent	1/15/2016	Re: Fw: Risk Factors for Form 10k	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clara Passafiume; Debbie Tate; John Matter; Amber Mcnew	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication, with attachments.	
351	Caroline Oyler	Parent	1/20/2016	Fw: P1 Quality Guarantee Webcast Draft	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Julia McGuffey; Jordan Marr	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication and presentation, with attachments.	
352	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	1/29/2016	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Caroline Oyler	John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's litigation strategy for potential claim.	
353	Caroline Oyler	Parent	2/4/2016	For FAC	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler	Attorney Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication/ document, with attachments.	
354	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	2/16/2016	Re: Declaration : IDS v Papa John's	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Daniel Waddell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft legal document.	
355	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	2/20/2016	Re: FOCUS Enhancement Requests	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Billy Higdon; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Jessica Akin; Susan Kinder; Bobbie Stewart	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
356	Caroline Oyler	Parent	2/22/2016	*Confidential: Fw: February FAC Meeting Minutes - Time Sensitive	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Lamont Muchmore; Clark Mandigo; Phil Horn; Edmond Hellan; Simon Smith; Steve Ritchie; Toni Capito; Joseph Hogue; Rick MohlerNadeem Bajwa; Robert Carroll; Keith Sullins; Bill Freitas; Vaughn Frey; Dougie Allen; Tina Glover; Wade Oney; Eric Murphy	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
357	Caroline Oyler	Parent	2/26/2016	Fw: whistleblower hotline complaint	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Debbie Tate; Simon Smith; Edmond Heelan; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	
358	Caroline Oyler	Parent	2/29/2016	Re: Fw: Complaint on Store No. 655; Ticket #PJIA-A7LPJF	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Kristie Scott; Torri Harris; Joey Low; Consumer Services; Mike Smith; Joey Revels; QA Support	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 27 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
359		Standalone	3/4/2016	Re: Fw: Franchisee Policy Question	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Edmond Heelan; Derek Fitzpatrick; JC Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	outer hange (neutree overheits)
360	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	3/14/2016	Re: Fw: Franchise Employee Issue	Caroline Oyler	Lance Tucker; Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler; Eddie Adams; Steve Ritchie; Timothy O'Hearn; John Scnatter; Norborne Cole; Christoper Coleman; Olivia Kirtley; Laurette Koellner; Sonya Medina; Mark Shapiro; Wayne Taylor	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate policies and procedures regarding employment issues.	
361	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	3/14/2016	Re: Franchise Employee Issue	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Debbie Tate; Clara Passafiume; Eddie Adams; Steve Ritchie; Timothy Ohern; Lance Tucker	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate policies and procedures regarding employment issues.	
362	Caroline Oyler	Parent	3/16/2016	PMP	Caroline Oyler	Lance Tucker; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
363	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	3/23/2016	Re: Fw: Whitelist request	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Susan Kinder; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Johanna South; Rob Pennington; Ric Stuebs	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate policies and procedures regarding franchisees.	
364	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	3/29/2016	Re: Broadcast Communications for March 29; 2016 + FOCUS/POS tax settings notice; for review / approval	Caroline Oyler	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards - Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michelle O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
365	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	3/30/2016	Re: Driver Checkout - Ack Message	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; David Bratcher; Dustin Couts; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; Johanna South; Shawn Mayher	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	
366	Caroline Oyler	Parent	3/30/2016	Re: ERM - top risks	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Debbie Tate	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
367	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	3/31/2016	Re: FOCUS-Driver Checkout-MQ Miles	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; David Bratcher; Dustin Couts; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; Shawn Mayher; Johanna South	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and draft communications.	
368	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	4/1/2016	Re: Sullivan v. PJ United	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; Will Hancock; Jill L. Miller; Rodney Harrison; Dough Stephens; Becky Gwarjanski	Attorney-Client Communication; Attorney Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding litigation and draft documents.	
369	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	4/1/2016	Re: Sullivan v. PJ United	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; Will Hancock; Jill L. Miller; Rodney Harrison; Dough Stephens; Becky Gwarjanski	Attorney-Client Communication; Attorney Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding litigation and draft documents.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 28 of 141

D.:	Cooks disas	Danie at (Child	D-4-	File News (Cubicat	Author/Franc	Davidsont.	Deivilees Design	Paradakina.	n
Priv Log #	Custodian Caroline Oyler	Parent/Child Standalone	Date 4/1/2016	File Name/Subject Re: Sullivan v. PJ United	Author/From Caroline Oyler	Recipients Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; Will Hancock;	Privilege Basis Attorney-Client Communication	Description Email providing legal advice regarding litigation and draft	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
370	caronic oyier	Standarone	4/1/2010	Ne. Sumvan V. 13 Omeea	caronic oyier	Jill L. Miller; Rodney Harrison; Dough Stephens; Becky Gwarjanski	Actionicy chefit communication	documents.	
371	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	4/12/2016	Re: Domino's Pizza wrongful-death lawsuit ends with \$10M jury award	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Keeta fox; Connie Houston; Amber McNew; David Orberson; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding industry lawsuits.	
372	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	4/13/2016	Re: whistleblower hotline complaint	Caroline Oyler	Debbie Tate; Clara Passafiume; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding communication.	
373	Caroline Oyler	Parent	4/15/2016	Fwd: ERM - Food Safety Update	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Debbie Tate; Sean Muldoon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
374	Caroline Oyler	Parent	4/18/2016	Fw: ERM presentation for Audit Cmt Meeting	Caroline Oyler	Kim Girdler; Debbie Tate; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
375	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	4/22/2016	Re: Trial Report 4/18/16 Glenda Williams v Robert Pollard and PaPa John's International Day 1(one)	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Peter Collins; Chase Deits; Francesca Herman; Terri Enayati; David Orberson; bhargret@comcast.net	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	
376	Caroline Oyler	Parent	5/5/2016	*Confidential: Fw: May FAC Agenda & Pre Reads 1 of 2	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Keeta Fox; John Matter; Daniel Waddell; Toni Capito; Stevie Ritchie; Simon Smith; Nadeem Bajwa; Robert Carroll; Keith Sullins; Bill Freitas; Vaughn Frey; Dougie Allen; Tina Glover; Philip Horn; Bill Green; Joseph Hogue; Rick Mohler; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Wade Oney; Eric Murphy; Tim O'Hern; Lance Tucker; Cynthia McClellen; Robert Smith; Shane Hutchins; Sean Muldoon; Robert Thompson; Edmond Heelan; Jack Swaysland; Robin Kennedy; Kim Girdler; Sharry Russell; Melinda Lutz; Kimberly Keller; Shannon Baete; Liz Essen; Peggy Bentley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communications and documents, with attachments.	
377	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	5/13/2016	Re: Fw: New lawsuits in NY and FL	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Tammy Rhodus; Eric Todd	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
378	Caroline Oyler	Parent	5/16/2016	FAC minutes	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Debbie Tate	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication and documents, with attachments.	
379	Caroline Oyler	Parent	5/16/2016	Fw: FAC Meeting Minutes	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Shane Hutchins; Edmond Heelan; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon; Simon Smith Cc: Toni Capito; Melinda Lutz; Kimberly Keller; Liz Essen	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication and documents, with attachments.	
380	Caroline Oyler			Fw: FAC Meeting Minutes	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Robert Thomspon; Edmond Heelan; Kimberly Keller; Liz Essesn; Melinda Lutz; Sean Muldoon; Shane Hutchins; Simon Smith; Steve Ritchie; Toni Capito	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication and documents, with attachments.	
381	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	5/17/2016	Re: New lawsuits in NY and FL	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd; John Matter; Tammy Rhodus	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's legal strategy for potential claim.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 29 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
THE LOG #	Edmond Heelan		5/18/2016	Re: New overtime regs	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Billy	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding interpretation of wage	bates range (reducted bocaments)
			0, 20, 2020	announced		Higdon; Edmond Heelan; John Matter;	,	regulations.	
382						Lance Tucker; Robert Smith; Eric Todd			
	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	5/23/2016	Re: Mileage self-reporting -	Caroline Oyler	Susan Kinder; Edmond Heelan; John	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
383				franchisee idea		Matter; Caroline Oyler		financial policies and procedures.	
384	Caroline Oyler	Parent	5/24/2016	Re: News from NY	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Joan P. Sullivan	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding implications of industry	
			- / /					lawsuits, with attachments.	
385	Caroline Oyler	Parent	5/24/2016	Fw: News from NY	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Joan P. Sullivan; John	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding implications of industry	
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	5/24/2016	RE: Attorney-client	Caroline Oyler	Matter Caroline Oyler; Milton Marquis; April	Attorney-Client Communication	lawsuits, with attachments. Email seeking legal advice regarding implications of industry	
	Caroline Oyler	ratetit	3/24/2016	Privileged	Carollile Oylei	Corrigan; Bryan Mosca; Craig Benson;	Attorney-client communication	lawsuits, with attachments.	
386				Filvliegeu		John Cordo; John Matter; Kevin Vozzo;		lawsuits, with attachments.	
300						Daniel Waddell; notifications@owler.com	,		
						Same waden, normations growner com			
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	5/26/2016	Re: GES Invest / Enquiry	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Mike Measells; Robert	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investor	
387						Smith; Patrycja Kulinska		correspondence/question.	
	Caroline Oyler	Parent	5/26/2016	Fw: whistleblower hotline	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Simon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding brand standards	
388						Smith; Debbie Tate; Clara Passafiume		enforcement, with attachments.	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	5/26/2016	Fw: GES Invest / Enquiry	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker; Amber	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investor	
389						Mcnew; Clara Passafiume; Mike		correspondence/question.	
						Measells; Robert Smith; Patrycja Kulinska			
	Caralina Outan	Chandalana	F /2C /2016	Dan sakiaklahlannan baskina	Caralina Oulan	Caralina Ordan Cincar Corith Dabbia	Attanger Client Committee	Facility of the control of the contr	
390	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	5/26/2016	Re: whistleblower hotline	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Simon Smith; Debbie Tate; Clara Passafiume; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement.	
390						late, Clara Passanunie, John Watter		enforcement.	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	5/27/2016	Fwd: GES Invest / Enquiry	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clara Passafiume; Amber	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investor	
391				, , ,	,	Mcnew; Mike Measells; Robert Smith;	.,	correspondence/question.	
						Patrycja Kulinska			
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/1/2016	Fw: GES Invest / Enquiry	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clara Passafiume; Peter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investor	
392						Collins; Amber Mcnew; Lance Tucker;		correspondence/question.	
						Patrycja Kulinska			
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/1/2016	Re: GES Invest / Enquiry	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Peter Collins; Amber	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investor	
393						McNew; Lance Tucker; Patrycja Kulinska		correspondence/question.	
			- /- /						
394	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/3/2016	Re: GES Invest Inquiry	Caroline Oyler	Lance Tucker; John Matter; Clara	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor	
-	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/7/2016	Re: FW: Papa John's	Caroline Oyler	Passafiume; Caroline Oyler Caroline Oyler; Debbie Tate; Clara	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
395	Caroline Oyler	Standarone	0/7/2010	International Navex -	Caroline Oylei	Passafiume; EthicsPoint Support;	Attorney-client communication	Email providing regar advice regarding franchise matters.	
393				whistleblower hotline		bpelham@navexglobal.com			
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/8/2016	Fwd: Legal Issues Arise As	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Peter Collins; John	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
396			., .,	Young Hotel Industry		Matter; Hospitality Law360	,	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
				Consolidates					
397	Caroline Oyler	Parent	6/8/2016	Fwd: I think this is it	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Clara	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or	
397						Passafiume		compliance efforts, with attachments.	
398	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/9/2016	Re: prehire checklist	Caroline Oyler	Andy Freitas; John Matter; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft language and	
330								policy.	
399	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/13/2016	NRF Amicus Brief on Joint	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Lance	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor	
			-11	Employer		Tucker; Robert Smith; John Matter		issues.	
	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/15/2016	Re: Attorney-client	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Beth	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
400				privilege		Horlander; Billy Higdon; Shannon Burke;		financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
						Carmine Cappuccio; Rebecca Meyrick			
L				1		<u> </u>	1	1	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 30 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
401	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/15/2016	Re: Update on mileage program	Caroline Oyler	Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
402	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/23/2016	Re: Wage hour and mileage - Florida - Worthington	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Rob Porter; Matt Studer	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	
403	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/26/2016	Re: Wage hour and mileage - Florida - Worthington	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Rob Porter; Bobby Meroney; Matt Studer	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	
404	Caroline Oyler	Parent	6/27/2016	Fw: Materials for ERM Team meeting - Tuesday; June 28 at 11 am	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Debbie Tate; Robert Smith; Joe Smith; Dustin Couts; Billy Higdon; Randy Lawrence; Tim Newton; Peter Collins; Paul Johnson; Mary Miller; David Orberson; Clara Passaflume; Clark Spader; Jamie Youngblood	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
405	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	6/29/2016	Re: Worthington PJ	Caroline Oyler	Eric Todd; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding conflicts.	
406	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/1/2016	Fw: Q2 litigation summary	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Robin Kennedy; John Matter; Brian Ketterer; Tammy Rhodus	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
407	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/6/2016	Re: Q2 2016 Litigation Summary CLEAN.doc	Caroline Oyler	Keeta Fox; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Brian Ketterer	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
408	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/6/2016	Re: Q2 2016 Litigation Summary CLEAN.doc	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Keeta Fox; John Matter; Brian Ketterer	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
409	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/14/2016	FW: Let's make every Papa John's a PokeStop	Julia McGuffey	Julia McGuffey; Caroline Oyler; Amy Mudge; Leah Schultz; Bernie Fussenegger; Maya Steeves; Amy Nicholson; Celeste Stevens; Christy Johnson; Brett Campbell; Ghazi Sodhum; Marvis Rothman; Kanaiya Kansara; Hassan Nasser; cheka@executivemediacommunications. com; Richard Schragger; Ajay Choudhary; Fani Ghulam; Steve Waunsch; Bianca Phillips; Nelson Hertzog; Bo Czyz; Michael Bobys; Michele Ezell; barbara@executivemediacommunication s.com; Mike Rothbard; Scott Durigg; John Low; Jeff Williams; Eduardo Cruz; Steve Colbert; Peter Mihelich; Don Ceccarelli; Sultan Lakhani; Arafat Saleh		Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 31 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
410	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/14/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 14; 2016 - draft for review / approval jm		Internal Communications; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards- Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thomson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Colllins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
411	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/17/2016	Re: Q2 2016 Litigation Summary CLEAN.doc	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Keeta Fox; Brian Ketterer	Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
412	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/17/2016	Fwd: Q2 2016 Litigation Summary CLEAN.doc	Caroline Oyler	Kim Girdler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Keeta Fox; Brian Ketterer	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
413	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/17/2016	Fwd: Large Claim Cases	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; John Matter; Keeta Fox; Brian Ketterer	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
414	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/17/2016	Re: Large Claim Cases	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Keeta Fox; Brian Ketterer	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
415	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/17/2016	Fwd: Press Release Draft		Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Amber McNew; Brian Ketterer; Clara Passafiume; Clark Spader, Joe Smith; Adam Hack; Craig Marshall; Katie Hunter; Lance Tucker; Keeta Fox	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
416	Caroline Oyler	Parent	7/19/2016	RE: Large Claim Cases	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Keeta Fox; Brian Ketterer	Product	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
417	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/22/2016	Fwd: \$6M Deal OK'd; Ends 18K Pizza Hut Workers' Wage Claims	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding implications of industry lawsuits.	
418	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/2/2016	Re: Privileged		Dustin Couts; Vladimir Brikker; Susan Kinder; Janet Goodman; John Matter; Bobbi Stewart; John Smith; Edmond Heelan; Michael Nettles; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
419	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/2/2016	RE: Privileged		Susan Kinder; John Matter; Dustin Couts; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Edmond Heelan; Janet Goodman; John Smith; Michael Nettles; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
420	,	Parent	8/2/2016	FW: Motus Update from 7- 29	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation, with attachments.	
421	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/2/2016	Re: Privileged	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Susan Kinder; Dustin Couts; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Edmond Heelan; Janet Goodman; John Smith; Michael Nettles	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 32 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
422	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/5/2016	FW: *Confidential: RE: Confidential/Privileged Communication	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Matthew Dumiak; Bernie Fussenegger; Celeste Stevens; Mackenzie Frerich; Jordan Eisner; Julia McGuffey	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
423	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/8/2016	RE: Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Susan Kinder; Dustin Couts; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Edmond Heelan; Janet Goodman; John Smith; Michael Nettles	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
424	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/11/2016	FAC Minutes	Kim Girdler	Kim Girdler; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
425	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/12/2016	RE: Updated Draft of Minutes	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
426	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/15/2016	Fwd: MSCI ESG Ratings Update for PAPA JOHN'S INTERNATIONAL; INC Data Review	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clara Passafiume; John Matter; Peter Collins; Allison Isakson; PapaJohns@edelman.com; Eleni Herrington; Mary Catherine Iles; Lyndsay Railey	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding potential media statement, with attachments.	
427	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/16/2016	FAC Meeting Minutes	Kim Girdler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
428	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/17/2016	RE: NMF Vote Memo; Revised 8/17	Daniel Waddell	Daniel Waddell; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and regarding draft legal document, with attachments.	
429	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/24/2016	Re: hotline complaint a zillion and three.one	Caroline Oyler	Debbie Tate; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation strategy for potential claim.	
430	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/24/2016	Re: hotline complaint a zillion and three.one	Caroline Oyler	Debbie Tate; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation strategy for potential claim.	
431	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/26/2016	RE: FAC minutes	Steve Ritchie	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Sean Muldoon; Shane Hutchins; Edmond Heelan; Steve Ritchie; Robert Thompson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
432	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/26/2016	FAC Meeting Minutes - August 2016 DRAFT	Shane Hutchins	Kim Girdler; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
433	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/29/2016	FW: New focus update	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Eddy Walker; Johanna South; POS Dev Requests; Jessica Akin; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir; Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim.	
434	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/30/2016	RE: Attorney-client privileged	Tammy Rhodus	Tammy Rhodus; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Eric Todd	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim, with attachments.	
435	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/30/2016	RE: Attorney-client privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Eric Todd; Tammy Rhodus; Carline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 33 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
436		Parent	8/30/2016	FW: Broadcast Communications for August 30; 2016 + Road Trip deck for review for today	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Daniel Waddell; Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Toni Capito; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Julia McGuffey; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	bates hange (neuacteu Ducuments)
437	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/30/2016	RE: Attorney-client privileged	Eric Todd	Eric Todd; John Matter; Tammy Rhouds; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim, with attachments.	
438	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/30/2016	Re: Attorney-client privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Eric Todd; Tammy Rhodus; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim, with attachments.	
439	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	8/30/2016	RE: Broadcast Communications for August 30; 2016 + Road Trip deck & NMF Vote bullet for today	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richerds-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Julia McGuffey; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Dan Waddell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
440	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/30/2016	FW: Thacker v. Papa John's Letter from EEOC	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Tammy Rhodus; Craig Benson; Ian Brown; Margaret Goff	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim, with attachments.	
441		Parent	8/30/2016	Re: Thacker v. Papa John's Letter from EEOC	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Tammy Rhodus; Craig Benson; Ian Brown; Margaret Goff	Product	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim, with attachments.	
442	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/31/2016	FAC Meeting Minutes	Kim Girdler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
443	Caroline Oyler			FW: MSCI ESG Ratings Update for PAPA JOHN'S INTERNATIONAL; INC Data Review	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Clara Passafiume; esg_corporate_communications@msci.c om; Robin Kennedy; Ken Cox; Debbie Wood	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
444		Parent	9/1/2016	FAC Meeting Minutes	Kim Girdler	Kim Girdler; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
445	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/2/2016	RE: New focus update	John Matter	John Matter; Jamie Youngblood; Caroline Oyler; Eddy Walker; Johanna South; Jessica Akin; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 34 of 141

Print Lag 2 Contribution Parent December 1 Propert December 2 Decem										
Autor Auto	Priv Log #		•							Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
Caroline Oyler Parent 9,5%2006 Will AC Searching Minorate Country Country Language Country Cou		caronnic Oyler	raiciic	3/2/2010		ciara i assurante		Actorney chefit communication		
Caroline Opter Parent 9,502/016. No. FAC Meeting Minutes Spages required by most feedings (9,10/16) on the feedings (9,10/	446								·	
Caroline Oyler Parent 9/9/2016					Data Review					
## Responser requested by each Userday, 59/12 Control (apr.) Encountry (apr.) Control		Caroline Ovler	Parent	9/6/2016	FW: FAC Meeting Minutes	Kim Girdler		Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to	
Dougle After Communication to Control, possph year, before Mounts, particular Minimum, Indicom Region, Particular Months (Minimum, Indicom Region, Particular Months), Minimum, Indicom Region, Particular Months, Minimum, Indicom Region, Min										
Caroline Oyler Standalone 488 Caroline Oyler Standalone 598/2016 Proc. 1 Pr					eob Tuesday; 9/6/16					
Monthers Naturency, National Naturency, Client Communication Physical Research Person Palaus, Pick Modelle, Standard Oriey Standardore 9/8/7016 Parent Standardore 9/8/7016 Research Special Naturency, National Naturency, Client Communication National Richards Person Palaus Displays Internet Naturency, Client Communication National Naturency, Client Communicatio										
Caroline Oyler Standalone	447						-			
Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/6/2016 Fived Broadcast Communication for content Standalone 9/6/2016 Fived Broadcast Communication for content Standalone 9/6/2016 Fived Broadcast Communication for content Standalone Standalone 9/6/2016 Fived Broadcast Communication for content Standalone Standalone Standalone 9/6/2016 Fived Broadcast Communication for content Standalone Standalone 9/7/2016 Fived Broadcast Standalone 9/7/2016 Fiv										
Caroline Oyler Standalone										
Waddell, Jule Modery Communications for September 5, 2015 - For review / approval 448 449 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/1/2016 RE: Admonshment Letter John Matter Gardine Oyler, Parent 9/1/2016 RE: Admonshment Letter John Matter Caroline Oyler, For Standalone 9/1/2016 RE: Admonshment Letter Tale Caroline Oyler, For Standalone 9/1/2016 RE: Admonshment Letter Tale Caroline Oyler, For Standalone 9/1/2016 RE: Admonshment Letter Tale Caroline Oyler, For Standalone 9/1/2016 RE: Admonshment Letter Tale Caroline Oyler, For Standalone 9/1/2016 RE: Admonshment Letter Tale Caroline Oyler, For Standalone 9/1/2016 RE: Admonshment Letter Tale Caroline Oyler, For Standalone 9/1/2016 RE: Admonshment Letter Tale Caroline Oyler, For Standalone 9/1/2016 RE: Drivers road hours Vaughn Frey Caroline Oyler, For Standalone 9/1/2016 RE: Drivers road hours Carolin							Vaughn Frey; Wade Oney			
Melloss Richards-Person, Part Dungan; review / approval Melloss Richards-Person, Part Dungan; Bill Cox Christly Johnson Lane Tucker, Robert Thompsor, John Matter; Shane Huckriss, Robert Santis-Sea Muldoon; Comine Houstor; In Newton; John Smith, Don Graham, Peter Golfins; Anne Richards Dullon, Caroline College Anne Richards Dullon, Robert Santis-Sea Muldoon; Comine Robert Santis-Sea Muldoon; Comine Robert Santis-Sea Muldoon; Comine Golfer Parent 449 Caroline Oyler Sandalone 9/7/2015 Rt. Admonishment Letter John Matter Caroline Oyler Parent 9/8/2015 Orbers road hours Vaught Frey Vaugh		Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/6/2016	Fwd: Broadcast	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Daniel	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to	
SBII Cox, Christry, Johnson, Lance Tucker, Robert Thompsor, Solid Harty, Shane Muldoon; Connier House, Thompsor, Solid Harty, Shan Muldoon; Connier House, Thompsor, Solid Harty, Shane Muldoon; Connier House, The Marker, Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connier House, The Marker, Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connier House, The Marker, Sean Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connier House, Shandalone Smith; Don Garlian; Risk Garlian, Such Harty, Sean Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sea									be sent to third parties.	
Robert Thomposity John Matter; Shane Hutdorits; Robert Shane Muldoon; Connie Houton; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Poter Collins; Mitchelle Heffernan; Mitchele Othern; Amerischerp Dustin Contine Houton; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Pote Collins; Mitchelle Heffernan; Mitchele Othern; Amerischerp Dustin Contine Houton; Tim Newton; John Mitchele Othern; Amerischerp Dustin Contine Matthews, Bernie Fuserger; Tonl Capito; Sim Gridler 449 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/7/2016 RE: Adminishment Letter John Matter Garoline Oyler; John Frey 450 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/8/2016 Orivers road hours Vaughn Frey; Caroline Oyler; John Frey; Attorney-Client Communication Time seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to the event to Third parties. 451 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/8/2016 FW: New focus update John Matter; Caroline Oyler; John Frey 452 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/8/2016 FW: New focus update John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Standalone 9/8/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter; Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter; Standalone Oyler; Oyler Fore Continual Caroline Oyler; Oyler Oyler; Standalone Oyler; Standalone Oyler; Standalone Oyler; Standalone Oyler; St										
Hutchins, Sebert Smith; Saam Audidons; Comine Houston: The Newton; John Smith; Soam Audidons; Michiele Offern; Anne Rischer, Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Extername, Jenerical Houston, Matthews, Berne Fuscienegger, Total Cappulor, Minimizer of Hard Houston, Matthews, Berne Fuscienegger, Total Cappulor, Minimizer of Hard Houston, Matthews, Berne Fuscienegger, Total Cappulor, Minimizer of Hard Houston, Matthews, Berne Fuscienegger, Total Cappulor, Minimizer of Hard Houston, Matthews, Berne Fuscienegger, Total Cappulor, Matthews, Matthew					review / approvai					
Mintly Don Graham, Peter Collins, Michael Heffers, Servin Mathews, Bernie Fussenegger, Toni Captio, Kim Girdler 449 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/7/2016 RE: Admonishment Letter John Matter Captio, Kim Girdler 450 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/8/2016 Drivers road hours Vaughn Frey Mayth Frey, Caroline Oyler; John Frey Attorney-Client Communication be sent to third parties. 451 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/8/2016 PW: New focus update John Matter John Matter (Caroline Oyler; John Matter) John Matter (Caroline Oyler) John Matte										
Michele Offency anne Fischer, Dustin Cost; Rith Buller; Anne Fischer, Dustin Matther Attorney-Client Communication Caroline Oyler Parent 9/8/2016 Drivers road hours Vaughn Frey Vaughn Frey Vaughn Frey Valler, Johanna South; Jessica Aktiv, Bobbl Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Jason Smith; Yakhar Sione Attorney-Client Communication Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/12/2016 RE: Drivers road hours Caroline Oyler Vaughn Frey; John Frey Attorney-Client Communication Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/12/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter John Matter Caroline Oyler Vaughn Frey; John Frey Attorney-Client Communication Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/12/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter John Matter John Matter; Eddy Walker; Johanna South; Jessica Aktiv, Bobbl Stewart; Valdmir Brikker; Jason Smith; Yakhar Slone Attorney-Client Communication Final seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding Papa John's cor	***									
Anner Eicher; Dustin Cours; Rich Buller; Eric Hartman; Jennier Hartris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler 449 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/7/2016 RE: Admonishment Letter John Matter Letter 1 John Matter Caroline Oyler; John Frey Naughn Frey: Vaughn Frey Caroline Oyler; John Frey Attorney-Client Communication Letter 1 John Matter Caroline Oyler; John Frey Attorney-Client Communication Letter 1 John Matter Caroline Oyler; John Frey Naughn Frey: Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter Letter 1 John Matter Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter Letter 1 John Matter Caroline Oyler; Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Eddy Walker; Johanna South; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Eddy Walker; Johanna South; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Actorney-Client Communication Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter Inmail specifies and procedures regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding Papa John	448									
Matthews, Bernie Fussenegger; Tool Capitor, Kim Girgler 449 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/7/2015 RE: Admonishment Letter John Matter 450 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/8/2016 Orivers road hours Vaughn Frey: Vaughn Frey: Caroline Oyler; John Frey Walker; Johnsona South; Jessica Akin; Bobb Stewart; Valudinin Brikker; Jason Smith, Mark Sone 451 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/8/2016 RE: Drivers road hours Caroline Oyler Vaughn Frey; Caroline Oyler; John Matter 452 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/9/2/2016 RE: Drivers road hours Caroline Oyler Vaughn Frey; John Frey Attorney-Client Communication 453 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/12/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter 454 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Attorney-Client Description Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter 455 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler Valquin Frey: John Frey Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler Valquin Frey: John Matter Standalone Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler Valquin Frey: John Matter Standalone Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler Valquin Frey: John Matter Standalone Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler Valquin Frey: John Matter Standalone Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler Oyler Valquin Frey: John Matter Standalone Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler John Matter Standalone Oyler Oyler Oyler Oyler Oyler Oyler Oyler Oyler Standalone Oy										
Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/7/2016 RE: Admonishment Letter John Matter Caroline Oyler, Daniel Waddeli; Debbie Attorney-Client Communication be sent to third parties. Caroline Oyler Parent 9/8/2016 Drivers road hours Vaughn Frey Vaughn Frey Caroline Oyler, John Frey Attorney-Client Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments. Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/8/2016 FW: New focus update John Matter John Matter John Matter, Caroline Oyler, Eddy Walker, Johanna South; Jessica Akin; Bobb I Stewart; Valdmini Friek, Parant John Matter Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/9/2016 RE: Leigh Faircioth John Matter Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/12/2016 RE: Leigh Faircioth John Matter Caroline Oyler, John Matter Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Attorney-Client Communication Indication In										
Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/7/2016 RE: Admonishment Letter John Matter Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Debbie Tate 450 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/8/2016 Drivers road hours Vaughn Frey Vaughn Frey Vaughn Frey Vaughn Frey Vaughn Frey Vaughn Frey Caroline Oyler; John Frey Attorney-Client Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments. 451 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/8/2016 FW: New focus update John Matter Walker; Johnna South; Jessica Akin; Sobbi Stewart; Vaudimir Brikker; Jason Simity, Mark Slone 452 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/9/2016 RE: Drivers road hours Caroline Oyler Vaughn Frey; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Garoline Oyler; John Matter; Ga										
Associated by the communication Asso							Capito, Kiiii Girdiei			
Associated by the communication Asso				- /- /						
Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/8/2016 FW: New focus update John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Eddy Walker; Johanna South; Jessica Akln; Babbi Stewart; Valdmiri Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone 452 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/9/2016 RE: Drivers road hours Caroline Oyler Vaught Frey; John Matter; Carmine Capoucio Caroline Oyler; Eddy Walker; Johanna South; Jessica Akln; Babbi Stewart; Valdmiri Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone 453 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter Caroline Oyler; Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Carmine Capoucio Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Attorney-client Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 456 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler, John Matter; Caroline Oyler, John Attorney-Client Communication Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 457 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/15/2016 Re: Arbitration Agreement John Matter John Matter; Caroline Oyler, John Attorney-Client Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corpora	449	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/7/2016	RE: Admonishment Letter	John Matter	*	Attorney-Client Communication		
Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/8/2016 FW: New focus update John Matter Walker; Johanna South; Jessica Aklin; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth Privileged Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler John Matter Such South; Jessica Aklin; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone Re: Leigh Faircloth John Matter Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter Such South; Jessica Aklin; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Johanna South; Jessica Aklin; Bobbi St		Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/8/2016	Drivers road hours	Vaughn Frey	Vaughn Frey; Caroline Oyler; John Frey	Attorney-Client Communication		
Walker; Johanna South; Jessica Akin; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone 452 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/9/2016 RE: Drivers road hours Caroline Oyler Vaughn Frey; John Matter 453 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/12/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Carmine Cappucio 454 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Attorney-Client Domain Matter Standalone Privileged John Matter John Matter; Eddy Walker; Johanna South; Jessica Akin; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone 455 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler John Matter; Caroline Oyler John Matter; Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler John Matter; Caroline Oyler John Matter; Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler John Matter Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 455 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Attorney-Client Communication Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 457 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/15/2016 Re: Arbitration Agreement John Matter; Orion Stelle; Caroline Oyler; Attorney-Client Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	450								financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone 452 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/9/2016 RE: Drivers road hours Caroline Oyler Vaughn Frey; John Frey 453 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/12/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter 454 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Attorney-client Dohn Matter; Carmine Cappucio 455 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler John Matter; Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler John Matter; Caroline Oyler Matter; Caroline Oyler Matter; Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler John Matter; Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler John Matter; Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Susan Kinder Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; Attorney-Client Communication Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 457 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/15/2016 RE: Arbitration Agreement John Matter John Matter Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; Attorney-Client Communication Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with		Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/8/2016	FW: New focus update	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Eddy	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
Smith; Mark Slone 452 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/9/2016 RE: Drivers road hours Caroline Oyler Vaughn Frey; John Frey Attorney-Client Communication Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters. 453 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/12/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Carmine Cappucio 454 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Attorney-Client Dohn Matter Standalone Privileged 455 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler Oyler Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 457 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/15/2016 RE: Arbitration Agreement John Matter John Ma	451								financial policies and procedures.	
Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/9/2016 RE: Drivers road hours Caroline Oyler Vaughn Frey; John Frey Attorney-Client Communication Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters. Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/12/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Carmine Cappucio Attorney-Client Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation. Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Attorney-Client Privileged John Matter John Matter; Eddy Walker; Johanna South; Jessica Akin; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone financial policies and procedures regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding employment and labor issues. Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler John Matter; Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler;										
Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/12/2016 RE: Leigh Faircloth John Matter Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Carmine Cappucio Attorney-Client Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 456 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter 457 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/15/2016 RE: Arbitration Agreement John Matter John Matter Garoline Oyler; John Matter; Carmine Attorney-Client Communication Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 458 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/15/2016 RE: Arbitration Agreement John Matter John Matter John Matter; Carmine Attorney-Client Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 459 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/15/2016 RE: Arbitration Agreement John Matter John Matter: John Matter John Matter; Attorney-Client Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with	452	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/9/2016	RE: Drivers road hours	Caroline Oyler		Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
Cappucio financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation. Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Attorney-client Privileged John Matter John Matter South; Jessica Akin; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone 454 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler John Matter; Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler John Matter Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler John Matter Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter Susan Kinder Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter Susan Kinder Susan Kin	432	Caralias Out	Chandalana	0/12/2015	DC: Leich Ceireleth	Inha Massa.	Constitut Outer John Matter Co. 1	Attanan Client Commission	Enail and the land adding an adding Days Jakel	
Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/13/2016 RE: Attorney-client Privileged South; Jessica Akin; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone 4 Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler Oyler, John Matter Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler Oyler, Attorney-Client Communication Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 456 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter Susan Kinder Susan K	453	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/12/2016	RE: Leigh Faircloth	John Matter	*	Attorney-Client Communication		
454 Privileged South; Jessica Akin; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone financial policies and procedures regarding employment and labor issues. 455 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Oyler Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler, John Matter, Jason Smith; Mark Slone Attorney-Client Communication Financial policies and procedures regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 456 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter 457 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/15/2016 Re: Arbitration Agreement John Matter John Matter; Chris Stelle; Caroline Oyler; Attorney-Client Communication Financial policies and procedures regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 458 Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 459 Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 450 Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with	133						Саррасло		manetal policies and procedures regarding rate calculations	
Vladimir Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone labor issues. 455 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler Oyler Oyler Oyler Oyler Oyler Standalone Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter Oyler, Attorney-Client Communication Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 456 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder Susan Kinder Susan Kinder Oyler; John Matter Oyler; Attorney-Client Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with		Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/13/2016		John Matter	-	Attorney-Client Communication		
455 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler Oyler Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 RE: Driver road hours Caroline Oyler Oyler Oyler Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Attorney-Client Communication Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 456 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Attorney-Client Communication Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 457 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/15/2016 RE: Arbitration Agreement John Matter John Matter; Chris Stelle; Caroline Oyler; Attorney-Client Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with	454				Privileged					
456 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter 456 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter Susan Kinder Susan Kinder Susan Kinder Susan Kinder Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter Susan Kinder Susan							Vidaniii Brikker, Jason Silikii, Mdrk Sione		10001 133003.	
456 Caroline Oyler Standalone 9/15/2016 Re: Driver road hours Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler; John Matter 457 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/15/2016 RE: Arbitration Agreement John Matter Stelle; Caroline Oyler; Attorney-Client Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 458 Examinating Discussional Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 459 Examinating Discussional Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 450 Examinating Discussional Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 457 Examinating Discussional Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 458 Examinating Discussional Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 459 Examinating Discussional Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 450 Examinating Discussional Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 450 Examinating Discussional Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 451 Examinating Discussional Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 452 Examinating Discussional Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures. 453 Examinating Discussional Papa John's Corporate financial policies and procedures. 454 Examinating Discussional Papa John's Corporate financial policies and procedures. 455 Examinating Discussional Papa John's Corporate financial policies and procedures. 456 Examinating Discussional Papa John's Corporate financial policies and procedures. 457 Examinating Discussional Papa John's Corporate financial policies and procedures. 458 Examinating Discussional Papa John's Corporate financial policies and procedures. 459 Examinating Discussional Papa John's Corporate financial policies and procedures. 450 Examinating Discussional Papa John's Corporate financial Papa John's Corporate financial Papa John's Corporate financial Papa John's Corporate financial Papa John'	455	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/15/2016	RE: Driver road hours	Caroline Oyler		Attorney-Client Communication		
436 Matter financial policies and procedures. 457 Caroline Oyler Parent 9/15/2016 RE: Arbitration Agreement John Matter John Matter John Matter John Matter Attorney-Client Communication Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with	-	Caroline Ovler	Standalone	9/15/2016	Re: Driver road hours	Susan Kinder		Attorney-Client Communication		
	456						Matter	·	financial policies and procedures.	
I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I	457	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/15/2016	RE: Arbitration Agreement	John Matter		Attorney-Client Communication		
Caroling Oyler Standalone 9/17/2016 RF: Driver road hours Vaughn Frey Vaughn Frey Caroling Oyler John Frey Attorney Client Communication Fmail providing legal advice regarding Page John's cornorate		Caroline Ovler	Standalone	9/17/2016	RE: Drivers road hours	Vaughn Frev		Attorney-Client Communication		
458 Caroline Office Statistical	458			.,,			2,2,7,2,2,3,1,7,2,1,7,1,7	,		

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 35 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
459	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/19/2016	Fwd: Updated Motus Rates Report	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Jason Hudson; Shannon Burke	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
460	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/19/2016	Intro slides for mileage discussion	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Billy Higdon		Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
461	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/19/2016	FW: Updated Motus Rates Report	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Jason Hudson; Shannon Burke	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	
462	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/19/2016	RE: Driver road hours	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Susan Kinder	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
463	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/20/2016	FW: Papa John's adv. Gordon	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Tammy Rhodus; Dana Salmonson; Anthony Martin; Eric Todd; Sarah Griffin; Mindy Warner	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim.	
464	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/20/2016	FW: ERM	Caroline Oyler	Kim Girdler; Debbie Tate; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, regarding compliance efforts, with attachments.	
465	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/21/2016	PJ lowa driver case	Eric Todd	Eric Todd; Caroline Oyler; John Matters	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
466	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/21/2016	Fwd: Attorney Client Privilege - FOCUS Duplicate Tip Issue.docx	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Connie Houston; Paul Schork; Claude Phenix; Susan Kinder; Lea Anne Cundiff; Bobbi Stewart; David Orberson; Kristie Scott	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft document/communication.	
467	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/21/2016	Drivosity policies	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Kristie Scott, Craig Jones; Brian Moroney	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and regarding draft policies/documents, with attachments.	
468	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/21/2016	ERM top risks	Debbie Tate	Debbie Tate; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and compliance issues, with attachments.	
469	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/22/2016	RE: backwage settlement	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Marilyn Sainlar; Tina Faircloth; Karen Maxfield; Tammy Rhodus	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communications to be sent to third parties and regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
470	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/22/2016	Thacker	John Matter	John Matter; Craig Benson; Tammy Rhodus; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication, with attachments.	
471	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/26/2016	RE: Drivosity policies	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Mater; Kristie Scott; Craig Jones; Brian Moroney	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
472	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/27/2016	RE: Scheduling Meetings	Kim Girdler	Kim Girdler; Caroline Oyler; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
473	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	9/29/2016	RE: Broadcast Communications for September 29; 2016 - for review / approval	John Matter	John Matter; Carolyn Oyler; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 36 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
474		Standalone	9/29/2016	RE: Drivosity policies	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Kristie Scott; Craig Jones; Brian Moroney		Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and drafts of same.	bates range (neuacteu bucuments)
475	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/3/2016	Re: Mapquest Mileage	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Bobbie Stewart; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; David Bratcher; Johanna South; Jessica Akin	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
476	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/3/2016	Re: Mapquest Mileage	Caroline Oyler	Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Bobbie Stewart; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; David Bratcher; Johanna South; Jessica Akin	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
477	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/3/2016	Re: Mapquest Mileage	Caroline Oyler	Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Bobbie Stewart; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; David Bratcher; Johanna South; Jessica Akin	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
478	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/5/2016	FW: whistleblower hotline	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Debbie Tate; Clara Passafiume; Chuck Simon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
479	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/5/2016	Re: Labor Hours Report	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Dustin Couts; Shawn Mayer; Chuck Simon; Adam Smith; Mark McCormack; Field Systems Help Desk; Internal Communications	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and draft talking points.	
480	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	10/5/2016	Re: Labor Hours Report	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Dustin Couts; Shawn Mayer; Chuck Simon; Adam Smith; Mark McCormack; Field Systems Help Desk; Internal Communications	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and draft talking points.	
481	Don Ceccarelli	Parent	9/1/2015	Fw: Acme Pizza (store #4233)	Don Ceccarelli	Daniel Waddell; Kim Girdler; Scott Durigg; Peter Mihelich	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters and brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	
482	Don Ceccarelli	Parent	9/2/2015	Fw: Acme Pizza (store #4233)	Don Ceccarelli	John Low; Don Ceccarelli; Dan Waddell; Kim Girdler; Scott Durigg; Peter Mihelich	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters and brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	
483	Scott Durigg	Standalone	11/13/2015	Re: Attorney-client Privileged.	Don Ceccarelli	Don Ceccarelli; John Matter; Scott Durigg; Steve Colbert; Daniel Waddell; Kim Winebrenner; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Matt Vannot; Jeanne Jefferson; John Low; Jeff Williams	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communications.	
484	Don Ceccarelli	Standalone	11/13/2015	Re: Attorney-client Privileged.	John Matter	Don Ceccarelli; John Matter; Scott Durigg; Steve Colbert; Daniel Waddell; Kim Winebrenner; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Matt Van Note; Jeanne Jefferson; John Low; Jeff Williams		Email providing legal advice regarding draft communications.	
485	Don Ceccarelli	Parent	1/29/2016	Fw: ZOOMER Syracuse ADI	Don Ceccarelli	Don Ceccarelli; Jason Wade; Scott Durigg; Brad Jones; Steve Ritchie; John Schnatter; Tim O'Hearn; Bo Czyz; Peter Mihelich; Nadeem Bajwa	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	DURLING-PJI 355029 - DURLING-PJI 355030

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 37 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
486	Don Ceccarelli	Standalone	2/4/2016	Re: GoFundMe okay ?	Peter Collins	Michele Ezell Julia McGuffey; Lyndsay Railey; Peter Collins; Don Ceccarelli; Tristan Nelson; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
487	Don Ceccarelli	Standalone	2/4/2016	Re: GoFundMe okay ?	Julia McGuffey	Julia McGuffey Peter Collins; Michele Ezell; Don Ceccarelli; Lyndsay Railey; Tristan Nelson; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
488	Don Ceccarelli	Standalone	2/4/2016	FYI - Fw: GoFundMe okay ?	Michele Ezell	Julia McGuffey Peter Collins; Michele Ezell; Don Ceccarelli; Lyndsay Railey; Tristan Nelson; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
489	Don Ceccarelli	Child	9/21/2016	P9 Webcast.pdf	Darryl Carr		Attorney-Client Communication	Document containing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	DURLING-PJI 356078 - DURLING-PJI 356124
490	Edmond Heelan	Parent	8/14/2015	Fw: Safety Verbiage - Texting While Operating Motor Vehicle	Craig Jones	John Matter; Edmond Heelan; Danette Rhoads; Dustin Couts; Craig Jones	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, and regarding draft language with attachments.	
491	Edmond Heelan	Parent	9/11/2015	Fw: Luntz report	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; Rich Butler; Caroline Oyler; Dustin Couts; Robert Smith; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication; Attorney Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
492	Edmond Heelan	Parent	10/3/2015	Fw: FAC Weekly Communication 9/4/2015- DRAFT ANSWERS	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; Steve Ritchi; Simon Smith; Sean Muldoon; Mary Miller; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Christy Johnson; Toni Capito; Dustin Couts; Jason Wade; Paul W. Robinson; Bill Freitas; Bill Green; Clark Mandigo; David Rothman; Dougie Allen; Eric Murphy; Joseph Hogue; Keith Sullins; Lamont Muchmore; Lee Carroll; Nadeem Bajwa; Philip Horn; Rick Mohler; Tina Glover; Vaughn Frey; Wade Oney	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication with attachments.	
493	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	10/8/2015	Fwd: Pizza Tracker	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; Christy Johnson; Anne Fischer; Cynthia McClellen; Caroline Oyler; Mark Nance; Robert Thompson; Steve Ritchie; Susan Kinder	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
494	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	10/27/2015	Fw: Pizza Tracker	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; Christy Johnson; Anne Fischer; Cynthia McClellen; Caroline Oyler; Mark Nance; Robert Thompson; Steve Ritchie; Susan Kinder; Dustin Couts	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
495	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	12/17/2015	Re: Investigation	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication; Attorney Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim.	
496	Edmond Heelan	Child	12/5/2015	gostweeklynotes.docx	Jay Allen		Attorney-Client Communication	Document reflecting legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts.	DURLING-PJI 356439 - DURLING-PJI 356441
497	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	1/16/2016	Re: Mileage Reimbursement - Dorsch of JNE	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler; Rob Porter; Jason Wade; Craig Jones; John Matter; Jordan Dorsch	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and regarding content of communications of same.	
498	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	1/21/2016	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged.	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; Jason Wade; Rich Butler; John Matter; Dustin Couts; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Caroline Oyler; Simon Smith; Chris Titshaw	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 38 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
499	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	3/13/2016	Re: Broadcast Communications for January 19; 2016 - + P1-2 eCRM; for review / approval	Edmond Heelan	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jenniffer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
500	Edmond Heelan		3/23/2016	Re: Fw: Q4 Smart Routing Data	Edmond Heelan	Robert Nelson; John Matter; Edmond Heelan; Rebecca Durica	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
501	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	5/4/2016	Re: Privileged	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; John Matter; Rich Butler; Dustin Couts; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resources issues.	
502	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	5/9/2016	Re: Broadcast Communications for April 12; 2016 - for review / approval	Edmond Heelan	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
503	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	5/11/2016	Re: FAC dinner and agenda	Toni Capito	Toni Capito; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
504	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	5/15/2016	Re: Incident at store 907	Peter Collins	Craig Jones; Cara VanCleave; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Kristie Scott; Michael Meche; Mike Smith; Shawn McMullen; Torri Harris; Peter Collins	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft media statement.	
505	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	5/17/2016	Re: Incident at store 907	Peter Collins	Craig Jones; Cara VanCleave; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Kristie Scott; Michael Meche; Mike Smith; Shawn McMullen; Torri Harris; Peter Collins	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft media statement.	
506	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	5/17/2016	Fw: Incident at 1466 on May 14th additional info.	Craig Jones	Christopher Aragon; Robert Nelson; Edmond Heelan; Michael Meche; Kristie Scott; Jason Moore; Peter Collins; John Matter; Cara VanCleave; Scott Carr	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft media statement.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 39 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
507	Edmond Heelan	Parent	5/20/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 17; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
508	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	5/23/2016	Re: Broadcast Communications for May 17; 2016 - for review / approval	Edmond Heelan	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
509	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	5/24/2016	Re: Customer demands compensation _ PJ Minnesota St#1222	Dennis Gerstner	Craig Jones; Dan Wilson; Edmond Heelan; Michael Meche; Scott Carr; John Matter; Peter Collins; Cara VanCleave; John Voller; Kenneth Cox; Dustin Couts; Kurt Gatterdam; Sherry Jenny	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
510	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	6/2/2016	Re: Fw: Mileage self- reporting - franchisee idea	Susan Kinder	Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Susan Kinder	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
511	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	6/2/2016	Re: Attorney-client Privileged	Rich Butler	Rich Butler; John Matter; Scott Durigg; Dustin Couts; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding implications of industry lawsuits.	
512	Edmond Heelan	Parent	6/2/2016	Re: Driver incident store 475	David Orberson	Craig Jones; Junior Tome; Bob Billman; Edmond Heelan; Michael Meche; Kristie Scott; Torri Harris; Peter Collins; John Matter; David Orberson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
513	Edmond Heelan	Parent	6/2/2016	Re: Driver incident store 475	David Orberson	Craig Jones; Junior Tome; Bob Billman; Edmond Heelan; Michael Meche; Kristie Scott; Torri Harris; Peter Collins; John Matter; David Orberson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resources matters, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 40 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
514	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	6/2/2016	Re: Driver incident store 475		David Orberson; Craig Jones; Bob Billman; Edmond Heelan; Michael Meche; Kristie Scott; Torri Harris; Peter Collins; John Matter; Junior Tome	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
515	Edmond Heelan	Parent		Broadcast Communications for June 2; 2016 - for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Joe Smith; Jason Wade	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
516	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	6/28/2016	Re: Driver incident store 475		David Orberson; Craig Jones; Junior Tome; Edmond Heelan; Michael Meche; Kristie Scott; Torri Harris; Peter Collins; John Matter; Bob Billman	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
517	Edmond Heelan	Parent	6/30/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 7; 2016		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 41 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
518	Edmond Heelan		7/5/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 28; 2016 - for review / approval	Internal Communications	Internal Communications; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Roger Cox; Candyce Jackson; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
519	Edmond Heelan	Parent	7/5/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 30; 2016 - for review / approval	Internal Communications	Internal Communications; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
520	Edmond Heelan	Parent	7/5/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 5; 2016 + Lunch special opt in with Peps flyers; for review / approval	Internal Communications	Internal Communications; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards- Person; Pat Dunigan, Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 42 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian Edmond Heelan	Parent/Child Parent	Date 7/7/2016	File Name/Subject Broadcast Communications for July 5; 2016 + baseball promo items & PapaLink outage; for review / approval	Author/From Internal Communications	Recipients Internal Communications; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards- Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Privilege Basis Attorney-Client Communication	Description Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
522	Edmond Heelan	Parent	7/7/2016	PRIVILEGE	Susan Kinder	Scott Smith; Bobbi Stewart; Vladimir Brikker; John Matter; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Jay Allen; Shawn Mayher; Johanna South	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
523	Edmond Heelan	Parent	7/9/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 7; 2016 - draft for review/approval jm	Internal Communications	Internal Communications; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards- Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Candyce Jackson; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
524	Edmond Heelan	Parent	8/21/2016	RE: Broadcast Communications for July 7; 2016 - draft for review/approval jm	Julie Morley	Jule Morley; Toni Capito; Edmond Heelan; Internal Communications; Steve Ritchie; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 43 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
525	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	8/21/2016	Re: Racial Slur in delivery remark	Peter Collins	Cara VanCleave; John Matter; Craig Jones; Lyndsay Railey; Jim Hartley; Mike Coomes; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Kristie Scott; Chuck Simon; Jason Wade; Leah Schultz	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding enforcement brand standards.	
526	Edmond Heelan	Parent	9/6/2016	National Promotion Policy Edits for Discussion	Christy Johnson	Robert Thompson; Edmond Heelan	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	DURLING-PJI 356570 - DURLING-PJI 356570
527	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	9/8/2016	RE: Incident	Scott Carr	Lynn McQuillen; John Matter Craig Jones; Kelly Barnard; Edmond Heelan; Michael Meche; Kristie Scott; Peter Collins; Cara VanCleave	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters and investigation of potential claim.	
528	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	10/3/2016	RE: Attorney-client Privileged	Susan Kinder	Bobbi Stewart; Edmond Heelan; Susan Kinder; Johanna South; Eddy Walker; POS Dev Requests; Jessica Akin; Vladimir Brikker; Jason Smith; Mark Slone	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
529	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	10/12/2016	Re: Mapquest Mileage	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Billy Higdon; Bobbi Stewart; Jason Wade; Jay Allen; David Bratcher; Johanna South; Jessica Akin	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
530	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	10/17/2016	Re: M FAMILY INC Store 3339 Request to close for 1 Day		Edmond Heelan; Daniel Waddell; Scott Durigg; Nelson Hertzog; Clark Spader; Dustin Couts; Simon Smith; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Sharon Layman; Debbie Minch; Brenda Wells	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement.	
531	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	10/19/2016	Re: M FAMILY INC Store 3339 Request to close for 1 Day	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; Daniel Waddell; Scott Durigg; Nelson Hertzog; Clark Spader; Dustin Couts; Simon Smith; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Sharon Layman; Debbie Minch; Brenda Wells	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement.	
532	Edmond Heelan	Parent	8/22/2016	FW: Franchise Operator Payroll Data Communication	John Smith	John Smith; Edmond Heelan; Roger Cox; John Matter; Lea Anne Cundiff; Bobbi Stewart; Susie Hjermstad; Susan Kinder; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
533	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	9/21/2016	RE: Attorney-client Privileged	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Billy Higdon; Dustin Couts; David Bratcher; Jay Allen; Shawn Mayher; Johanna South; Darron Colwick; Eddy Walker	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
534	Scott Durigg	Parent		FW: Interview Guide for FBDs		Don Ceccarelli; Jeff Williams; John Low; Nelson Hertzog; Steve Colbert; Joni Dalton; Scott Durigg; Rick Thompson; Mike Coomes; Bobby Meroney; Joe Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding draft communication and draft document, with attachments.	
535	John Low	Child	10/19/2016	P10 Webcast 10.19.16v2.pdf	Darryl Carr		Attorney-Client Communication	Document reflecting legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts.	DURLING-PJI 356794 - DURLING-PJI 356835

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 44 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
536	Nelson Hertzog	Parent	6/19/2015	RE: AMHC Food; Inc. (Store #3451) - Insurance Default Letter sent 8/1/2016	Nelson Hertzog	Scott Durigg; Brenda Reynolds; Kim Winebrenner; Steve Ritchie; Daniel Waddell; Nelson Hertzog; Marilyn Ecker; Simon Smith; David Orberson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	
537	Nelson Hertzog	Standalone	5/14/2015	RE: Closure for Muslim Holiday	Daniel Waddell	Nelson Hertzog; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement and interpretation of legal document.	
538	Nelson Hertzog	Standalone	5/14/2015	RE: M FAMILY INC Store 3339 Request to close for 1 Day	Sharon Layman	Sharon Layman; Nelson Hertzog; Daniel Waddell; Scott Durigg; Clark Spader; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Debbie Minch; Brenda Wells	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement and interpretation of legal document.	
539	Nelson Hertzog	Parent	6/11/2015	RE: Legal matters call	John Matter	Bo Czyz; Dan Wilson; Nelson Hertzog; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding legal compliance with various governing law, with attachments.	
540	Rich Butler	Parent	6/25/2015	Memo re Joint Employer - Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Robert Smith; Danette Rhoads; Rich Butler; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Susan Rector	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding interpretation of NLRB decision, with attachments.	
541	Rich Butler	Standalone	8/7/2015	Re: Memo re Joint Employer - Privileged	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; John Matter; Robert Smith; Danette Rhoads; Rich Butler; Caroline Oyler; Susan Rector	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding interpretation of NLRB decision.	
542	Rich Butler	Parent	8/11/2015	Re: Union Materials	John Matter	John Matter; Danette Rhoads; Caroline Oyler; Rich Butler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
543	Rich Butler	Child	6/18/2015	GM Metting recap.docx	Jordan Marr		Attorney-Client Communication	Document reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 357531 - DURLING-PJI 357537
544	Rich Butler	Child	6/19/2015	GM Metting recap.docx	Jordan Marr		Attorney-Client Communication	Document reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 357539 - DURLING-PJI 357545
545	Rich Butler	Parent	8/24/2015	Broadcast Communications for June 25; 2015 for review/approval	Lyndsay Railey	Lyndsay Railey; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Jim Ensign; Robert Thompson; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Lance Tucker; Bob Kraut; Caroline Oyler; Kenneth Cox; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellan; Sean muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Michelle Heffernan; Tim Newton; michele O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric hartman; jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
546	Rich Butler	Parent	8/24/2015	Re: Driver Safety course	Danny Evans	John Matter; Craig Jones; Rich Butler; Dusting Couts; Danny Evans; Cameron Hafer	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
547	Rich Butler	Parent	8/25/2015	Re: Driver Safety course	John Matter	Danny Evans; Craig Jones; Rich Butler; Dustin Couts; John Matter; Cameron Hafer	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
548	Rich Butler	Parent	8/27/2015	Re: Driver Safety course	Craig Jones	Danny Evans; Craig Jones; Rich Butler; Dustin Couts; John Matter; Cameron Hafer	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
549	Rich Butler	Parent	8/27/2015	Fw: Luntz report	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; Rich butler; Caroline Oyler; Dustin Couts; Steve Ritchie; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 45 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
550	Rich Butler	Standalone	8/28/2015	Re: Fw: Papa John's Pizza SC- DHEC		Dale Herb; Chris Titshaw; Joseph Shahady; Rich Butler; John Matter; Cindy Hopkins; wheelejd@dhec.sc.gov; DocuSign	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts.	
551	Rich Butler	Standalone	9/22/2015	Re: Fw: Papa John's Pizza SC- DHEC	Dale Herb	Dale Herb; Chris Titshaw; Joseph Shahady; Rich Butler; John Matter; Cindy Hopkins; wheelejd@dhec.sc.gov; Docusign	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts.	
552	Rich Butler	Parent	9/22/2015	Fwd: Broadcast Communications for August 25; 2015 - for review / approval	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; Bobby Meroney; Mike Smith; Bob Billman; Steve McNeil; Daniel Collinsworth; Scott Durigg; Lynn McQuillen; Robert Nelson; Rich Butler; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Jim Ensign; Robert Thompson; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Lance Tucker; Bob Kraut; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Tim Newton; Michele O'Herr; Dustin Couts; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
553	Rich Butler	Parent	10/3/2015	Fw: Papa John's Pizza SC- DHEC	Dale Herb	Rich Butler; John Matter; Dale Herb; chris Titshaw; Joseph Shahady; Cindy Hopkins; wheelejd@dhec.sc.gov; DocuSign	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters and draft communication, with attachments.	
554	Rich Butler	Standalone	10/3/2015	Re: Papa John's Pizza SC- DHEC	Dale Herb	Dale Herb; Chris Titshaw; Joseph Shahady; Rich Butler; John Matter; Cindy Hopkins; wheelejd@dhec.sc.gov; DocuSign	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts.	
555	Rich Butler	Standalone	10/4/2015	Fw: National eAuthority: NLRB Finds Joint Employer Status Can Exist Merely Based on Indirect or Potential Control	John Matter	Simon Smith; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and interpretation of NLRB decision.	
556	Rich Butler	Parent	10/6/2015	Broadcast Communications for September 22; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Tim Newton; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler		Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 46 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
557	Rich Butler	Parent	10/9/2015	Re: Broadcast Communications for September 22; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Moriey	Julie Morley; Rich Butler; Steve Ritchie/; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Tim Newton; Michele O'Herri, Anne Fischer; Dustin Douts; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
558	Rich Butler	Standalone	10/12/2015	Re: Fw: Alert: McDonald's Advice; Monitoring Didn't Show Employment	Susan Kinder	John Matter; Rich Butler; Simon Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Mark Nance; John Smith; Tim Newton; Vladimir Brikker; Bobbi Stewart; Shelly Theiss; Susan Kinder; Michael J. Lotito; Bloomberg Government	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	
559	Rich Butler	Parent	10/12/2015	Broadcast Communications for October 6; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
560	Rich Butler	Standalone	10/22/2015	Re: Navex WPH Course Fee for Franchisees	Dale Herb	Dale Herb; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Jordan Marr; Webcast Contributors	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
561	Rich Butler	Standalone		Re: Navex WPH Course Fee for Franchisees	Dale Herb	Dale Herb; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Jordan Marr; Webcast Contributors	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
562	Rich Butler	Standalone	11/5/2015	Re: Navex WPH Course Fee for Franchisees	Caroline Oyler	Dale Herb; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Jordan Marr; Webcast Contributors	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
563	Rich Butler	Standalone	11/10/2015	Re: Navex WPH Course Fee for Franchisees	Dale Herb	Dale Herb; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Jordan Marr; Webcast Contributors	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 47 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
564	Robert Smith	Standalone	12/1/2015	Re: Navex WPH Course Fee for Franchisees		Dale Herb; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Jordan Marr; Webcast Contributors	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
565	Rich Butler	Parent		Broadcast Communications for October 22; 2015 + wkly training update; final for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
566	Rich Butler	Parent	5/17/2016	Broadcast Communications for October 27; 2015 + P11 LTO case limits; final for review / approval	·	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Kevin Matthews	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
567	Rich Butler	Parent		Re: Fwd: November FAC Meeting-Agenda		Jason Wade; Edmond Heelan; Chuck Simon; dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Tonie Capito; Steve Ritchie; Caroline Oyler; Cynthia Kelley; Lance Tucker; Robert Smith; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon; Shane Hutchins; Simon Smith; Paul W. Robinson; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Philip Horn	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communications to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 48 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
568	Rich Butler	Parent	5/24/2016	Broadcast Communications for November 10; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
569	Rich Butler	Parent	7/7/2016	Broadcast Communications for December 1; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tinn Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern, Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
570	Rich Butler	Parent		Broadcast Communications for May 17; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean muldoon; Connie Houston; tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich butler; Eric Hartman; Jenniff Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 49 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
571	Rich Butler	Standalone	7/19/2016	RE: Broadcast Communications for May 17; 2016 - for review / approval	Tim Newton	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
572	Robert Smith	Parent		Broadcast Communications for May 17; 2016 + P6 cheese price; backup internet; Medallia rollout & 2 Med 2-top offer extended; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Julia McGuffey; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
573	Rich Butler	Standalone	7/21/2016	Re: Attorney-client Privileged	Rich Butler	Rich Butler; John Matter; Scott Durigg; Dustin Couts; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding legal strategy concerning industry lawsuits.	
574	Rich Butler	Parent	7/21/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 7; 2016 + P7 addl opt-in; final for review/approval jm	Internal Communications	internal Communications; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards- Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 50 of 141

Dainte a #	Custodian	Parent/Child	D-4	File News (Cubi	A /	Paralis la sata	Data Harra Barda	Description .	D-1 D-1 (D-11-D-1
Priv Log #		Parent/Child	Date 7/26/2016	File Name/Subject Broadcast Communications for July 14; 2016 - draft for review / approval jm	Author/From Internal Communications	Recipients Internal Communications; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards- Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Privilege Basis Attorney-Client Communication	Description Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
576	Robert Smith	Parent	7/28/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 19; 2016 - draft for review / approval jm	Internal Communications	Internal Communications; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards- Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddelj; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
577	Rich Butler	Parent	8/2/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 19; 2016 + new SVP; news releases; MLB' Now' guide & updated animal cruelty tweets; final for review / approval jm	Internal Communications	Internal Communications; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards- Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 51 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
578	Rich Butler	Parent	8/9/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 21; 2016 - draft for review / approval jm		Internal Communications; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards- Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
579	Rich Butler	Standalone	8/11/2016	Re: Broadcast Communications for July 21; 2016 - draft for review / approval jm		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
580	Robert Smith	Parent	8/11/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 26; 2016 - draft for review/approval jm		Internal Communications; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards- Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler, Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication; Privileged by Attachment	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 52 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
581	Robert Smith	Parent	8/16/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 28, 2016 - DRAFT for review/approval	Lyndsay Railey	Lyndsay Railey; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Fric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Jay Allen; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
582	Rich Butler	Parent	8/17/2016	Broadcast Communications for August 2; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
583	Robert Smith	Parent	8/18/2016	Broadcast Communications for August 9; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Revin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 53 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
584	Caroline Oyler	Parent	8/23/2016	Broadcast Communications for August 11; 2016 - for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
585	Edmond Heelan	Parent	8/23/2016	RE: Broadcast Communications for August 11; 2016 + new Pan PREFERRED items; final for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
586	Rich Butler	Parent	8/25/2016	FW: Broadcast Communications for August 16; 2016 - for review / approval	Rich Butler	Danny Evans; Chris Titshaw; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 54 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
587	Rich Butler	Standalone	8/30/2016	Re: Broadcast Communications for August 16; 2016 - for review / approval	Chris Titshaw	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Chris Titshaw	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
588	Rich Butler	Parent	8/30/2016	Broadcast Communications for August 18; 2016 - for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jenniffer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
589	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/1/2016	Broadcast Communications for August 23; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Revin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 55 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
590	Robert Smith	Parent	9/6/2016	FW: Broadcast Communications for August 23; 2016 + NFL release media coverage & P9 food cost chart.calculator; final for review / approval	Iulie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
591	Edmond Heelan	Parent	9/6/2016	Broadcast Communications for August 25; 2016 - for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Julia McGuffey; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
592	Rich Butler	Parent	9/8/2016	Broadcast Communications for August 30; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Julia McGuffey; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 56 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
593	Robert Smith	Parent	9/8/2016	Broadcast Communications for August 30; 2016 + revised links to Apple app coverage; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Julia McGuffey; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
594	Rich Butler	Parent	9/13/2016	Broadcast Communications for September 1; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Julia McGuffey; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
595	Edmond Heelan	Parent	9/15/2016	Broadcast Communications for September 6; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 57 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
596	Rich Butler	Parent	9/15/2016	FW: Broadcast Communications for September 6; 2016 + training update and CC Security revised links; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
597	Robert Smith	Parent	9/20/2016	Broadcast Communications for September 8; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
598	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/20/2016	Broadcast Communications for September 8; 2016 + PCI compliance and Pan webinar; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Paul Johnson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 58 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
599	Caroline Oyler	Parent		Broadcast Communications for September 13; 2016 - for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
600	Steve Ritchie	Parent	9/27/2016	Broadcast Communications for September 15; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
601	Rich Butler	Parent	9/27/2016	FW: Broadcast Communications for September 15; 2016 +cinnamon pull apart new procedure; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 59 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
602	Edmond Heelan			Broadcast Communications for September 20; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	vates nange (nevatice botuments)
603	Robert Smith	Parent	10/4/2016	Broadcast Communications for September 20, 2016 + P10 Cornerstone course; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jenniffer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
604	Steve Ritchie	Child	9/20/2016	P9 Webcast.pdf	Darryl Carr		Attorney-Client Communication	Document containing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	DURLING-PJI 357865 - DURLING-PJI 357911
605	Rich Butler	Child	9/21/2016	P9 Webcast.pdf	Darryl Carr		Attorney-Client Communication	Document containing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	DURLING-PJI 357914 - DURLING-PJI 357960
606	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/11/2016	Broadcast Communications for September 22; 2016 - for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jenniffer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 60 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
607	Rich Butler	Parent	10/11/2016	Broadcast Communications for September 27; 2016 - for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michel O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
608	Edmond Heelan	Parent	10/13/2016	Broadcast Communications for September 27; 2016 + Papa's Memoir; final for review/approval	Julie Morley	Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
609	Caroline Oyler	Parent	10/18/2016	Broadcast Communications for September 29; 2016 + Oars access Application Portal; final for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Roger Cox; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 61 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
610	Rich Butler	Parent		Broadcast Communications for October 4; 2016 - for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michel O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Roger Cox; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
611	Edmond Heelan	Parent		FW: Broadcast Communications for October 4; 2016 + news release media & PR guidelines; for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Carolline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Roger Cox; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
612	Edmond Heelan	Parent	2/11/2015	Broadcast Communications for October 6; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Roger Cox; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 62 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
613	Edmond Heelan	Parent	2/11/2015	Broadcast Communications for October 11; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michel O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jenniffer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Roger Cox; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
614	Edmond Heelan	Parent		Broadcast Communications for October 11; 2016 + Pan best practices & homepage localization survey update; for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Roger Cox; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
615	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/23/2015	Broadcast Communications for October 13; 2016 - for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Roger Cox; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 63 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
616	Edmond Heelan	Parent	2/25/2015	Broadcast Communications for October 18; 2016 - for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Roger Cox; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Amber McNew	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
617	Robert Smith	Parent	2/26/2015	Broadcast Communications for October 20; 2016 - for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Roger Cox; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
618	Edmond Heelan	Parent	2/26/2015	FW: Broadcast Communications for October 20; 2016 + P11 Post-it; final for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Roger Cox; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
619	Robert Smith	Parent	2/27/2015	Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Danette Rhoads; Robert Smith; Simon Smith; Rich Butler; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
620	Robert Smith	Parent	3/2/2015	Attorney-Client Privileged		John Matter; Danette Rhoads; Robert Smith; Simon Smith; Rich Butler; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 64 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
621		Parent	3/2/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Rich Butler; Caroline Oyler; Danette Rhoads; Daniel Waddell; Robert Smith; Simon Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding interpretation of NLRB decision, with attachments.	Sates intige (newscar Strainency)
622	Robert Smith	Standalone	3/16/2015	Re: Broadcast Communications for February 26; 2015 - for review / approval	Robert Smith	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Jim Ensign; Robert Thompson; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Lance Tucker; Bob Kraut; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Michelle Heffernan; Tim Newton; Michele O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
623	Robert Smith	Parent	3/16/2015	Fw: Time Sensitive - Fw: Pay Rule Configurations - FINAL SIGN OFF	Jennifer Hauber	Robert Smith; Jennifer Hauber; John Matter; Maria Brown; Danette Rhoads; Brent Kemmerer; Janie Gorter; Brandi O'Neil; Mona Croan	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
624	Robert Smith	Parent	3/18/2015	OPCON - Follow Up Discussion (Building Better Teams Session)	Danette Rhoads	John Matter; Rich Butler; Edmond Heelan; Robert Smith; Jennifer Hauber	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication and policies with attachments.	
625	Robert Smith	Parent	4/2/2015	Fw: social media	John Matter	Robert Smith; Scott Carr; Danette Rhoads; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Andy Freitas	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters and recent RLRB opinions, with attachments.	
626	Robert Smith	Parent	4/5/2015	RE: social media	John Matter	John Matter; Kerri Megivern; Caroline Oyler; Danette Rhoads; Scott Carr; Robert Smith; Andy Freitas	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
627	Robert Smith	Standalone	4/7/2015	Attorney-Client Privileged - Driver Shot Firearm Discharged During Robbery (3/16/2015)	Danette Rhoads	Danette Rhoads; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Scott Carr; Steve Evans; Lynn McQuillen	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
628	Robert Smith	Parent	4/8/2015	Update: Attorney-Client Privileged - Driver Shot Firearm Discharged During Robbery (3/16/2015)	Danette Rhoads	Danette Rhoads; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Scott Car; Edmond Heelan; Steve Evans; Lynn McQuillen	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
629	Robert Smith	Standalone	4/9/2015	Re: Update: Attorney- Client Privileged - Driver Shot Firearm Discharged During Robbery (3/16/2015)	John Matter	John Matter; Danette Rhoads; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Robert Smith; Scott Car; Steve Evans; Lynn McQuillen	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
630	Robert Smith	Parent	4/10/2015	Fwd:	Robert Smith	Danette Rhoads; Eric Hartman; Robert Smith; Shane Hutchins	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	DURLING-PJI 357961 - DURLING-PJI 357961
631	Robert Smith	Parent	4/13/2015	Papa John's Welfare Benefit Plan (Wrap Plan Document)	Brenda Miles	John Matter; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
632	Robert Smith	Parent	4/28/2015		Danette Rhoads	Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 65 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
633	Robert Smith	Standalone	4/30/2015	Fw: One more question	Robert Smith	Robert Smith; Brandi O'Neil; Paul Schork; John Matter; Danette Rhoads; Susan Rector; Eric Todd; Caroline Oyler; Rich Butler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	socs name (nedacted sociaments)
634	Robert Smith	Parent	5/13/2015	FBDs - Talking Points – Wednesday; 4/15/2015 – Fast Food Strike Planned in 200 U.S. Cities	Danette Rhoads	All Franchise Business Directors; Simon Smith; Michael Meche; Bo Czyz; Mike Coomes; Rick Thompson; Laura Jackson; Scott Carr; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
635	Robert Smith	Parent	5/21/2015	HRD - Talking Points Tool - 4/15/2015 – Fast Food Strike Planned in 200 U.S. Cities	Danette Rhoads	Laura Jackson; Kristie Scott; Jason Moore, Scott Carr; Roberts Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
636	Robert Smith	Parent	5/22/2015	FYI (Papa John's): HRD - Talking Points Tool – 4/15/2015 – Fast Food Strike Planned in 200 U.S. Citles	Danette Rhoads	Eric Zeugschmidt; Lyndsay Railey; Robert Smith; Laura Jackson; Kristie Scott; Jason Moore; Scott Carr	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
637	Robert Smith	Parent	6/8/2015	Meeting Notes - April 22 - Colonels - Louisville KY - Min Wage; etc	Danette Rhoads	Amy Ernest; Pat Connor; Paul Schork; Brandi O'Neil; Robert Smith	Attorney Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
638	Robert Smith	Parent	6/10/2015	Attorney-Client Privileged - Tips Report	Brandi O'Neil	Brandi O'Neil; John Matter; Robert Smith Paul Schork; Caroline Oyler; Susan Rector; Eric Todd; Rich Butler; Danette Rhoads	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
639	Robert Smith	Standalone	6/15/2015	RE: Attorney-Client Privileged - Tips Report	John Matter	John Matter; Eric Todd; Caroline Oyler; Geddle L. Gray; Susan Rector; Robert Smith; Brandi O'Neil; Paul Schork; Danette Rhoads; Rich Butler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
640	Robert Smith	Parent	7/17/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged - Tips Report	Brandi O'Neil	Brandi O'Neil; John Matter; Robert Smith Paul Schork; Eric Todd; Caroline Oyler; Danette Rhoads; Susan Rector; Rich Butler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
641	Robert Smith	Parent	7/20/2015	Moving Forward on Minimum wage Louisville- Who/what is included in Louisville/Indiana- paying Colonel's TM INSTORE under minimum i		Bobbie Mittel; Brandi O'Neil; Chad Bischoff; Danette Rhoads; Keith Holbert; Pat Connor; Paul Schork; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
642	Robert Smith	Parent	7/21/2015	Fw: Louisville minimum wage ordinance		Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Julia McGuffey; Annete Schnatter; Robert Smith; Danette Rhoads; Paul Schork; Marilyn Sainlar; Billy Higdon; John Schnatter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
643	Robert Smith	Child	5/11/2015	2015_Weekly Update_5- 11-2015.pptx	Robert Smith		Attorney-Client Communication	Presentation containing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	DURLING-PJI 357971 - DURLING-PJI 357990

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 66 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
644	Robert Smith	Parent	8/12/2015	Quarterly meeting to gain consensus on Company Top 10 Risks - ERM Process	Clark Spader	Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Clara Passafiume; David Oberson; Dustin Couts; Jamie Youngblood; Joe Smith; Mary Miller; Paul Johnson; Randy Lawrence; Robert Smith; Tim Newton	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	Succession of the succession o
645	Robert Smith	Parent	8/12/2015	Please Review/Reply: Metro Louisville & Maryland - Wage Adjustment Memos (6/29/2015)	Danette Rhoads	Paul Schork; Marilyn Sainlar; Edmond Hellan; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
646	Robert Smith	Parent	8/25/2015	Fw: Please Review/Reply: Metro Louisville & Maryland - Wage Adjustment Memos (6/29/2015)	Danette Rhoads	Paul Schork; Marilyn Sainlar; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
647	Robert Smith	Standalone	8/27/2015	Re: Fw: quick question from franchise	Robert Smith	Susan Kinder; Chuck Simon; Cynthia McClellen; Dustin Couts; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Robert Smith; Adam Waddell; Paula Russell; Laura Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 357991 - DURLING-PJI 357995
648	Robert Smith	Standalone	8/28/2015	Re: Fw: quick question from franchise	Robert Smith	Susan Kinder; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellan; Dustin Couts; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Chuck Simon; Adam Waddell; Paula Russell; Laura Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 357996 - DURLING-PJI 358000
649	Robert Smith	Standalone	9/7/2015	Fw: quick question from franchise	Robert Smith	Susan Kinder; Chuck Simon; Cynthia McClellen; Dustin Couts; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Robert Smith; Adam Waddell; Paula Russell; Laura Jackson; Danette Rhoads	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 358001 - DURLING-PJI 358005
650	Robert Smith	Parent	9/7/2015	Re: Fw: Minimum Wage Proposal FINAL.doc	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Alfredo Ortiz	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
651	Robert Smith	Standalone	9/9/2015	Re:	Robert Smith	Robert Smith; John Matter; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
652	Robert Smith	Standalone	9/9/2015	Re:	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
653	Robert Smith	Standalone	9/15/2015	Re:	Robert Smith	Robert Smith; Caroline Oyler; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
654		Parent	9/21/2015	Re: Labor Board Says Contractors' Workers Can Bargain With Parent Company	John Matter	Kristie Scott; Jason Moore; Laura Jackson; Robert Smith; Scott Carr	,	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and interpretation of recent NLRB decision, with attachments.	
655	Robert Smith	Parent	9/21/2015	Fw: NRF Memo: NLRB Decision in Browning- Ferris Industries	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Lizzy Simmons; Shawna Purvis; Neil Trautwein	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and interpretation of recent NLRB decision, with attachments.	
656	Robert Smith	Parent	9/29/2015	Re: Fwd: Social Media Potential Issue	Robert Smith	Laura Jackson; Kristie Scott; Cara Van Cleave; Chandra Jones; Larry Grogg	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 67 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
657	Robert Smith	Parent	10/2/2015	Fw: Social Media Potential Issue	Robert Smith	Peter Collins; Craig Jones; Shannon Baete; Cara Van Cleave; Chandra Jones; Laura Jackson; Larry Grogg	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
658	Robert Smith	Parent	10/4/2015	Joint Employment Liability	John Matter	John Matter; Robert Smith; Kristie Scott; Laura Jackson; Scott Carr; Jason Moore; Brent Kemmerer; Alicia Kulmer; Ashley Young; Jennifer Hauber	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
659	Robert Smith	Parent	10/13/2015	Fwd: Joint Employment Liability	Robert Smith	Robert Smith; John Smith; John Matter; Kristie Scott; Laura Jackson; Scott Carr; Jason Moore; Brent Kemmerer; Alicia Kulmer; Ashley Young; Jennifer Hauber	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
660	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/14/2015	Fw: One additional question	John Matter	Bill Cox; Robert Smith; Caroline Oyler; Craig Powell; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
661	Robert Smith	Parent	10/15/2015	Re: No Red e App meeting this afternoon	John Matter	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Dustin Couts; John Smith; Hannah Beasley; Jason Wade; Jordan Marr; Keith Holber; Lea Anne Cundiff; pgoodman@redeapp.com; Ric Stuebs; Roger Cox; Shawn Mayher; Steve Krall; Steven Schraer; Susie Hjermstad; Tim Newton	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
662	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/15/2015	Re: Draft of a Franchisee Broadcast Communication _ ACA IRS Reporting	John Matter	Robert Smith; Brenda Miles	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
663	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/16/2015	Re: ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGED	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; John Matter; Randy Lawrence; Christy Campbell; Brent Kemmerer; Brian Reed; Eric Hartman; Shane Hutchins	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	
664	Robert Smith	Parent	10/18/2015	Fw: P9 Webcast Q&A	Robert Smith	Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Jordan Marr	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
665	Robert Smith	Parent	10/19/2015	Re: Fw: P9 Webcast Q&A	John Matter	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Dale Herb; Jordan Marr	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
666	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/21/2015	Fwd: P9 Webcast Q&A	Robert Smith	Robert Smith; Caroline Oyler; Dale Herb; John Matter; Rich Butler; Jordan Marr; Webcast Contributors	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
667	Robert Smith		10/21/2015	reimbursement issue	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; John Matter; Eric Todd; Patrick F. Hulla; Steve Ritchie; Bruce Lofland Jr.	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
668	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/26/2015	Re: Attorney-client Privileged	Robert Smith	Robert Smith; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Roger Cox; John Smith; Jeff Bunch	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
669	Robert Smith	Parent	10/26/2015	Re: Holiday Pay - Delivery Specialists	John Matter	Renita Boniak; Brian Reed; David Fortner; Jennifer Hauber; Robert Smith; Stephen Soderquist; Susan Kinder	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 68 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1110 205 "	Robert Smith	Standalone			Jennifer Hauber	Brian Reed; John Matter; David Fortener;	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor	Dates Hally (Headeted Documents)
670				Specialists		Renita Boniak; Stephen Soderquist Susan	,	issues.	
670						KinderJennifer Hauber; Robert Smith			
674	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/27/2015	Re: Driver reimbursement	Kristie Scott	Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Caroline	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
671				issue PLEASE CALL ME		Oyler; John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Bruce Lofland Jr.		financial policies and procedures.	
	Robert Smith	Parent	10/27/2015	Re: Fwd: Driver	Robert Smith	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
672	nobert Simen	i di ciic	10/2//2015	reimbursement issue	nobert Simer	Smith; Kristie Scott; Steve Ritchie; Bruce	rationic, enem communication	financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
V				PLEASE CALL ME		Lofland Jr.			
	Robert Smith	Parent	10/28/2015	Fw: NRF Memo: Follow Up	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor	
				from NRF Webinar on		Smith; Lizzy Simmons; Eileen Pryor		issues, with attachments.	
673				NLRB Decision in					
				Browning-Ferris Industries					
	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/29/2015	Fw: Driver reimbursement	Robert Smith	Robert Smith; Jason Moore; Caroline	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
674	Robert Sillitii	Stanualone	10/29/2013	issue	Robert Silliti	Oyler; John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Bruce	Attorney-client communication	financial policies and procedures.	
074				13340		Lofland Jr.		imaneiai poneies and procedures.	
	Robert Smith	Parent	10/29/2015	Fw: Attorney-client	Robert Smith	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert	Attorney-Client Communication; Work	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
675				Privileged		Smith; Jason Moore; Roger Cox; John	Product	financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
						Smith; Jeff Bunch			
676	Robert Smith	Parent	10/29/2015	Re: Smart Routing Data by	John Matter	Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor	
	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/20/2015	Market Re: Investigation	John Matter	John Matter; Edmond Heelan; Caroline	Attorney-Client Communication	issues, with attachments. Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
677	Robert Similir	Standalone	10/29/2013	ite. iiivestigatioii	Joini Matter	Oyler; Robert Smith	Attorney-chefit Communication	financial policies and procedures.	
	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/29/2015	Re: Investigation	Robert Smith	Robert Smith; John Matter; Caroline	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
678				,		Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan	,	financial policies and procedures.	
	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/30/2015	Re: Investigation	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Steve	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
679						Ritchie; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan		financial policies and procedures.	
	B 1 16 31		44/4/2045	T. II			ali i a		
	Robert Smith	Parent	11/4/2015	Talking Points	John Matter	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Anthony B. Byergo; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan;	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and regarding draft	
680						Daniel Collinsworth; Jesse McBain; Jason		communication, with attachments.	
000						Moore; Kristie Scott		communication, with academicity.	
681	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/5/2015	Re: Attorney Client	John Matter	Robert Smith; John Matter; Jesse McBain	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor	
001				Privilege				issues.	
	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/5/2015	RE: Talking Points	John Matter	John Matter; Anthony B. Byergo; Caroline	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
682						Oyler; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; Jason Moore; Jesse McBain;		financial policies and procedures.	
002						Kristie Scott; Robert Smith			
						,			
	Robert Smith	Parent	11/6/2015	Re: Attorney-Client	John Matter	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Daniel	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
683				Privileged		Collinsworth; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith;	,	financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
						Jason Moore			
	Robert Smith	Parent	11/6/2015	Re: Attorney-Client	John Matter	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
504				Privileged		Smith; Kristie Scott; Daniel Collinsworth;		financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
684						Edmond Heelan; Jesse McBain; Bruce Lofland Jr.; Jason Moore			
						Lonana 31., Jason Woore			
	Robert Smith	Parent	11/6/2015	Re: Attorney-Client	Kristie Scott	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
685				Privileged		Smith; Kristie Scott; Bruce Lofland Jr.;		financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
						Jason Moore			

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 69 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
686	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/7/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Kristie Scott	Kristie Scott; John Matter; Jason Moore; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Bruce Lofland Jr.	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	
687	Robert Smith	Parent	11/7/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Kristie Scott; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; Jesse McBain; Bruce Lofland Jr.; Jason Moore	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
688	Robert Smith	Parent	11/9/2015	Fw: ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGED - follow up items from mtg	Robert Smith	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Ki Thomas; Jennifer Hauber; Susan Kinder; Brandi O'Neill; Robert Smith; Kristie Scott; Paul Schork	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
689	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/9/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Daniel Collinsworth; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Jesse McBain; Bruce Lofland Jr.	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
690	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/9/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Daniel Collinsworth; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Jesse McBain; Bruce Lofland Jr.	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
691	Robert Smith	Parent	11/10/2015	Fw: Broadcast Communications for November 5; 2015 + revised EG gaming offer & Media Alert; Final for review / approval	Robert Smith	Robert Smith; Kristie Scott; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Carolyn Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler		Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
692	Robert Smith	Parent	11/10/2015	Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Daniel Collinsworth; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
693	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/10/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Daniel Collinsworth; Caroline Oyler; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
694		Parent		Attorney-client Privileged	John Matter	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Kristie Scott, Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan		Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and draft communication, with attachments.	
695	Robert Smith	Parent	11/11/2015	Store Data _ Privileged	John Matter	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
696	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/11/2015	Re: Store Data _ Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 70 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
8		Parent	11/12/2015	Fw: Store Data _	John Matter	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	,
697				Privileged		Smith; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon		financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
698	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/12/2015	Re: Fw: Store Data _ Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Brandi O'Neil; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
699	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/16/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Daniel Collinsworth; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Paul Schork; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
700	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/16/2015	Fw: Attorney-Client Privileged	Robert Smith	Robert Smith; Kristie Scott; Daniel Collinsworth; John Matter; Jason Moore; Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
701	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/16/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Daniel Collinsworth; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Robert Smith; Billy Higdon; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
702	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/16/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Paul Schork	Paul Schork; Jason Moore; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
703	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/18/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Daniel Collinsworth; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Billy Higdon; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
704	Robert Smith	Parent	11/20/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Kristie Scott	Kristie Scott; Jason Moore; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; Paul Schork; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
705	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/20/2015	Re: Store Data _ Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Brandi O'Neil; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Beth Horlander; Billy Higdon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
706	Robert Smith	Standalone	12/11/2015	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Paul Schork	Paul Schork; Jason Moore; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
707	Robert Smith	Parent	12/11/2015	Fw: Incident Store 136 Driver Assaulted	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; Rick Thompson; James Asencio; Adam Waddell; Edmond Helan; Simon Smith; Paul Johnson; Cara VanCleave; Lyndsay Railey; David Orberson; Craig Jones; Pete McCartney; Steven Mercer; Peter Collins; Kristie Scott; Dustin Couts; Chuck Simon; Tracy Friedlein; Mark McCormack; Craig Browning; Stephanie Montgomery; Jenny Wade; James Hand; Michael Upton; Lora Murray; Carolyn Vincent; Bryan Bays; James Ascencio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 71 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
708		Standalone		Re: Incident Store 136 Driver Assaulted	John Matter	Rick Thompson; James Asencio; Adam Waddell; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Cara VanCleave; Lyndsay Railey; David Orberson; Craig Jones; Pete McCartney; Steven Mercer; Peter Collins; Dustin Couts; Chuck Simon; Tracy Friedlein; Mark McCormack; Craig Browning; Stephanie Taylor; Jenny Newman; James Hand; Michael Upton; Lora Murray; Carolyn Vincent; Bryan Bay; Robert Smith; Kristie Scott; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
709	Robert Smith	Standalone	1/4/2016	Re: Incident Store 136 Driver Assaulted	Robert Smith	Robert Smith; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Kristie Scott; Rick Thompson; James Asencio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
710	Robert Smith	Standalone	1/5/2016	Re: Incident Store 136 Driver Assaulted	John Matter	John Matter; Robert Smith; Caroline Oyler; Kristie Scott; Rick Thompson; James Asencio	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
711	Robert Smith	Parent	1/7/2016	Fw: Franchise Training Request/ Staffing	Robert Smith	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Scott Carr; Jason Moore; Laura Jackson; Daniel Collinsworth; Ty Despain	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
712	Robert Smith	Standalone	1/14/2016	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Billy Higdon; Daniel Collinsworth; Edmond Heelan; Jason Moore; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Beth Horlander	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
713	Robert Smith	Parent	1/14/2016	Fw: ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGED - follow up items from mtg	Kristie Scott	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Kristie Scott; Brandi O'Neil; Paul Schork	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and human resources matters, with attachments.	
714	Robert Smith	Parent	1/14/2016	FW: ***Threat IMPORTANT PLEASE READ	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; Simon Smith; Dustin Couts; Paul Johnson; Chuck Simon; Tracy Friedlein; Mark McCormack; Cara VanCleave; Lyndsay Railey; David Orberson; Peter Collins; Kristie Scott; Edmond Heelan; Steven Mercer; Pete McCartney; Craig Jones; Shamul Eleas; Mike Coomes; Hasan Lokhandwala James Hand; Stephanie Montgomery; Craig Browning; Jenny Wade	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 72 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
715	Robert Smith	Standalone	1/15/2016	Re: Fwd: ***Threat - IMPORTANT PLEASE READ	John Matter	Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; John Matter; Mike Coomes; Consumer Services; Simon Smith; Dustin Couts; Paul Johnson; Chuck Simon; Tracy Friedlein; Mark McCormack; Cara VanCleave; Lyndsay Railey; David Orberson; Peter Collins; Edmond Heelan; Steven Mercer; Pete McCartney; Craig Jones; Hasan Lokhandwala; James Hand; Stephanie Montgomery; Craig Browning; Jenny Wade	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resources matters.	
716	Robert Smith	Standalone	1/19/2016	Fw: The IRS business mileage rate is going down for 2016	Robert Smith	Lance Tucker; Claude Phenix; Connie Houston; Keeta Fox; Robert Smith; Caroline Oyler; James Harris; Alicia Kincaid; Paul Schork; Marilyn Sainlar; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
717	Robert Smith	Standalone	1/19/2016	Re: Wage & Hour Rule	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Fred Preis	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding interpretation of proposed wage and hour rule.	
718	Robert Smith	Parent	1/25/2016	Fw: ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGED - follow up items from mtg	John Matter	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Brandi O'Neil; Kristie Scott; Paul Schork	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
719	Robert Smith	Parent	1/26/2016	Re: Fw: Message from ptrq-02-060	Robert Smith	John Matter; Robert Smith; Marilyn Sainlar; Pat Connor; ptrq-02- 060@papajohns.com	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
720	Robert Smith	Parent	1/27/2016	Re: Final wage payments	John Matter	Marilyn Sainlar; Brandi O'Neil; Jennfier Hauber; Pat Connor; Paul Schork; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
721	Robert Smith	Parent	1/29/2016	ERM Team - Quarterly Meeting scheduled for Tuesday; January 19	Debbie Tate	Debbie Tate; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Joe Smith; Dustin Couts; Tim Newton; Billy Higdon; Randy Lawrence; Paul Johnson; Mary Miller; David Orberson; Clara Passfiume; Clark Spader; Jamie Youngblood	Attorney Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
722	Robert Smith	Standalone	2/4/2016	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged.	Rich Butler	Rich Butler; John Matter; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Jason Wade; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Caroline Oyler; Simon Smith; Chris Titshaw	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedure.	
723	Robert Smith	Standalone	2/4/2016	Re: Social Media Policy	Robert Smith	Ed Taliaferro; Robert Smith; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedure	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 73 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
724	Robert Smith	Parent	2/12/2016	Fwd: Broadcast Communications for January 19; 2016 - + P1-2 eCRM; for review / approval	Robert Smith	Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Robert Smith; Christy Johnson; Edmond Heelan; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Shane Hutchins; Cynthia McClellan; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
725	Robert Smith	Parent	2/12/2016	Re: ELT Pre-read	Robert Smith	Peggy Bentley; Caroline Oyler; Cynthia McClellen; Edmond Heelan; Jack Swaysland; John@evgrealestate.com; Lance Tucker; Robert Smith; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon; Shane Hutchins; Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern; Simon Smith; denise@evgrealestate.com, Don Graham; Joe Smith; Karen Churchill; Kim Girdler; Kimberly Keller; Liz Essen; Melinda Lutz; Mike Measells; Molly Small; Paul Johnson; Robin Kennedy; Shannon Baete; Sherry Russell; Stacy Hadley; Toni Capito	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and regarding draft communication, with attachments.	
726	Robert Smith	Parent	2/13/2016	ELT Pre-read	Peggy Bentley	Peggy Bentley; Caroline Oyler; Cynthia McClellan; Edmond Heelan; Jack Swaysland; John Schnatter; Lance Tucker, Robert Smith; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon; Shane Hutchins; Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern; Simon Smith; Denise Robinson; Don Graham; Joe Smith; Karen Churchill; Kim Girdler; Kimberly Keller; Liz Essen; Melinda Lutz; Mike Measells; Molly Small; Paul Johnson; Robin Kennedy; Shannon Baete; Sherry Russell; Stacy Hadley; Toni Capito		Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and regarding draft communication, with attachments.	
727		Parent	2/18/2016	Re: Attorney/Client Privilege	John Matter	John Matter; Kristie Scott; Brandi O'Neil; Jennifer Hauber; Robert Smith; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
728	Robert Smith	Parent	3/25/2016	Re: Attorney/Client Privilege	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Brandi O'Neil; Jennifer Hauber; Kristie Scott	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 74 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
FIIV LOG #	Robert Smith	Parent		Attorney-Client Privileged.	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding interpretation of DOL	Dates hange (Neuacteu Documents)
729			5, 25, 25, 25			Smith; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Simon Smith; Kristie Scott	,	guidance, with attachments.	
730	Robert Smith	Parent	3/28/2016	Re: Job Descriptions	Robert Smith	Kristie Scott	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
731	Robert Smith	Parent	3/31/2016	Re: Job Descriptions	Robert Smith	Kristie Scott	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
732	Robert Smith	Parent	4/1/2016	Hotline reports	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
733	Robert Smith	Parent	4/1/2016	Slides for Master Deck	Robert Smith	Lance Tucker	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
734	Robert Smith	Parent	4/1/2016	Draft FAC Meeting Minutes	Kim Girdler	Kim Girdler; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Shane Hutchins; Simon Smith; David Orberson; Caroline Oyler; Toni Capito; Melinda Lutz; Liz Essen; Kimberly Keller; Shannon Baete; Sherry Russell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
735	Robert Smith	Parent	4/1/2016	Re: It looks like when we went to Dual Driver we made Ft Bragg DR30 7.25 (minimum for NC; Fed)	Marilyn Sainlar	Robert Smith; Anita Hammond; Marilyn Sainlar; Bobbie Mittel; Brandi O'Neil; Pat Connor	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
736	Robert Smith	Parent	4/7/2016	Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Rich Butler; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resources matters, with attachments.	
737	Robert Smith	Standalone	4/12/2016	Re: Ft. Bragg	John Matter	Robert Smith; Brandi O'Neil; Karen Maxfield; Kristie Scott; Marilyn Sainlar; Mike Smith; Paul Schork; John Matter; Pat Connor; Keith Holbert; Bobbie Mittel	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	
738	Robert Smith	Standalone	4/12/2016	Re: Ft. Bragg	Pat Connor	Keith Holbert; Brandi O'Nell; Marilyn Sainlar; Bobbie Mittel; Robert Smith; Pat Connor; John Matter; Paul Schork; Karen Maxfield; Kristie Scott; Mike Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	
739	Robert Smith	Parent	4/14/2016	Fw: Flyer; Forms; and Sign	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Rich Butler; Edmond Heelan; Gustavo Suarez; Stephen Woods	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication, with attachments.	
740	Robert Smith	Parent	4/14/2016	Re: Attorney-client Privileged	Kristie Scott	Jamie Tejeda; Mike Smith; Pat Connor; Robert Smith; Karen Maxfield; Marillyn Sainlar	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
741	Robert Smith	Parent	4/15/2016	Re: Attorney-client Privileged	Kristie Scott	Jamie Tejeda; Brandi O'Neil; Karen Maxfield; Marilyn Sainlar; Mike Smith; Pat Connor; Paul Schork	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
742	Robert Smith	Standalone		Re: Attorney-client Privileged	Jamie Tejeda	Jamie Tejeda; Kristie Scott; Brandi O'Nell; John Matter; Marilyn Sainlar; Pat Connor; Paul Schork; Robert Smith; Karen Maxfield; Mike Smith; Keith Holbert; Bobbie Mittel	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
743	Robert Smith	Standalone	4/19/2016	Re: Attorney-client Privileged	Marilyn Sainlar	John Matter; Pat Connor; Robert Smith; Brandi O'Neil; Karen Maxfield; Kristie Scott; Mike Smith; Paul Schork; Marilyn Sainlar; Keith Holbert; Bobbie Mittel	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 75 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
744	Robert Smith	Parent	5/3/2016	Fw: It looks like when we went to Dual Driver we made Ft Bragg DR30 7.25 (minimum for NC; Fed)	Robert Smith	Paul Schork; Marilyn Sainlar; Robert Smith; Anita Hammond; Bobbie Mittel; Brandi O'Neil; John Matter; Pat Connor	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
745	Robert Smith	Standalone	5/3/2016	Re: API Information - Papa John's / Bajco	Susan Kinder	John Matter; Edmond Heelan; Ric Stuebs; Robert Smith; Vladimir Brikker; Susan Kinder; Suif Pal; Nadeem Bajwa; Connie Schaffner; FS Deployment Request; Jennifer Sharpe; Rob Pennington; Steven Heller	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
746	Robert Smith	Parent	5/18/2016	ERM top risks and heat map	Debbie Tate	Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Joe Smith; Dustion Couts; Billy Higdon; Randy Lawrence; Tim Newton; Paul Johnson; Mary Miller; David Orberson; Clara Passafiume; Clark Spader; Jamie Youngblood; Peter Collins; Debbie Tate	Attorney Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
747	Robert Smith	Standalone	5/19/2016	Re: Attorney-client Privileged	Marilyn Sainlar	John Matter; Pat Connor; Robert Smith; Brandi O'Neil; Karen Maxfield; Mike Smith; Paul Schork; Marilyn Sainlar; Kristie Scott; Keith Holbert; Bobbie Mittel	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
748	Robert Smith	Standalone	5/19/2016	Re: Attorney-client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Pat Connor; Robert Smith; Brandi O'Neil; Karen Maxfield; Mike Smith; Paul Schork; Marilyn Sainlar; Kristie Scott; Keith Holbert; Bobbie Mittel	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
749	Robert Smith	Parent	5/24/2016	Fw: Delivery Specialist Presentation & Task Force Memo	Randy Lawrence	Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Jennifer Hauber; Deede Mullaney; Eric Hartman; Brian Reed; Jeffrey Surran	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor matters, with attachments.	
750	Robert Smith	Parent	5/24/2016	Re: Ft. Bragg	Robert Smith	Kristie Scott; Brandi O'Neil; Karen Maxfield; Marilyn Sainlar; Mike Smith; Pat Connor; Paul Schork	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
751	Robert Smith	Standalone	5/24/2016	Re: Ft. Bragg	Robert Smith	Kristtter; Brandi O'Neil; Karen Maxfield; Marilyn Sainlar; Mike Smith; Pat Connor; Pauie Scott; Robert Smith; John Mal Schork; Keith Holbert; Bobbie Mittel	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
752	Robert Smith	Parent	5/25/2016	ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGED	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Marylyn Sainlar; Pat Connor; Bobbi Stewart; Scott Smith; Johanna South; Brandi O'Nell; Mark McCormack; James Asencio; Paul Boccia; Adam Waddell; Josh Rollins; Jamie Fullmer; Rob Porter; Lorraine Shriner	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
753	Robert Smith	Standalone	5/26/2016	Re: ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGED	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Marilyn Sainlar; Pat Connor; Bobbi Stewart; Brandi O'Neil; Johanna South; Scott Smith; Mark McCormack; Heljedek Support; Paul Boccia; Adam Waddell; Josh Rollins; Jamie Fulmer; Rob Porter; Lorraine Shriner	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 76 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
754	Robert Smith	Parent	5/26/2016	Re: New overtime regs announced	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Steve Ritchie; Billy Higdon; Edmond Heelan; Lance Tucker; Eric Todd; Caroline Miller Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding interpretation of regulations with attachments.	
755	Robert Smith	Parent	5/31/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 19; 2016 - for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
756	Robert Smith	Parent	5/31/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 19; 2016 + P6 LSM; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
757	Robert Smith	Parent	5/31/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 24; 2016 - for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 77 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
758	Robert Smith	Parent	6/2/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 24; 2016 + Medallia rollout; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
759	Robert Smith	Parent	6/2/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 24; 2016 + P6 Ideal Food Cost chart and calculator; final for today	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
760	Robert Smith	Standalone	6/13/2016	Fwd: GES Invest / Enquiry	Mike Measells	Mike Measells; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Patrycja Kulinska	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication.	
761	Robert Smith	Standalone	6/13/2016	Re: GES Invest / Enquiry	Caroline Oyler	Mike Measells; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Patrycja Kulinska	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication.	
762	Robert Smith	Parent	6/14/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 26; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 78 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
763	Robert Smith	Parent	6/16/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 31; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michel O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
764	Robert Smith	Parent	6/21/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 31; 2016 + P8 promo details; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Durigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
765	Robert Smith	Parent		Broadcast Communications for May 31; 2016 + updated Medallia rollout; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 79 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
766	Robert Smith	Parent	6/27/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 2; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Joe Smith; Jason Wade	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
767	Robert Smith	Parent	6/28/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 2; 2016 + Medallia update; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Joe Smith; Jason Wade	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
768	Robert Smith	Parent	6/7/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 7, 2016	Julie Morley	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Connie Houston; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Duston Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girlder	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
769	Robert Smith	Parent	6/29/2016	FW: ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGED - follow up items from mtg	Kristie Scott	Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Duston Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girlder	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
770	Robert Smith	Standalone	6/30/2016	NRF Amicus Brief on Joint Employer	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Robert Smith; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding interpretation of NLRB decision.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 80 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
771	Robert Smith	Parent Parent	7/5/2016	Fine Namica Subject Broadcast Communications for June 14; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Joe Smith; Jason Wade	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	bates kange (Redacted Documents)
772	Robert Smith	Parent	7/5/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 16; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
773	Robert Smith	Parent	7/5/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 21; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
774	Robert Smith	Parent	7/7/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 21; 2016 + P7 system offers; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 81 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
775	Robert Smith	Parent	7/7/2016	Materials for ERM Team meeting - Tuesday; June 28 at 11 am	Debbie Tate	Debbie Tate; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Joe Smith; Dustin Couts; Billy Higdon; Randy Lawrence; Tim Newton; Peter Collins; Paul Johnson; Mary Miller; David Orberson; Clara Passafiume; Clark Spader; Jamie Youngblood	Attorney Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
776	Robert Smith	Parent	7/12/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 28; 2016 - for review / approval	Internal Communications	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Roger Cox; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
777	Robert Smith	Parent	7/12/2016	Confidential/Attorney- Client Privileged/Prepared and Sent at the Direction of Counsel	Debbie Tate	Debbie Tate; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Joe Smith; Dustin Couts; Billy Higdon; Randy Lawrence; Tim Newton; Peter Collins; Paul Johnson; Mary Miller; David Orberson; Clara Passafiume; Clark Spader; Jamie Youngblood	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
778	Robert Smith	Parent	7/12/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 30; 2016 - for review / approval	Internal Communications	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 82 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
779	Robert Smith	Parent	7/13/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 5; 2016 - for review / approval	Internal Communications	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Joe Smith; Jason Wade	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
780	Robert Smith	Parent		Broadcast Communications for July 5; 2016 + lunch special opt in with Pepsi flyers; for review / approval	Internal Communications	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutcins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
781	Robert Smith	Parent	9/12/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 5; 2016 + baseball promo items & PapaLink outage; for review / approval	Internal Communications	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 83 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
782	Robert Smith	Parent	9/19/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 7; 2016 - draft for review/approval jm	Internal Communications	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
783	Robert Smith	Parent	9/19/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 7; 2016 P7 addl opt-in REMOVED - final herewith will be sent soon	Internal Communications	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
784	Robert Smith	Parent	9/19/2016	FW: Ft. Bragg	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; Marilyn Sainlar; John Matter; Brandi O'Neil; Paul Schork; Pat Connor; Karen Maxfield; Kristie Scott; Mike Smith; Keith Holbert; Bobbie Mittel	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
785	Robert Smith	Parent	9/19/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 12; 2016 - draft for review/approval jm	Internal Communications	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 84 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
786	Robert Smith	Parent	9/19/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 12; 2016 + Summer Olympics guide; draft for review/approval jm	Internal Communications	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
787	Robert Smith	Parent	9/19/2016	Attorney Client Privilege - Duplicate Tips Reported for Withholdings	Johanna South	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Johanna South; Claude Phenix; Marilyn Sainlar; Bobbi Stewart; Susan Kinder	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
788	Robert Smith	Parent	9/19/2016	RE: New FOCUS Update	Robert Smith	Kristie Scott; Connie Houston; Robert Smith; Chris Roberts; John Matter; Jamie Youngblood	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
789	Robert Smith	Standalone	9/19/2016	RE: DOL Update	John Matter	Kristie Scott; Laura Jackson; Robert Smith; Tammy Rhodus; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	
790	Robert Smith	Parent	9/20/2016	Attorney-client Privileged - Do not forward	John Matter	John Matter; Robert Smith; Caroline Oyler; Billy Higdon; Jason Hudson; Kim Girdler; Caroline Miller Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
791	Robert Smith	Standalone	9/26/2016	Fort Bragg	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; John Matter; Brandi O'Neil; Marilyn Sainlar	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
792	Robert Smith	Standalone	9/26/2016	Fort Bragg	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; John Matter; Brandi O'Neil; Marilyn Sainlar; Paul Schork	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
793	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/18/2016	Fort Bragg	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; John Matter; Brandi O'Neil; Marilyn Sainlar	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
794	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/19/2016	Fort Bragg	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; John Matter; Brandi O'Neil; Marilyn Sainlar	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
795	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/21/2016	Fort Bragg	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; John Matter; Brandi O'Neil; Marilyn Sainlar	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts.	
796	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/21/2016	Fort Bragg	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; John Matter; Brandi O'Neil; Marilyn Sainlar	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
797	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/24/2016	Fort Bragg	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; John Matter; Brandi O'Neil; Marilyn Sainlar; Paul Schork	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
798	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/27/2016	Fort Bragg	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; John Matter; Brandi O'Neil; Marilyn Sainlar	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
799	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/27/2016	Fort Bragg	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; John Matter; Brandi O'Neil; Marilyn Sainlar; Paul Schork	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
800	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/27/2016	Fort Bragg	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; John Matter; Brandi O'Neil; Marilyn Sainlar: Paul Schork	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
801	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/27/2016	RE: Papa John's Store at 668 Wesley Drive	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Mary Hunt; Tammy Rhodus	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding DOL audit.	
802	Robert Smith	Parent	10/28/2016	FW: Ft. Bragg	Kristie Scott	Robert Smith; Marilyn Sainlar; Kristie Scott; John Matter; Paul Schork; Brandi O'Neil; Pat Connor; Karen Maxfield; Mike Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 85 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
803		Standalone		FW: Client privilege Re: Papa John's and the FLSA	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Ty Despain; Daniel Collinsworth; Kristie Scott; Jason Moore; Craig Jones; Torri Harris; Kelly Kelly; blupinguin@aol.com; Mary Hunt	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	bates range (neuacieu Documents)
804	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/28/2016	FW: Client privilege Re: Papa John's and the FLSA	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Ty Despain; Daniel Collinsworth; Kristie Scott; Jason Moore; Craig Jones; Torri Harris; Kelly Kelly; blupinguin@aol.com; Mary Hunt	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
805	Robert Smith	Parent	10/31/2016	FW: Notice of Charge of Discrimination	Robert Smith	Kristie Scott	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
806	Robert Smith	Parent	10/31/2016	FW: Papa John's Store at 514 W. Pike St.	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Frank Alvarado; Tammy Rhodus	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
807	Robert Smith	Parent		Broadcast Communications for October 27; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Susan Kinder; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
808	Robert Smith	Parent	11/1/2016	Broadcast Communications for October 27; 2016 + Pan challenge study results & updated Pepperoncini specs; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Susan Kinder; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 86 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
809	Robert Smith	Parent	11/3/2016	FW: Broadcast Communications for October 27; 2016 + Facebook advertising underlay; FINAL for review / approval	Julie Morley	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Suans Kinder; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
810	Robert Smith	Parent	11/3/2016	RE: Papa John's Store at 514 W. Pike St.	John Matter	John Matter; Robert Smith; Caroline Oyler; Frank Alvarado; Tammy Rhodus	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
811	Robert Smith	Parent	11/6/2016	Re: Papa John's Store at 514 W. Pike St.	Caroline Oyler	John Matter; Robert Smith; Caroline Oyler; Frank Alvarado; Tammy Rhodus	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
812	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/8/2016	RE: Papa John's Store at 514 W. Pike St.	Robert Smith	Robert Smith; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Frank Alvarado; Tammy Rhodus	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
813	Robert Smith	Parent	11/10/2016	Attorney-client privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Bobbi Stewart; Eddy Walker; Johanna South; RTISupport@internetrti.com; Carl Lofberg	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
814	Robert Smith	Parent	11/12/2016	Attorney Client Privilege	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Bobbi Stewart; John Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
815	Robert Smith	Parent	11/14/2016	Communications for November 1; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Moriey	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Susan Kinder; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
816	Robert Smith	Parent	11/14/2016	FW: Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Robert Smith; Billy Higdon; Caroline Oyler; Jason Hudson; Scott Corbin	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 87 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
817	Robert Smith	Parent	11/15/2016		Julie Morley	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Susan Kinder; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
818	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/15/2016	Attorney-client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Billy Higdon; Frank Alvarado; Tammy Rhodus	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
819	Robert Smith	Parent	11/15/2016	Broadcast Communications for November 8; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Susan Kinder; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts, Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
820	Robert Smith	Parent	11/15/2016	Broadcast Communications for November 10; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Susan Kinder; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
821	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/15/2016	FW: Today's Follow-Up	John Matter	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Billy Higdon Robert Smith; Shannon Burke	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures regarding rate calculation.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 88 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
822		Parent		PLEASE REVIEW - Broadcast Communications - Franchise Recruiting Solution	Jennifer Hauber	Robert Smith; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
823	Robert Smith	Standalone	11/15/2016	RE: PLEASE REVIEW - Broadcast Communications - Franchise Recruiting Solution	Robert Smith	Jennifer Hauber; John Matter; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
824	Robert Smith	Parent	5/22/2015	For Broadcast Communication	Jennifer Hauber	Julie Morley; Robert Smith; John Matter; Simon Smith; Kristie Scott	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
825	Robert Smith	Standalone	7/21/2015	Attorney/Client Privileged - FW: FW: Franchise Recruiting Site	Jennifer Hauber	Robert Smith; John Matter; Jennifer Hauber; Brandi O'Neil; Kristie Scott; Lydia Hall	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
826	Robert Smith	Standalone	7/28/2015	RE: For Broadcast Communication	Julie Morley	Jennifer Hauber; John Matter; Simon Smith; Kristie Scott; Julie Morley; Robert Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
827	Robert Smith	Standalone	7/28/2015	RE: REVISED RE: For Broadcast Communication	Julie Morley	Jennifer Hauber; Robert Smith; John Matter; Simon Smith; Kristie Scott; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
828		Parent	10/13/2015	Communications for November 15; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Susan Kinder; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
829	Robert Smith	Parent	10/15/2015	Broadcast Communications for November 15; 2016 + OPCON 2017; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Susan Kinder; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 89 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
FIIV LOG #	Robert Smith	Parent Parent	10/15/2015		Julie Morley	Jennifer Hauber; Robert Smith; John	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters, with	Dates Name (Nedacted Documents)
830				Broadcast Communication	,	Matter; Simon Smith; Kristie Scott; Julie Morley	·	attachments.	
831	Robert Smith	Standalone	10/15/2015	RE: REVISED RE: For Broadcast Communication	Julie Morley	Jennifer Hauber; Robert Smith; John Matter; Simon Smith; Kristie Scott; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
832	Scott Durigg	Parent	10/16/2015	Re: Fwd: Denver Hiring Script	Jason Moore	Scott Durrigg; Rick Moreland	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and draft communication, with attachments.	DURLING-PJI 360135 - DURLING-PJI 360136
833	Scott Durigg	Standalone	10/16/2015	Re: Fwd: Denver Hiring Script	Rick Moreland	Rick Moreland; Jason Moore; Scott Durigg	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and draft communication.	DURLING-PJI 360139 - DURLING-PJI 360141
834	Scott Durigg	Standalone		Re: Denver Hiring Script	Scott Durigg	Rick Moreland; Jason Moore; Scott Durigg	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues and draft communication.	DURLING-PJI 360142 - DURLING-PJI 360143
835	Scott Durigg	Parent	10/19/2015	Termination Request - WM Intellectuals Store 3726	Scott Durigg	Daniel Waddell; Simon Smith; John Low; Kim Winebrenner	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	
836	Scott Durigg	Standalone	10/19/2015	Re: Fw: AG to announce Papa John's settlements for labor violations New York Post	Scott Durigg	Scott Durigg; John Matter; Matt Van Note; Lance Tucker; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email containing legal advice regarding legal strategy for potential media statement.	
837	Scott Durigg	Standalone	11/2/2015	Re: Fw: AG to announce Papa John's settlements for labor violations New York Post	John Matter	John Matter; Matt Van Note; Caroline Oyler; Scott Durigg; Simon Smith; Lance Tucker	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email containing legal advice regarding legal strategy for potential media statement.	
838	Scott Durigg	Standalone	11/19/2015	Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Matt Van Note; Scott Durigg; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email containing legal advice regarding legal strategy for potential media statement.	
839	Scott Durigg	Standalone	11/20/2015	Re: Fw: Update on New York	Scott Durigg	Scott Durigg; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Edmond Heelan; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email containing legal advice regarding legal strategy for potential media statement.	
840	Scott Durigg	Standalone	12/11/2015	Re: Update on New York	Scott Durigg	John Matter; Scott Durigg; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Edmond Heelan	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email containing legal advice regarding legal strategy for potential media statement.	
841	Scott Durigg	Standalone	1/11/2016	Re: Fwd: Update on New York	Scott Durigg	John Matter; Scott Durigg; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Edmond Heelan; Bo Czyz	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email containing legal advice regarding legal strategy for potential media statement.	
842	Scott Durigg	Standalone	1/29/2016	Fw: Update on New York	Scott Durigg	John Matter; Scott Durigg; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Edmond Heelan	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email containing legal advice regarding legal strategy for potential media statement.	
843	Scott Durigg	Parent	1/29/2016	Re: Fwd: Attorney-Client Privileged	Matt Van Note	Matt Van Note; Scott Durigg; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Simon Smith; Lance Tucker	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email containing legal advice regarding legal strategy for potential media statement, with attachments.	
844	Scott Durigg	Parent	1/29/2016	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Scott Durigg	Scott Durigg; Simon Smith; Matt Van Note; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 90 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Potos Pongo (Podostod Posiumonto)
Priv Log #	Scott Durigg	Parent	2/1/2016	NY State Delivery Fee (Don Ceccarelli	Scott Durigg; Steve Colbert; Matt Van	Attorney-Client Communication	Description Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication with	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
845				Request from Franchisee)		Note; Jeanne Jefferson; John Low; Jeff Williams	·	attachments.	
846	Scott Durigg	Standalone	2/1/2016	Re: Fwd: Driver reimbursements	Scott Durigg	Scott Durigg; Michael Meche; Mike Coomes; Rick Thompson; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Joel Cooney; Charles Lomax Jr.	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
847	Scott Durigg	Standalone	2/1/2016	Re: Looking for recommended talking points	Scott Durigg	Scott Durigg; Jeanne Jefferson; Kristie Scott; Jeff Williams; Steve Colbert; Matt Van Note; Don Ceccarelli; John Low; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Michael Meche; Joel Cooney	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
848	Scott Durigg	Parent	5/9/2016	Fw: ZOOMER Syracuse ADI	Don Ceccarelli	Jason Wade; Scott Durigg; Brad Jones; Steve Ritchie John Schnatter; Tim Ohearn; Bo Czyz; Don Ceccarelli; Peter Mihelich; Nadeem Bajwa	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	DURLING-PJI 361863 - DURLING-PJI 361864
849	Don Ceccarelli	Standalone	5/18/2016	Re: ZOOMER Syracuse ADI	Jason Wade	Jason Wade; Don Ceccarelli; Scott Durigg; Brad Jones; Steve Ritchie; John Scnatter; Tim O'Hearn; Bo Czyz; Peter Mihelich; Nadeem Bajwa	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 361869 - DURLING-PJI 361870
850	Don Ceccarelli	Standalone	5/24/2016	Re: ZOOMER Syracuse ADI	Scott Durigg	Jason Wade; Don Ceccarelli; Brad Jones; Steve Ritchie; John Schnatter; Tim Ohearn; Scott Durigg; Bo Czyz; Peter Mihelich; Nadeem Bajwa	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 361871 - DURLING-PJI 361873
851	Don Ceccarelli	Standalone	5/24/2016	Re: ZOOMER Syracuse ADI	Scott Durigg	Jason Wade; Don Ceccarelli; Scott Durigg; Brad Jones; Steve Ritchie; John Schnatter; Tim O'Hearn; Bo Czyz; Peter Mihelich; Nadeem Bajwa		Email reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 361940 - DURLING-PJI 361942
852	Scott Durigg	Standalone	7/15/2016	Re: ZOOMER Syracuse ADI	Jason Wade	Jason Wade; Don Ceccarelli; Brad Jones; Steve Ritchie; John Schnatter; Tim Ohearn; Scott Durigg; Bo Czyz; Peter Mihelich; Nadeem Bajwa	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 361943 - DURLING-PJI 361945
853	Don Ceccarelli	Standalone	7/18/2016	Re: ZOOMER Syracuse ADI	Scott Durigg	Jason Wade; Don Ceccarelli; Brad Jones; Steve Ritchie; John Schnatter; Tim Ohearn; Scott Durigg; Bo Czyz; Peter Mihelich; Nadeem Bajwa	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 361946 - DURLING-PJI 361949
854	Scott Durigg	Child	2/2/2016	Van Note Pizza and Service.xls	Scott Durigg		Attorney-Client Communication	Spreadsheet containing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 362068 - DURLING-PJI 362068
855	Scott Durigg	Child	2/5/2016	Van Note Pizza and Service.xls	Scott Durigg		Attorney-Client Communication	Spreadsheet containing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 362070 - DURLING-PJI 362070
856	Scott Durigg	Child	2/5/2016	Van Note Pizza and Service.xls	Scott Durigg		Attorney-Client Communication	Spreadsheet containing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 362275 - DURLING-PJI 362275

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 91 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
857	Scott Durigg	Standalone	10/25/2016	Fwd: PJPA re-finance update	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Scott Durigg; Joe Smith; Tim O'Hearn; Lance Tucker; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler; Oz Bengur; Eric Danver		Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
858	Scott Durigg	Standalone	5/14/2015	Re: Fwd: Complaint on Store No. 4205; Ticket #JLIM-A9SLD4	Jeff Williams	Scott Durigg; Eduardo Cruz; Jeff Williams; Juhnelle Lim; Fani Ghulam	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 362792 - DURLING-PJI 362794
859	Scott Durigg	Standalone	5/17/2015	Re: Complaint on Store No. 4205; Ticket #JLIM- A9SLD4	Scott Durigg	Scott Durigg; Eduardo Cruz; Jeff Williams; Juhnelle Lim; Fani Ghulam	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 362795 - DURLING-PJI 362797
860	Scott Durigg	Parent	5/18/2015	Fw: Attached is the Evaluation - Store: 2988 Score: 45.0	Scott Durigg	Kim Winebrenner; Daniel Waddell Eduardo Cruz	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	
861	Scott Durigg	Standalone	6/5/2015	Re: Attorney-client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Scott Durigg; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
862	Scott Durigg	Standalone	7/19/2015	Re: Attorney-client Privileged	Scott Durigg	John Matter; Scott Durigg; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Edmond Heelan	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
863	Scott Durigg	Parent	7/19/2015	Fwd: Attached is the Evaluation - Store: 2988 Score: 51.0	Scott Durigg	Daniel Waddell; Simon Smith; Nelson Hertzog	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	
864	Scott Durigg	Parent	7/19/2015	Fw: FBD Presentation	Simon Smith	Joe Smith; Bobby Meroney; Mike Coomes; Rick Thompson; Scott Durigg	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
865	Scott Durigg	Parent	8/3/2015	RE: AMHC Food; Inc. (Store #3451) - Insurance Default Letter sent 8/1/2016	Nelson Hertzog	Steve Ritchie; Scott Durrigg; Brenda Reynolds; Nelson Hertzog; Marilyn Ecker; David Orberson; Simon Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	
866	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	8/6/2015	FW: M FAMILY INC Store 3339 Request to close for 1 Day	Scott Durigg	Scott Durigg; Simon Smith; Edmond Heelan; Nelson Hertzog; Daniel Waddell; Sharon Layman; Clark Spader; Caroline Oyler; Dustin Couts; Debbie Minch; Brenda Wells; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	
867	Scott Durigg	Standalone	8/6/2015	RE: M FAMILY INC Store 3339 Request to close for 1 Day	Daniel Waddell	Scott Durigg; Edmond Heelan; Nelson Hertzog; Daniel Waddell; Sharon Layman; Clark Spader; Caroline Oyler; Dustin Couts; Debbie Minch; Brenda Wells; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	
868	Scott Durigg	Parent	9/8/2015	RE: John Matter on "Legal Matters"FBD promotable class #13	John Matter	All Division Vice Presidents; Edmond Heelan; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Bo Czyz; Akshoy Maharish; Anthony Stamper; Bobby Sageser; Carl Greene; Christopher Hodges; Dwayne Jones; Jesse McBain; Mark Slone; Mike Bandy; Mike Bound; Ray Turner; Robert Duncan; Socorro Patag	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 92 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
869	Simon Smith	Standalone	10/13/2015		Simon Smith	Simon Smith; John Matter; Robert Smith; Danette Rhoads; Rich Butler; Caroline Oyler; Susan Rector		Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	The state of the s
870	Simon Smith	Standalone	10/15/2015	Re: Fwd: Attn: John Schnatter	Simon Smith	Rick Thompson; Simon Smith; Dan Waddell; Chris Stelle; Julie Morley; Edmond Heelan; jill@evgrealestate.com; Jillschoenborn; Internal Communications	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
871	Simon Smith	Standalone	10/15/2015	Fw: Attention needed: Bitcoin press release	Christy Johnson	Bo Czyz; Simon Smith; Steve Colbert; Laurie DeRuntz; Christy Johnson; Julia McGuffey; Lyndsay Railey; Jim Ensign; Stephen Goodemoot; Paul Paterakis; markham@mail.amc.edu; Elizabeth Ploshay; Chris Dosch; Julia Patterson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement.	
872	Simon Smith	Standalone	10/16/2015	Re: Broadcast Communications for June 4; 2015	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Julie Morley; Mike Coomes; Daniel Waddell; Jason Wade; Simon Smith; Steve Ritchie; Internal Communications; Communications; Corporate; Papa Johns	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
873	Simon Smith	Parent	10/19/2015	Fwd: New York Post article	Caroline Oyler	Steve Ritchie; Simon Smith; Bob Kraut; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; George Pauta; Caroline Oyler; April Corrigan; Bryan Mosca; John Cordo; Milton Marquis	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
874	Simon Smith	Parent		Fwd: New York Post article	Simon Smith	Joe Smith; Steve Ritchie; Simon Smith; Bob Kraut; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; George Pauta; Caroline Oyler; April Corrigan; Bryan Mosca; John Cordo; Milton Marquis	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email containing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
875	Simon Smith	Parent	10/29/2015	Fwd: New York Post article	Simon Smith	Bo Czyz; Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Simon Smith; Bob Kraut; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; George Pauta; April Corrigan; Bryan Mosca; John Cordo; Milton Marquis	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	
876	Simon Smith	Parent	11/9/2015	FAC Proposed Agenda	Steve Ritchie	Steve Ritchie; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Bob Kraut; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft document, with attachments.	
877	Simon Smith	Standalone	11/14/2015	Fwd: Communication Estimated Payroll Report	Cynthia McClellen	Steve Ritchie; Susan Kinder; Dustin Couts, Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Cynthia McClellen	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and draft communcation.	DURLING-PJI 363166 - DURLING-PJI 363167
878	Simon Smith	Standalone	12/14/2015	Re: Communication Estimated Payroll Report	Steve Ritchie	Steve Ritchie; Susan Kinder; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Dustin Couts; Cynthia McClellen	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and draft communication.	DURLING-PJI 363168 - DURLING-PJI 363169

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 93 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
879	Simon Smith	Standalone	1/16/2016	Re: Fw: AG to announce Papa John's settlements for labor violations New York Post	John Matter	John Matter; Matt Van Note; Caroline Oyler; Scott Durigg; Simon Smith; Lance Tucker		Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	bates Mange (Neuacteu Documents)
880	Simon Smith	Standalone	1/16/2016	Attorney-Client Privileged	John Matter	John Matter; Matt Van Note; Caroline Oyler; Scott Durigg; Simon Smith; Lance Tucker	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
881	Simon Smith	Standalone	1/25/2016	Fw: Update on New York	Scott Durigg	John Matter; Matt Van Note; Caroline Oyler; Scott Durigg; Simon Smith; Lance Tucker; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email reflecting legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	
882	Simon Smith	Parent	2/15/2016	Re: Fw: Attorney-Client Privileged	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Scott Durigg; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Matt Van Note	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
883	Simon Smith	Parent	2/20/2016	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Scott Durigg; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Matt Van Note	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
884	Simon Smith	Standalone	3/4/2016	Re: Fw: Garrett Schanck of JG Operations - looking for information on settlement of driver lawsuit	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Robert Porter; Rick Thompson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
885	Simon Smith	Parent	5/26/2016	Fw: November FAC Mtg Agenda & Pre Reads	Simon Smith	Toni Capito; Simon Smith; Bo Czyz; Mike Coomes; Rick Thompson; Michael Meche; Scott Durigs; Steve Ritchie; Nadeem Bajwa; Robert Carroll; Keith Sullins; Bill Freitas; Vaughn Frey; Dougle Allen; Tina Glover; Philip Horn; Bill Green; Joseph Hogue; Rick Mohler; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Wade Oney; Paul Robinson; David Rothman; Eric Murphy; Tim O'Hern; Lance Tucker; Cynthia McClellen; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Shane Hutchins; Sean Muldoon; Robert Thompson; Edmond Heelan	Attorney Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
886	Simon Smith	Standalone	5/26/2016	Re: Incident Store 136 Driver Assaulted	Rick Thompson	John Matter; James Asencio; Adam Waddell; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Paul Johnson; Cara VanCleave; Lyndsay Railey; David Orberson; Craig Jones; Pete McCartney; Steven Mercer; Peter Collins; Kristie Scott; Dustin Couts; Chuck Simon; Tracy Friedlein; Mark McCormack; Craig Browning; Stephanie Taylor; Jenny Newman; James Hand; Michael Upton; Lora Murray; Carolyn Vincent; Bryan Bays; Rick Thompson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
887	Simon Smith	Parent	5/28/2016	2016 Franchise Agreement	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Philip Horn; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft legal document with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 94 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
888	Simon Smith	Parent	7/6/2016	2016 Franchise Agreement	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Philip Horn; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft legal document, with attachments.	
889	Simon Smith	Standalone	7/8/2016	Re: Wage & Hour Rule	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Fredrick Preis	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor matters.	
890	Simon Smith	Standalone	7/9/2016	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged.	Simon Smith	John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
891	Simon Smith	Standalone	7/9/2016	Re: Attorney-Client Privileged.	Simon Smith	John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Simon Smith; Edmond Heelan; Jason Wade; Rich Butler; Kristie Scott; Robert Smith; Chris Titshaw; Dustin Couts	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
892	Simon Smith	Parent	7/9/2016	ELT Pre-read	Peggy Bentley	Caroline Oyler; Cynthia McClellen; Edmond Heelan; Jack Swaysland; John Schnatter; Lance Tucker; Robert Smith; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon; Shane Hutchins; Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern; Simon Smith; Denise Robinson; Don Graham; Joe Smith; Karen Churchill; Kim Girdler; Kimberly Keller; Liz Essen; Melinda Lutz; Mike Measells; Molly Small; Paul Johnson; Peggy Bentley; Robin Kennedy; Shannon Baete; Sherry Russell; Stacy Hadley; Toni Capito	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
893	Simon Smith	Parent	8/16/2016	Re: Draft FAC Meeting Minutes	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Kim Girdler; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon; Robert Smith; Cynthia McCiellen; Shane Hutchins; David Orberson; Caroline Oyler; Toni Capito; Melinda Lutz; Liz Essen; Kimberly Keller; Shannon Baete; Sherry Russell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication/document, with attachments.	
894	Simon Smith	Parent	8/21/2016	Fwd: *Confidential: February FAC Meeting Minutes - Time Sensitive	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Mike Coomes; Scott Durigg; Michael Meche; Rick Thompson; Lamont Muchmore; Kim Girdler; Caroline Oyler; Clark Mandigo; Phil Horn; Toni Capito; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Nadeem Bajwa; Robert Carroll; Keith Sullins; Bill Freitas; Vaughn Frey; Dougle Allen; Tina Glover; Bill Green; Joseph Hogue; Rick Mohler; Wade Oney; Eric Murphy	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication/document, with attachments.	
895	Simon Smith	Standalone	8/26/2016	Fwd: PJPA re-finance update	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Scott Durigg; Joe Smith; Tim O'Hearn; Lance Tucker; Steve Ritchie, Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler; Oz Bengur; Eric Danver		Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 95 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
896	Simon Smith	Standalone	9/1/2016	Re: whistleblower hotline	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Debbie Tate; Clara Passafiume; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim.	-
897	Simon Smith	Parent	10/5/2016	Fwd: whistleblower hotline	Simon Smith	Caroline Oyler; Debbie Tate; Clara Passafiume; John Matter; Simon Smith; Bobby Meroney	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim, with attachments.	
898	Simon Smith	Standalone	10/12/2016	Re: whistleblower hotline	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Bobby Meroney; John Matter; Laura Jackson; Torri Harris; Joseph Shahady; Caroline Oyler; Debbie Tate	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim.	
899	Simon Smith	Parent	10/12/2016	Fwd: whistleblower hotline	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Bobby Meroney; Debbie Tate; Caroline Miller Oyler; Caroline Oyler; Clara Passafiume; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
900	Simon Smith	Parent	10/25/2016	RE: whistleblower hotline	Debbie Tate	Debbie Tate; Joseph Shahady; Bobby Meroney; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Clara Passafiume; John Matter; Caroline Miller Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding investigation of potential claim, with attachments.	
901	Simon Smith	Parent	6/14/2016	Fwd: Racial Slur in delivery remark	Craig Jones	Peter Collins; Lyndsay Railey; Jim Hartley; Mike Coomes; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Jason Wade; Cara Van Cleave; Chuck Simon; Alison Turner; Jasmine West; Pete McCartney	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
902	Simon Smith	Standalone	7/18/2016	Re: Racial Slur in delivery remark	Craig Jones	Peter Collins; John Matter; Lyndsay Railey; Jim Hartley; Mike Coomes; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Kristie Scott; Cara VanCleave; Chuck Simon; Jason Wade; Craig Jones; Alison Turner; Jasmine West; Pete McCartney; Ray Hibdon; rlclark75@gmail.com	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
903	Simon Smith	Standalone	5/14/2015	Re: Racial Slur in delivery remark	Peter Collins	Peter Collins; John Matter; Lyndsay Railey, Jim Hartley; Mike Coomes; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Kristie Scott; Cara VanCleave; Chuck Simon; Jason Wade; Craig Jones; Alison Turner; Jasmine West; Pete McCartney; Ray Hibdon; rlclark75@gmail.com; Leah Schultz	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 96 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
904	Simon Smith	Standalone	5/19/2015	FW: Broadcast Communications for August 16; 2016 - for review / approval		Tim Newton; Paul Gilkey; Benjamin Jones; Jason Wade; Dustin Couts; Michael Meche; Simon Smith; Edmond Heelan; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
905	Simon Smith	Standalone	7/13/2015	Re: Legal at Road Show	Edmond Heelan	Bobby Meroney; Simon Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
906	Simon Smith	Parent	7/15/2015	FW: FAC minutes	Caroline Oyler	Kim Girdler; Caroline Oyler; Sean Muldoon; Shane Hutchins; Edmond Heelan; Steve Ritchie; Robert Thompson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication/document, with attachments.	
907	Simon Smith	Parent	7/23/2015	FW: Louisiana Flood Victims Store 3133	Toni Capito	Toni Capito; Simon Smith; Maria Lindle; Rob Porter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding human resource matters, with attachments.	
908	Scott Durigg	Child	9/21/2016	P9 Webcast.pdf	Darryl Carr		Attorney-Client Communication	Document containing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	DURLING-PJI 364218 - DURLING-PJI 364264
909	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	7/28/2015	Re: whistleblower hotline complaint - store no. 1088	Hasan Lokhandwala	Hasan Lokhandwala; Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Clara Passafiume; Debbie Tate	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
910	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	7/28/2015	RE: M FAMILY INC Store 3339 Request to close for 1 Day	John Matter	Scott Durigg; Edmond Heelan; Nelson Hertzog; Daniel Waddell; Sharon Layman; Clark Spader; Caroline Oyler; Dustin Couts; Debbie Minch; Brenda Wells; John Matter; Simon Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
911	Scott Durigg	Standalone	7/29/2015	Re: M FAMILY INC Store 3339 Request to close for 1 Day	Edmond Heelan	Scott Durigg; Edmond Heelan; Nelson Hertzog; Daniel Waddell; Sharon Layman; Clark Spader; Caroline Oyler; Dustin Couts; Debbie Minch; Brenda Wells; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
912	Robert Smith	Parent	8/2/2015	FW: FAC Pre Reads & Agenda - TIME SENSITIVE	Edmond Heelan	Executive Leadership Team; Simon Smith; Executive Leadership Team Assistants; Toni Capito; John Smith; Robert Thompson; Dustin Couts; Sean Muldoon; Anne Fischer; CAroline Oyler; Shane Hutchins; Edmond Heelan; Kimberly Keller; Melinda Lutz; Marilyn Ecker; Kim Girdler; Liz Essen; Eric Hartman	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
913	Stephen Colbert	Parent	8/3/2015	Fwd: Attached is the Evaluation - Store: 3623 Score: 62.0	Steve Colbert	Nelson Hertzog; Scott Durigg; Daniel Waddell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 97 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
914	Stephen Colbert	Parent	8/3/2015	Re: Store 4501	Katie Mays	Steve Colbert; Charles Tiedemann	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
915	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	8/3/2015	Re: Memo re Joint Employer - Privileged	Steve Ritchie	Steve Ritchie; Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker; Robert Smith; Danette Rhoads; Susan Rector	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
916	Steve Ritchie	Parent	8/4/2015	Re: FAC Meeting Minutes	Steve Ritchie	Steve Ritchie; Kim Girdler; Toni Capito; ill@evgrealestate.com; Melinda Lutz; Peggy Bentley; Robin Kennedy; Shannon Baete; Cynthia McClellen; John Schnatter; Lance Tucker; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Shane Hutchins; Tim O'Hern	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication/document with attachments.	
917	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	8/6/2015	Re: Fw: Media Flag - NY Franchisee in Custody for Wage Theft	Steve Ritchie	Steve Ritchie; Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker; Eric Zeugschmidt; John Matter; Bob Kraut; Lyndsay Railey; PapaJohns@Edelman.com	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding human resources matters.	
918	Steve Ritchie	Parent	8/6/2015	Broadcast Communications for July 23; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Jim Ensign; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bob Kraut; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Michelle Hefferman; Tim Newton; Michele O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julie Morley	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
919	Steve Ritchie	Parent	8/6/2015	Broadcast Communications for July 28; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Jim Ensign; Robert Thompson; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Lance Tucker; Bob Kraut; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Tim Newton; Michele O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Ton Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
920	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	8/7/2015	Fw: Communication Estimated Payroll Report	Dustin Couts	Steve Ritchie; Susan Kinder; Dustin Couts; Cynthia McClellen	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	DURLING-PJI 364637 - DURLING-PJI 364638
921	Steve Ritchie	Parent	8/11/2015	Luntz Q&A edits	Lance Tucker	Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
922	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	8/13/2015	Re: Luntz Q&A edits	Lance Tucker	Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
923	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	8/13/2015	Re: Luntz Q&A edits	Steve Ritchie	Lance Tucker; Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	_

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 98 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
924	Steve Ritchie	Parent	8/20/2015	FAC Proposed Agenda	Steve Ritchie	Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Bob Kraut; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Lance Tucker; Shane Hutchins; Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
925	Steve Ritchie	Parent	8/24/2015	Broadcast Communications for August 4; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Jim Ensign; Robert Thompson; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Lance Tucker; Bob Kraut; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Tim Newton; Michele O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
926	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	8/25/2015	Fwd: Communication Estimated Payroll Report	Cynthia McClellen	Steve Ritchie; Susan Kinder; Dustin Couts; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Cynthia McClellen	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	DURLING-PJI 364646 - DURLING-PJI 364647
927	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	8/27/2015	Re: Communication Estimated Payroll Report	Steve Ritchie	Steve Ritchie; Susan Kinder; Dustin Couts; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Cynthia McClellen	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	DURLING-PJI 364648 - DURLING-PJI 364649
928	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	8/27/2015	Re: Communication Estimated Payroll Report	Dustin Couts	Steve Ritchie; Cynthia McClellen; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Susan Kinder; Dustin Couts	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	DURLING-PJI 364650 - DURLING-PJI 364652
929	Steve Ritchie	Parent	9/1/2015	Broadcast Communications for August 6; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Jim Ensign; Robert Thompson; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Lance Tucker; Bob Kraut; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; John Smith; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Tim Newton; Michele O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
930	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	9/25/2015	Fw: Communication Estimated Payroll Report	Dustin Couts	Edmond Heelan; Steve Richie; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Susan Kinder; Dustin Couts; Julie Morley; Cynthia McClellen	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 99 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
931	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/1/2015	Broadcast Communications for August 6; 2015 + est payroll report notice; for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Jim Ensign; Robert Thompson; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Lance Tucker; Bob Kraut; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; John Smith; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Tim Newton; Michele O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
932	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/15/2015	Broadcast Communications for August 11; 2015 - for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Jim Ensign; Robert Thompson; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Lance Tucker; Bob Kraut; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Tim Newton; Michele O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler		Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
933	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/15/2015	Broadcast Communications for August 13; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Jim Ensign; Robert Thompson; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Lance Tucker; Bob Kraut; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Tim Newton; Michele O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler		Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
934	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/16/2015	Broadcast Communications for August 13; 2015 + 60- second commercial; final for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Jim Ensign; Robert Thompson; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Tim Newton; Michele O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 100 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
935	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/20/2015	FAC Meeting Minutes	Kim Girdler	Kim Girdler; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Cynthia McClellen; Bob Kraut; Robert Smith; Toni Capito; Sherry Russell; Melinda Lutz; Liz Essen; Kimberly Keller; Shannon Baete	Attorney Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
936	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/20/2015	FAC Meeting Minutes	Kim Girdler	Kim Girdler; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Cynthia McClellen; Bob Kraut; Shane Hutchins; Sean Muldoon; Toni Capito; Sherry Russell; Melinda Lutz; Liz Essen; Caroline Oyler; Debbie Tate	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
937	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/23/2015	FAC Minutes	Toni Capito	Debbie Tate; Toni Capito; Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
938	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/26/2015	Broadcast Communications for August 27; 2015 - for review /approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Jim Ensign; Robert Thompson; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Lance Tucker; Bob Kraut; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Tim Newton; Michelle O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
939	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/27/2015	Broadcast Communications for August 27; 2015 + NFL Fox Integration; final for review /approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Jim Ensign; Robert Thompson; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Lance Tucker; Bob Kraut; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Tim Newton; Michelle Hefferman; Tim Newton; Michele O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
940	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/27/2015	Broadcast Communications for September 1; 2015 - for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Jim Ensign; Robert Thompson; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Lance Tucker; Bob Kraut; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Tim Newton; Michelle O'Hern; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 101 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
941	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/29/2015	Foreign Object/Illness Complaints	David Orberson	Rita Palmer; Keeta Fox; Sean Muldoon; Steve Ritchie; Brenda Reynolds; Edmond Heelan; Mary Miller	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
942	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/29/2015	Foreign Object/Illness Complaints	David Orberson	Rita Palmer; Keeta Fox; Sean Muldoon; Steve Ritchie; Brenda Reynolds; Edmond Heelan; Mary Miller	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
943	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	10/29/2015	Re: Delivery Tracker	John Matter	John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Anne Fischer; Tim Newton; Steve Coke; Dustin Couts; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Craig Powell; Carmine Cappuccio; Rodney Harrison	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
944	Steve Ritchie	Parent	11/3/2015	Broadcast Communications for October 15; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
945	Steve Ritchie	Parent	11/3/2015	Foreign Object/Illness Complaints	David Orberson	Rita Palmer; Keeta Fox; Sean Muldoon; Debbie Tate; John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Brenda Reynolds; Edmond Heelan; Mary Miller	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
946	Steve Ritchie	Parent	11/5/2015	Broadcast Communications for October 20; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 102 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian Steve Ritchie	Parent/Child Parent	Date 11/6/2015	File Name/Subject Broadcast Communications for October 20; 2015 + P11 early start reminder; final for review / approval	Author/From Julie Morley	Recipients Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler		Description Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
948	Steve Ritchie	Parent	11/10/2015	Q&A	Lance Tucker	Keeta Fox; Amber McNew; Steve Coke; Brad Lacy; Steve Ritchie	Attorney Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
949	Steve Ritchie	Parent	11/12/2015	Re: Investigation	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Robert Smith; Steve Ritchie	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
950	Steve Ritchie	Parent	11/17/2015	Broadcast Communications for October 27; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
951	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	11/17/2015	Re: Investigation	Robert Smith	Robert Smith; John Matter; Caroline Oyler; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
952		Parent		Fw: November FAC Meeting-Agenda	Steve Ritchie	Paul W. Robinson; Simon Smith; Steve Ritchie; Toni Capito; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Phillip Horn; Lance Tucker; Sean Muldoon; Cynthia McClellen; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler; Robert Thompson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
953	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	11/18/2015	Re: Fw: Garrett Schanck of JG Operations - looking for information on settlement of driver lawsuit	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Robert Porter; Rick Thompson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 103 of 141

Duite Land	Cooks dis	Daniel (Child	D-4-	File News (Cubi	A. Ale /F	Desiriente	Policile Perio	Description	Data Barra (Dada da Da coma
Priv Log # 954	Custodian Edmond Heelan	Parent/Child Standalone	Date 11/18/2015	File Name/Subject Re: Fw: Garrett Schanck of JG Operations - looking for information on settlement of driver lawsuit	Author/From Edmond Heelan	Recipients Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Simon Smith; Steve Ritchie; Rob Porter; Rick Thompson	Privilege Basis Attorney-Client Communication	Description Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
955	Steve Ritchie	Child	11/2/2015	Most likely Conf Call Questions Q3 2015 103015.docx	Lance Tucker		Attorney-Client Communication	Document reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 364702 - DURLING-PJI 364711
956	Steve Ritchie	Parent	11/20/2015	Re: Fw: Most likely Conf Call Questions Q3 2015 103015	Keeta Fox	Amber McNew; Executive Leadership Team; Lance Tucker	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
957	Steve Ritchie	Parent	11/24/2015	Broadcast Communications for November 3; 2015 - for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddeli; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern, Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
958	Steve Ritchie	Parent	11/24/2015	Broadcast Communications for November 5; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddeli; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern, Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
959	Steve Ritchie	Parent	12/1/2015	Broadcast Communications for November 5; 2015 + new EG gaming ptrship; for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern, Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 104 of 141

D.:	Ct	D		File New York	A	David de la constant	Data dia non-	Durch	P-1 P (P-1
Priv Log #	Custodian Steve Ritchie	Parent/Child Parent	Date 12/1/2015	File Name/Subject Broadcast	Author/From Julie Morley	Recipients Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond	Privilege Basis Attorney-Client Communication	Description Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
960	Steve Ritchie	Parent	12/1/2015	Broadcast Communications for November 10; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Moriey	Julie Moriey; Steve kitchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Lient Communication	than seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
961	Steve Ritchie	Parent	12/1/2015	Broadcast Communications for November 12; 2015 - for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
962	Steve Ritchie	Parent	12/1/2015	Broadcast Communications for November 17; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
963	Steve Ritchie	Parent	12/3/2015	Broadcast Communications for November 17; 2015 + P12 Cheese Price memo; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 105 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
964	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	12/3/2015	Draft communication re: lawsuit and mileage reimbursement	Caroline Oyler	Muchmore; Philip Horn; Simon Smith; Steve Ritchie; Paul Robinson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
965	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	12/8/2015	RE: Draft communication re: lawsuit and mileage reimbursement	Paul Robinson	Paul Robinson; Caroline Oyler; Clark Mandigo; Edmond Heelan; Lamont Muchmore; Philip Horn; Simon Smith; Steve Ritchie	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
966	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	12/10/2015	Re: Draft communication re: lawsuit and mileage reimbursement	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Clark Mandingo; Edmond Heelan; Lamont Muchmore; Philip Horn; Simon Smith; Steve Ritchie; Paul Robinson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
967	Steve Ritchie	Parent	12/10/2015	FAC Meeting Minutes - DRAFT	Kim Girdler	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Toni Capito; Steve Ritchie	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
968	Steve Ritchie	Parent	12/17/2015	Broadcast Communications for November 24; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
969	Steve Ritchie	Parent	12/29/2015	Broadcast Communications for November 24; 2015 + EG Gaming extension; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Carolline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
970	Steve Ritchie	Parent	12/29/2015	Broadcast Communications for December 1; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 106 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
971	Steve Ritchie	Parent	12/29/2015	Broadcast Communications for December 1; 2015 + P12 updates & V-day opt-in; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
972	Edmond Heelan	Standalone	12/30/2015	Re: Fw: Broadcast Communications for December 1; 2015 + P12 updates & V-day opt-in; final for review / approval	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
973	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	12/30/2015	Re: Broadcast Communications for December 1; 2015 + P12 updates & V-day opt-in; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Edmond Heelan; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
974	Steve Ritchie	Parent	12/31/2015	Broadcast Communications for December 1; 2015 + P1 Direct Mail; final final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication; Work Product	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 107 of 141

					1-				
Priv Log #	Custodian Steve Ritchie	Parent/Child Parent	Date 1/4/2016	File Name/Subject Broadcast	Author/From Julie Morley	Recipients Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond	Privilege Basis Attorney-Client Communication; Work		Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
975				Communications for December 3; 2015 - for review / approval		Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Product	be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
976	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/4/2016	Broadcast Communications for December 3; 2015 + P12 50% off offer & iOS Release 4.7; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Ken Cox; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
977	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/5/2016	Broadcast Communications for December 8; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
978	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/7/2016	Broadcast Communications for December 10; 2015 + Online Ordering Outages; final for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Julia McGuffey	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 108 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
979	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/7/2016	Broadcast Communications for December 15; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
980	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/8/2016	Broadcast Communications for December 17; 2015 + 12/16 antibiotic free news release; updated P2 intro; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
981	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/11/2016	Broadcast Communications for December 29; 2015 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
982	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/12/2016	Broadcast Communications for December 29; 2015 + Road Trip doc updated; for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 109 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
983	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/12/2016	Broadcast Communications for December 29; 2015 + media stmt on Peyton Manning; final for today		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
984	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/12/2016	Broadcast Communications for December 31; 2015 - for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
985	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	1/14/2016	Re: Broadcast Communications for December 31; 2015 - for review / approval		Toni Capito; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards- Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia mcClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
986	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/14/2016	Broadcast Communications for December 31; 2015 - final for today; will send around 1 pm	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 110 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
987	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/15/2016	Fw: Wage & Hour Rule	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Simon Smith; Fred Preis	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures, with attachments.	
988	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	1/19/2016	Re: Wage & Hour Rule	Simon Smith	Simon Smith; Caroline Oyler; Robert Smith; Steve Ritchie Fred Preis	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
989	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/19/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 5; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern, Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
990	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/19/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 7; 2016 - for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern, Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
991	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/19/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 7; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Bill Cox; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 111 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
992	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/21/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 7; 2016 + QCC survey results; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	bates mange (neuacteu bocuments)
993	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/21/2016	Talking Points for Legal Issues on Road Trip	John Matter	John Matter; Steve Ritchie; Edmond heelan; Simon Smith; Scott Durigg; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	
994	Steve Ritchie	Child	1/11/2016	Quality Guarantee Overview.pdf	Bill Cox		Attorney-Client Communication	Document reflecting legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts.	DURLING-PJI 364767 - DURLING-PJI 364778
995	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/25/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 12; 2016 - for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michel O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
996	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/26/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 12; 2016 + Quality Guarantee; for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; John Matther; Julia McGuffey	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 112 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
997	Steve Ritchie	Parent	1/26/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 12; 2016 + Parmesan pkts & Anchovies; for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; John Matter; Julia McGuffey	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
998	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/2/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 14; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
999	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/4/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 14; 2016 + 2016 ACH dates; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 113 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1000	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/9/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 19; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michel O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1001	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/9/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 14; 2016 + 2016 ACH dates; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; teve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1002	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/11/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 19; 2016 - + P1-2 eCRM; for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 114 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1003	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/13/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 19; 2016 - + store listings recommendations; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1004	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/16/2016	Re: Broadcast Communications for January 21; 2016 - for review / approval	Daniel Waddell	Daniel Waddell; Julie Morley; Anne Fischer; Bernie Fussenegger; Bill Cox; Caroline Oyler; Christy Johnson; Connie Houston; Cynthia McClellen; Don Graham; Dustin Couts; Edmond Heelan; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; John Smith; Kevin Matthews; Kim Girdler; Lance Tucker; Melisas Richards-Person; Michele O'Hern; Michelle Heffernan; Pat Dunigan; Peter Collins; Rich Butler; Robert Smith; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon; Shane Hutchins; Steve Ritchie; Tim Newton; Toni Capito	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1005	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/16/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 21; 2016 + RTS release update; for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Roger Cox; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 115 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1006	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/16/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 21; 2016 + RTS release update; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Roger Cox; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	vates mange (nevacieu bocuments)
1007	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/16/2016	Foreign Object/Illness Complaints	David Orberson	Rita Palmer; Keeta Fox; Sean Muldoon; Steve Ritchie; Brenda Reynolds; Edmond Heelan; Mary Miller	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
1008	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/18/2016	ELT Pre-read	Peggy Bentley	Caroline Oyler; Cynthia McClellen; Edmond Heelan; Jack Swaysland; John Schnatter; Lance Tucker; Robert Smith; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon; Shane Hutchins; Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern; Simon Smith; Denise Robinson; Don Graham; Joe Smith; Karen Churchill; Kim Girdler; Kimberly Keller; Liz Essen; Melinda Lutz; Mike Measells; Molly Small; Paul Johnson; Peggy Bentley; Robin Kennedy; Shannon Baete; Sherry Russell; Stacy Hadley; Toni Capito	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures and draft communication, with attachments.	
1009	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/19/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 26; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Bulter; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 116 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1010	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/19/2016	Broadcast Communications for January 26; 2016 + Papa Rewards print products; for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michel O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1011	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/23/2016	Broadcast Communications for February 2; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchle; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1012	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/26/2016	Broadcast Communications for February 4; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Revin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 117 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1013	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/29/2016	Broadcast Communications for February 9; 2016 - for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1014	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/29/2016	Broadcast Communications for February 9; 2016 + FOCUS calibration & P3 local underlay; final for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1015	Steve Ritchie	Parent	2/29/2016	Broadcast Communications for February 11; 2016 - for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1016	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/1/2016	Draft FAC Meeting Minutes		Kim Girdler; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Shane Hutchins; Simon Smith; David Orberson; Caroline Oyler; Toni Capito; Melinda Lutz; Liz Essen; Kimberly Keller; Shannon Baete; Sherry Russell	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 118 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1017	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/3/2016	Broadcast Communications for February 16; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Brad Lacy	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	bates kange (Redacted Documents)
1018	Edmond Heelan	Parent	3/3/2016	Re: Chipotle talking points	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler; Shane Hutchins; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
1019	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/4/2016	Broadcast Communications for February 16; 2016 + 2/17 eBlast & Ptr offer; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Mulddon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Brad Lacy	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1020	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/4/2016	Broadcast Communications for February 16; 2016 + eCRM calendar updates; FINAL for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Brad Lacy	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 119 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1021	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/4/2016	Broadcast Communications for February 18; 2016 - for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McCiellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1022	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/5/2016	*Confidential: February FAC Meeting Minutes - Time Sensitive	Toni Capito	Toni Capito; Steve Ritchie; Simon Smith; Edmond Heelan; Nadeem Bajwa; Robert Carroli; Keith Sullins; William Freitas; Vaughn Frey; Dougie Allen; Tina Glover; Philip Horn; Bill Green; Joseph Hogue; Rick Mohler; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Wade Oney; Eric Murphy; Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication/document, with attachments.	
1023	Steve Ritchie	Child	2/21/2016	~~1010610.docx	Lance Tucker		Attorney-Client Communication	Document reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 364843 - DURLING-PJI 364852
1024		Parent	3/7/2016	Broadcast Communications for February 23; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1025	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/7/2016	Foreign Object/Illness Complaints	David Orberson	Rita Palmer; Keeta Fox; Sean Muldoon; Steve Ritchie; Brenda Reynolds; Edmond Heelan; Mary Miller	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	
1026	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/7/2016	Re: Update for Charlotte; NC market	Kristie Scott	Kristie Scott; Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler; John Matter; Lance Tucker; Mike Smith; Peter Collins; Robert Smith; Steve Ritchie; Torri Harris	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 120 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1027	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/7/2016	Special Broadcast Communications for February 29, 2016 - ATTENTION NEEDED - for review / approval for today	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1028	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/8/2016	Special Broadcast Communications for February 29; 2016 - ATTENTION NEEDED - revised to state 'disruption' and offer image to be added; final for review / approval for today	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1029	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/10/2016	Re: Special Broadcast Communications for February 29; 2016 - ATTENTION NEEDED - final pdf with image attached; will send within 30 minutes	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Candyce Jackson; Christy Johnson; Robert Thompson; Edmond Heelan; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1030	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/10/2016	Broadcast Communications for March 1; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 121 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1031	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/15/2016	Broadcast Communications for March 3; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	otto nonge (needite ottomeno)
1032	Steve Ritchie	Parent	3/15/2016	Broadcast Communications for March 3; 2016 + Fri outage update & OPCON; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1033	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	3/18/2016	Re: Fw: PJPA re-finance update	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Joe Smith; Edmond Heelan; Lance Tucker; Simon Smith; Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern; Oz Bengur; Eric Danver	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
1034	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	3/22/2016	Re: PJPA re-finance update	Steve Ritchie	Joe Smith; Tim O'Hearn; Lance Tucker; Edmond Heelan; Oz Bengur; Simon Smith; Eric Danver	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
1035	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	3/24/2016	Re: PJPA re-finance update	Caroline Oyler	Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker; Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern; Joe Smith; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Oz Bengur; Eric Danver	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
1036	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	3/25/2016	Re: PJPA re-finance update	Steve Ritchie	Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern; Caroline Oyler Joe Smith; Ken Cox; Lance Tucker; Edmond Heelan; Oz Bengur; Simon Smith; Eric Danver	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
1037	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	3/29/2016	Re: PJPA re-finance update	Steve Ritchie	Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern; Caroline Oyler Joe Smith; Ken Cox; Lance Tucker; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Oz Bengur; Eric Danver	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
1038	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	3/29/2016	Re: PJPA re-finance update	Tim O'Hern	Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern; Caroline Oyler, Joe Smith; Ken Cox; Lance Tucker; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Oz Bengur; Eric Danver	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
1039	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	3/31/2016	Re: PJPA re-finance update	Caroline Oyler	Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern; Caroline Oyler, Joe Smith; Ken Cox; Lance Tucker; Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Oz Bengur; Eric Danver	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 122 of 141

5		D . / (0) Y-1		et at to the			2:1 2:		
Priv Log #	Custodian Steve Ritchie	Parent/Child Standalone	Date 4/1/2016	File Name/Subject Re: PJPA re-finance	Author/From Ken Cox	Recipients Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern; Caroline Oyler;	Privilege Basis	Description Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
	Steve Kitchie	Standalone	4/1/2016	update	Kell Cox	Joe Smith; Ken Cox; Lance Tucker;	Attorney-client communication	financial policies and procedures.	
1040				upuate		Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Oz		iniancial policies and procedures.	
						Bengur; Eric Danver			
	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	4/7/2016	Re: PJPA re-finance	Ken Cox		Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate	
				update		Joe Smith; Ken Cox; Lance Tucker;	.,	financial policies and procedures.	
1041						Edmond Heelan; Simon Smith; Oz			
						Bengur; Eric Danver			
	Steve Ritchie	Parent	4/12/2016	Broadcast	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to	
				Communications for		Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat		be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
				March 8; 2016 +		Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance			
				subsidized P4 DM; final		Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline			
				for review / approval		Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins;			
						Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean			
						Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton;			
1042						John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins;			
						Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern;			
						Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler;			
						Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin			
						Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni			
						Capito; Kim Girdler			
	Steve Ritchie	Parent	4/14/2016	Broadcast	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to	
	Steve miterile	i di ciic	1,11,2010	Communications for	June Moriey	Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat	rationicy chem communication	be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
				March 10: 2016 - for		Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance			
				review / approval		Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline			
						Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins;			
						Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean			
						Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton;			
1043						John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins;			
						Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern;			
						Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler;			
						Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin			
						Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni			
						Capito; Kim Girdler			
	Steve Ritchie	Parent	4/14/2016	Broadcast	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to	
	steve nittille	raidill	4/14/2016	Communications for	Julie Moriey	Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat	Attorney-chent communication	be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
		1		March 10; 2016 + legal		Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance		oc sent to timu parties, with attachments.	
		1		notice on background		Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline			
		I	l	checks & EWM; final for		Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins;			
		1		review / approval		Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean			
		1	1	/		Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton;			
1044		1				John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins;			
		1				Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern;			
		1				Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler;			
		1				Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin			
		1				Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni			
		1				Capito; Kim Girdler			
		1							

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 123 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1045	Steve Ritchie	Parent	4/15/2016	Broadcast Communications for March 15; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1046	Steve Ritchie	Parent	4/18/2016	Broadcast Communications for March 15; 2016 + P4 local underlay; for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1047	Steve Ritchie	Parent	4/19/2016	Broadcast Communications for March 17; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts, Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication; Privileged by Attachment	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 124 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1048		Parent	4/26/2016	Broadcast Communications for March 22; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication; Privileged by Attachment	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1049	Steve Ritchie	Parent	4/29/2016	Broadcast Communications for March 24; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1050	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/3/2016	Broadcast Communications for March 29; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Roger Cox	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 125 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1051	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/5/2016	Broadcast Communications for March 29; 2016 + FOCUS/POS tax settings notice; for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Roger Cox	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1052	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/5/2016	Broadcast Communications for March 31; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1053	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/10/2016	Broadcast Communications for April 7; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Julia McGuffey; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Joe Smith	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 126 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1054	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/12/2016	Broadcast Communications for April 12; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1055	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/16/2016	Broadcast Communications for April 14; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1056	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/16/2016	Broadcast Communications for April 14; 2016 + Papa Slam texts & P5 system offers & P5 local underlays; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Henr; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1057	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/17/2016	ERM presentation for Audit Cmt Meeting	Debbie Tate	Debbie Tate; Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 127 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1058	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/19/2016	Broadcast Communications for April 19; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Craig Jones	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1059	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/19/2016	Broadcast Communications for April 19; 2016 + Early Week Mania & P6 Post it; for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Craig Jones	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1060	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/23/2016	Broadcast Communications for April 26; 2016 + P5 food cost / calculator & P5 eCRM update; final for review/approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 128 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1061	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/24/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 3; 2016 - For review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Lyndsay Railey	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	outer honge (neotice documents)
1062	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/24/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 3; 2016 + Training update; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; John Matter; Lyndsay Railey	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1063	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/24/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 5; 2016 for review/approval	Lyndsay Railey	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Lyndsay Railey; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 129 of 141

D.:	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Desiriente	Policilare Paris	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
Priv Log #		Parent		Broadcast Communications for May 5; 2016 + New Menu Labeling Deadline for review/approval	Lyndsay Railey	Recipients Lyndsay Railey; Anne Fischer; Bernie Fussenegger; Bill Cox; Caroline Oyler; Christy Johnson; Connie Houston; Daniel Waddell; Don Graham; Dustin Couts; Edmond Heelan; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; John Matter; John Smitt); Julie Morley; Kevin Matthews; Kim Girdler; Lance Tucker; Melissa Richards-Person; Michele O'Herr; Michelle Heffernan; Pat Dunigan; Peter Collins; Rich Butler; Robert Smith; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon; Shane Hutchins; Steve Ritchie; Tim Newton; Toni Capito	Privilege Basis Attorney-Client Communication	Description Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	Bates Mange (Neuacteu Documents)
1065	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/31/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 10; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Moriey	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1066	Steve Ritchie	Parent	5/31/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 12; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan, Melissa Richards-Person, Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1067	Edmond Heelan	Parent	5/31/2016	FAC Meeting Minutes	Kim Girdler	Kim Girdler; Caroline Oyler; Edmond Heelan; Steve Ritchie; Robert Thompson; Shane Hutchins; Sean Muldoon; Simon Smith; Toni Capito; Melinda Lutz; Kimberly Keller; Liz Essen	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication/document, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 130 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1068	Edmond Heelan		6/2/2016	Re: FAC Meeting Minutes	Edmond Heelan	Edmond Heelan; Kim Girdler; Caroline Oyler; Kimberly Keller; Liz Essen; Melinda Lutz; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon; Shane Hutchins; Simon Smith; Steve Ritchie; Toni Capito	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters, with attachments.	butes range (recourses became ns)
1069	Steve Ritchie	Parent	6/7/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 17; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Cynthia McClellen; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1070	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	6/10/2016	RE: Broadcast Communications for May 17; 2016 - for review / approval	Tim Newton	Julie Morley; Tim Newton; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards- Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Paul Gilkey	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
1071	Steve Ritchie	Parent	6/14/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 19; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; John Matter; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 131 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1072	Steve Ritchie	Parent	6/16/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 19; 2016 + P6 LSM; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernar; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1073	Steve Ritchie	Parent	6/21/2016	Minor edits to the NMF comments	Steve Ritchie	Kim Girdler; Steve Ritchie	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication/document, with attachments.	
1074	Steve Ritchie	Parent	6/24/2016	FAC Meeting Minutes - Time Sensitive	Toni Capito	Toni Capito; Simon Smith; Nadeem Bajwa; Robert Carroll; Keith Sullins; William Freitas; Vaughn Frey; Dougie Allen; Tina Glover; Philip Horn; Bill Green; Joseph Hogue; Rick Mohler; Clark Mandigo; Lamont Muchmore; Wade Oney; Eric Murphy; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Kim Girdler; Caroline Oyler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding draft communication/document, with attachments.	
1075	Steve Ritchie	Parent	6/24/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 24; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 132 of 141

Duite Land	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File News (Cubins	A Ala / [Desiriente	Politika a Paris	Description	D-1 D-1 (D-11-1 D-1)
Priv Log #	Steve Ritchie	Parent	7/5/2016	File Name/Subject Broadcast Communications for May 24; 2016 + Medallia rollout; final for review / approval	Author/From Julie Morley	Recipients Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Privilege Basis Attorney-Client Communication	Description Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1077	Steve Ritchie	Parent	7/7/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 24; 2016 + P6 Ideal Food Cost chart and calculator; final for today	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1078	Steve Ritchie	Parent	7/7/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 26; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan, Melissa Richards-Person, Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1079	Steve Ritchie	Parent	7/7/2016	Foreign Object/Illness Complaints	David Orberson	Rita Palmer; Keeta Fox; Debbie Tate; Sean Muldoon; Steve Ritchie; Brenda Reynolds; Edmond Heelan; Mary Miller; John Matter	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 133 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1080	Steve Ritchie	Parent		Broadcast Communications for May 31; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morely; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fusseneggar; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1081	Steve Ritchie	Parent	7/12/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 31; 2016 + P8 promo details; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1082	Steve Ritchie	Parent	7/12/2016	Broadcast Communications for May 31; 2016 + updated Medallia rollout; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 134 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	2.7	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1083		Parent	7/15/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 2; 2016 + Medallia update; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Jason Wade	Privilege Basis Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	bates hange (neuacteu Documents)
1084	Steve Ritchie	Parent	8/2/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 7; 2016		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1085	Steve Ritchie	Parent	8/5/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 14; 2016 - for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussengeger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Joe Smith; Jason Wade	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 135 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1086	Steve Ritchie	Parent	8/16/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 16; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele OHern; Anne fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Linda Nuss	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1087	Steve Ritchie	Parent	8/18/2016	Broadcast Communications for June 21; 2016 - for review / approval		Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christie S. Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1088	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	8/18/2016	Re: Fw: PJPA off	Steve Ritchie	Tim O'Hearn; Caroline Oyler; Lance Tucker; Steve Ritchie; Joe Smith; Paul Schork; Ken Cox	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	
1089	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	8/18/2016	Re: PJPA off	Lance Tucker	Tim O'Hearn; Steve Ritchie; Caroline Oyler; Joe Smith; Paul Schork; Ken Cox	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 136 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1090		Parent	8/25/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 5; 2016 - for review / approval	Internal Communications	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan, Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christie S. Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butter; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1091	Steve Ritchie	Parent	8/26/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 7; 2016 - draft for review/approval jm	Internal Communications	Internal Communications; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christie S. Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1092	Steve Ritchie	Parent	8/30/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 7; 2016 + P7 addl opt-in; final for review/approval jm		Internal Communications; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christie S. Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 137 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Data Harra Barda	Description	D-1 D (D-111 D
1093	Steve Ritchie	Parent	8/30/2016	Fine variety subject Broadcast Communications for July 7; 2016 P7 addl opt-in REMOVED - final herewith will be sent soon	Internal Communications	Internal Communications; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christie S. Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Candyce Jackson	Privilege Basis Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1094	Steve Ritchie	Parent	9/6/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 12; 2016 - draft for review/approval jm	Internal Communications	Internal Communications; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christie S. Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1095	Steve Ritchie	Parent	9/6/2016	Broadcast Communications for July 12; 2016 + Summer Olympics guide; draft for review/approval jm	Internal Communications	Internal Communications; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christie S. Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler; Candyce Jackson	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 138 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1096	Robert Smith	Parent	9/16/2016	Broadcast Communications for August 2; 2016 + LET tool update & P8 eCRM; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christie S. Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1097	Caroline Oyler	Parent	9/23/2016	Broadcast Communications for August 4; 2016 - for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christie S. Johnson; Lance Tucker, Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication; Privileged by Attachment	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1098	Steve Ritchie	Parent	10/7/2016	FAC Meeting Minutes	Kim Girdler	Kim Girdler; Toni Capito; Steve Ritchie	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication/document, with attachments.	
1099	Robert Smith	Child	8/18/2016	IS Portfolio Governance_081816.pdf	Maria Lindle		Attorney-Client Communication	Document containing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts.	DURLING-PJI 365755 - DURLING-PJI 365791
1100	Steve Ritchie	Parent	9/21/2015	Dallas Valuation Model - Right of 1st Refusal	Steve Coke	Steve Ritchie; Lance Tucker; Tim O'Hearn	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts, with attachments.	DURLING-PJI 365795 - DURLING-PJI 365795
1101	Steve Ritchie	Parent	9/21/2015	RE: FAC minutes	Steve Ritchie	Caroline Oyler; Kim Girdler; Steve Ritchie; Robert Thompson; Edmond Heelan; Shane Hutchins; Sean Muldoon	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication/document, with attachments.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 139 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1102		Standalone	9/9/2015	RE: Broadcast Communications for August 30; 2016 + Road Trip deck; final for review / approval	Steve Ritchie		Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
1103	Caroline Oyler	Standalone		Fwd: Broadcast Communications for September 6; 2016 - for review / approval	Caroline Oyler	Daniel Waddell; Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christy Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smitt; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Heffernan; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties.	
1104	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	1/15/2014	RE: FAC Meeting Minutes - Response requested by eob Tuesday; 9/6/16	Caroline Oyler	Kim Gidler; Lamont Muchmore; Clark Mandigo; Steve Ritchie; Phil Horn; Toni Capito; Bill Green; Bob Means; Dougie Allen; Edmond Heelan; Jordan Dorsch; Joseph Hogue; Keith Sullins; Michael Hutmier; Nadeem Bajwa; Peter Xu; Preston House; Rick Mohler; Simon Smith; Tina Glover; Vaughn Frey; Wade Oney	Attorney-Client Communication	Email providing legal advice regarding draft communication/document.	

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 140 of 141

2		D (6) 11 1		=" » (c.l.; .	/-		2:1 2:	2	
Priv Log #	Custodian Edmond Heelan	Parent/Child Parent	Date	File Name/Subject Broadcast Communications for October 25; 2016 - for review / approval	Author/From Julie Morley	Recipients Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christie S. Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Privilege Basis Attorney-Client Communication	Description Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1106	Steve Ritchie	Parent		FW: Broadcast Communications for October 25; 2016 + P11 Marketing Enhancements; final for review / approval	Julie Morley	Julie Morley; Steve Ritchie; Edmond Heelan; Melissa Richards-Person; Pat Dunigan; Bill Cox; Christie S. Johnson; Lance Tucker; Robert Thompson; Caroline Oyler; Daniel Waddell; John Matter; Shane Hutchins; Robert Smith; Sean Muldoon; Connie Houston; Tim Newton; John Smith; Don Graham; Peter Collins; Michelle Hefferman; Michele O'Hern; Anne Fischer; Dustin Couts; Rich Butler; Eric Hartman; Jennifer Harris; Kevin Matthews; Bernie Fussenegger; Toni Capito; Kim Girdler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding a draft communication to be sent to third parties, with attachments.	
1107	Billy Higdon	Standalone	1/19/2016	ERM Top Risks 02_19_2016 Board Mtg Draft V1.pdf	Elon Blackwell		Attorney-Client Communication	Document providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts.	
1108	Caroline Oyler	Standalone	1/16/2017	FACSuggestedChangesFra nchiseAgreementDanWre vd.docx	Mark Dady		Attorney-Client Communication	Document providing legal advice regarding draft legal document.	
1109	Don Ceccarelli	Standalone	3/17/2013	gun complaint.pdf	Don Ceccarelli	Don Ceccarelli; Dave Cottrill; Daniel Waddell; Bo Czyz; Joseph Shahady; Michael Milec; Consumer Services	Attorney-Client Communication	Document seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 365837 - DURLING-PJI 365841
1110	Don Ceccarelli	Standalone	1/17/2013	Fw_ Preston Morrison _ Barry Wurgler _ JonCol (closure doc).pdf	Don Ceccarelli	Bob Richwine; Bo Czyz; Mike Coomes; Daniel Waddell; Caroline Oyler; Matt Van Note; Charles Burris; Barry Wurgler; Don Ceccarelli	Attorney-Client Communication	Document reflecting legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement.	
1111	Don Ceccarelli	Standalone	1/15/2013	Re_ Johncol Recruting.pdf	Don Ceccarelli		Attorney-Client Communication	Document seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
1112	Nelson Hertzog	Standalone	5/30/2016	Questions.docx	Nelson Hertzog		Attorney-Client Communication	Document providing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	DURLING-PJI 367384 - DURLING-PJI 367384

Case 7:16-cv-03592-CS-JCM Document 244-12 Filed 10/11/17 Page 141 of 141

Priv Log #	Custodian	Parent/Child	Date	File Name/Subject	Author/From	Recipients	Privilege Basis	Description	Bates Range (Redacted Documents)
1113	Nelson Hertzog	Standalone	3/28/2017	LA Meeting.docx	Bob Richwine		Attorney-Client Communication	Document providing legal advice regarding health; safety; or compliance efforts.	DURLING-PJI 367388 - DURLING-PJI 367406
1114	Nelson Hertzog	Standalone	2/16/2017	Fw: P&L request & visit	Steve Colbert	Steve Colbert Nelson Hertzog : Daniel Waddelll Scott Durigg; Ghazi Sodhun	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement.	
1115	Nelson Hertzog	Parent		Fw: 2959 Visit and communication	Steve Colbert	Daniel Waddell; Scott Durigg; Nelson Hertzog; bill@sycosys.com	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding brand standards enforcement, with attachments.	
1116	Stephen Colbert	Standalone	3/29/2017	Legal Intelligence for FBD 2017.ppt	John Matter		Attorney-Client Communication	Presentation providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
1117	Scott Durigg	Standalone	2/2/2016	Van Note Pizza and Service.xls	Scott Durigg		Attorney-Client Communication	Spreadsheet reflecting legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 367510 - DURLING-PJI 367510
1118	Scott Durigg	Standalone	9/8/2015	Joint Employment Update 2015.pdf	John Matter		Attorney-Client Communication	Document providing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
1119	Steve Ritchie	Standalone	9/20/2016	P9 Webcast.pdf	Darryl Carr		Attorney-Client Communication	Document containing legal advice regarding employment or labor issues.	DURLING-PJI 370503 - DURLING-PJI 370549
1120	Steve Ritchie	Standalone		Re: Workplace Harassment	Rich Butler	Brad Parker; Sara Lewis; Steve Ritchie; Tim O'Hern Rich Butler	Attorney-Client Communication	Email containing legal advice regarding human resource matters.	DURLING-PJI 370555 - DURLING-PJI 370557
1121	Steve Ritchie	Standalone		RE: Workplace Harassment	Steve Ritchie	Brad Parker; Sara Lewis; Tim O'Hern	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding human resource matters.	DURLING-PJI 370558 - DURLING-PJI 370559
1122	Steve Ritchie	Standalone		Jack D Wager-Smith Menasha WI Sex Offender SorArchives.com	Steve Ritchie	Tim O'Hern; Steve Ritchie	Attorney-Client Communication	Email reflecting legal advice regarding human resource matters.	
1123	Steve Ritchie	Child	2/16/2017	P3 LSM Plan . Calendar 2- 16-17.pdf	Candyce Jackson		Attorney-Client Communication	Document reflecting legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	DURLING-PJI 370919 - DURLING-PJI 370922
1124	Steve Ritchie	Standalone		Fw: Hamid Ahmad from Store 3481 Holbrook NY	Steve Ritchie	Steve Ritchie; Caroline Oyler; Hamid Ahmad; John Schnatter; Tony Thompson; Nadeem Mohammed; Herminio Gonzales; Joni Dalton; Bo Czyz; Edmond Heelan; Nadeem Bajwa	Attorney-Client Communication	Email seeking legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
1125	Simon Smith	Standalone	9/10/2014	John Matter - Legal Intelligence for OS 2017.pptx	John Matter		Attorney-Client Communication	Presentation containing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	
1126	Simon Smith	Standalone	4/9/2017	March 2017 FBD Planning Mtg Notes by Richwine.docx	Bob Richwine		Attorney-Client Communication	Document containing legal advice regarding franchise matters.	DURLING-PJI 372631 - DURLING-PJI 372649
1127	Beth Horlander	Child	3/11/2016	Mileage by Store - P2.xlsx	Scott Corbin		Attorney-Client Communication	Spreadsheet containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures with respect to wage liability.	DURLING-PJI 372655 - DURLING-PJI 372655
1128	Beth Horlander	Child	3/15/2016	Mileage by Store - P2.xlsx	Scott Corbin		Attorney-Client Communication	Spreadsheet containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures with respect to wage liability.	DURLING-PJI 372657 - DURLING-PJI 372657
1129	Edmond Heelan	Child	5/9/2016	CWEmbed1.xlsx	Steve Coke		Attorney-Client Communication	Spreadsheet containing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures with respect to wage liability.	DURLING-PJI 372664 - DURLING-PJI 372664
1130	Robert Smith	Standalone	2/16/2017	Attention General Managers and DOs (002).docx	John Matter		Attorney-Client Communication	Document providing legal advice regarding Papa John's corporate financial policies and procedures.	